

# Historical Perspectives: Santa Clara University Undergraduate Journal of History, Series II

---

Volume 14

Article 1

---

2009

## Historical Perspectives Vol. 14 2009

Follow this and additional works at: <http://scholarcommons.scu.edu/historical-perspectives>



Part of the [History Commons](#)

---

### Recommended Citation

(2009) "Historical Perspectives Vol. 14 2009," *Historical Perspectives: Santa Clara University Undergraduate Journal of History, Series II*: Vol. 14 , Article 1.

Available at: <http://scholarcommons.scu.edu/historical-perspectives/vol14/iss1/1>

This Full Issue is brought to you for free and open access by the Journals at Scholar Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Historical Perspectives: Santa Clara University Undergraduate Journal of History, Series II by an authorized editor of Scholar Commons. For more information, please contact [rscroggin@scu.edu](mailto:rscroggin@scu.edu).



Φ Α Θ

# Historical Perspectives



Santa Clara University  
Undergraduate Journal of History  
June 2009  
Series II, Volume XIV

### Cover Photo

Catherine de Médicis, Detail of *La Saint-Barthélemy*, ca. 1572-84, François Dubois (1529-1584) Oil on wood, 94 x 154 cm, Musée cantonal des Beaux-Arts de Lausanne

Photo: J.C. Ducret, Musée cantonal des Beaux-Arts de Lausanne

"The famous painting of the Saint Bartholomew's Day massacre in Paris on 24 August 1572 depicts scenes from the most notorious incident in the French wars of religion and one of the most striking examples of the extremes of religious intolerance in the age. The Huguenot (French Calvinist) painter, François Dubois is reputed to have been an eyewitness to the massacre of thousands of his fellow Huguenots on the streets of Paris."

Voices for Tolerance in an Age of Persecution,  
Folger Library Exhibition, Washington, DC, 2004.

# **Historical Perspectives**

## **Journal of History**

### **2009**

Published by  
Santa Clara University Lambda Upsilon Chapter  
of Phi Alpha Theta

### **Editorial Board**

Alexandra Bisio  
Ruth Caswell

Faculty Advisors  
Professor Naomi Andrews  
Professor Fabio Lopez-Lazaro

Volume XIV of *Historical Perspectives* is the seventeenth journal published by Santa Clara University's Lambda Upsilon chapter of Phi Alpha Theta. This edition continues the tradition of providing its readers with articles that reflect the caliber of student scholarship at Santa Clara.



# Table of Contents

## Introduction

### **My Son for my Daughter and my Daughter for my Son': Clothing, Gender, and Power in Heian Japan**

Ruth Avalon Caswell . . . . . 1

### **"The Seine Ran Red With Blood": Developments in Protestant Propaganda Before and After the Saint Bartholomew's Day Massacre**

Samantha Rauer . . . . . 18

### **If I Were a Rich Man: The Rothschilds and Anti-Semitism in 19<sup>th</sup> Century France**

Brian Kernan . . . . . 35

### **Economies of Excrement: Public Health and Urban Planning in Meiji Japan**

Anthony Walsh . . . . . 55

### **"Yes, Sir, I am Here!": Images of American Women in World War I Propaganda**

Alexandra Bisio . . . . . 77

### **"We Must Get into the Arena": The Feminism of Judge Sarah T. Hughes**

Emma Nagengast . . . . . 101

### **From the Supreme Court to the Basketball Court: The Achievements and Limitations of the Racial Integration of College Sports**

Caroline Linck . . . . . 121

### **Saffron, Spice and Everything Nice?: A Study of Women in *Hindutva***

Deepti Shenoy . . . . . 134





## Introduction

For eighteen years, the History Department at Santa Clara University has published *Historical Perspectives*, a journal of undergraduate work that showcases students' exemplary scholarship. *Historical Perspectives* is published with assistance from members of the Lambda Upsilon Chapter of Phi Alpha Theta.

The papers in this edition of *Historical Perspectives* cover a thousand years and three continents, and the diversity of topics presented in these papers reflects the global emphasis of the Santa Clara History Department. There is no theme uniting these papers, and they should not be read as if there was thematic unity. We have chosen to arrange the papers chronologically, and so start with Ruth Avalon Caswell's paper "My son for the Daughter and my Daughter for the Son": Clothing, Gender, and Power in the *Torikaebaya monogatari* which examines the role of clothing in defining gender and access to power in tenth and eleventh century Japan, using the story *The Changelings* as a lens into Japanese culture. Next we travel to sixteenth century France, for Samantha Rauer's paper "The Seine Ran Red With Blood': Developments in Protestant Propaganda Before and After the Saint Bartholomew's Day Massacre," an analysis of how the St Bartholomew's Day Massacre changed Huguenot propaganda from relatively sanitized to sensational. We remain in Europe for Brian Kernan's paper "If I Were a Rich Man': The Rothschilds and Anti-Semitism in 19<sup>th</sup> Century France" which looks how at the legend of the Rothschilds helped to propagate anti-Semitism in nineteenth century Europe. We then return to Japan for Anthony Walsh's award-winning paper "The

Economics of Excrement: Public Health and Urban Planning in Meiji Japan.” Anthony’s paper, which won both the Santa Clara University History Department McPhee Prize for the best presentation of original historical research, and took first place in the undergraduate division of the Northern California Phi Alpha Theta Regional Conference, disputes the claim that Japan wholesale copied Western nations during the Meiji Restoration by investigating urban planning, specifically water distribution and waste disposal. We then jump to the United States during the early twentieth century, for Alexandra Bisio’s paper “‘Yes, Sir, I Am Here!’: Images of American Women in World War I Propaganda,” which examines ways in which images of women in war propaganda exemplified women’s changing roles. Also in American history is Emma Nagengast’s paper “‘We Must Get into the Arena’: The Feminism of Judge Sarah T. Hughes,” an analytical biography of Judge Hughes, focusing not only on her feminism but her role in such landmark cases as *Roe v. Wade*. The final American history paper is Carolyn Linck’s paper, which won the Santa Clara University History Department’s Redwood Prize for best essay on a historical subject, “From the Supreme Court to the Basketball Court: The Achievements and Limitations of the Racial Integration of College Sports,” on the role collegiate sports played in integrating the American South during the 1960s and 1970s. Finally, we journey to modern India for Deepti Shenoy’s paper “Saffron and Spice and Everything Nice?: A Study of Women in *Hindutva*,” on the roles played by women in both the militant and political arms of the Hindu Nationalist movement.

There are a few people without whom this paper would not have been possible. First, all the professors who advised and assisted the students as they wrote their papers. These professors were both inspiring and

supportive, and we appreciate the effort they put into mentoring their students. Secondly, we would like to thank the professors directly involved in the publication of *Historical Perspectives*, Professor Naomi Andrews, Professor Amy Randall, and Professor Fabio Lopez-Lazaro. Also, special thanks are reserved for the History Department office manager Mrs. Judy Gillette, who oversees the technical aspects of publication. Congratulations are in order for all the students whose work is contained herein.

Ruth Avalon Caswell and Alexandra Bisio  
Student Editors  
Historical Perspectives 2009



“My Son for the Daughter ...”

1

“My Son for the Daughter and my Daughter for the Son”: Clothing, Gender, and Power in the *Torikaebavamonogatari*

Ruth Avalon Caswell

---

Within his heart, of course, Sadaijin was sad. “If only I could exchange them,” he mused, “my son for the daughter and my daughter for the son.”

*The Changelings* pg 16, Rosette Willig, trans.

Sadaijin is the father of two exceedingly beautiful and accomplished children, the hero and heroine of the late-Heian period (794-1184) court tale, *The Changelings*. And yet he is sad, as his daughter is active and scholarly and excels in archery and composing poetry, men’s arts, and his son is shy and retiring, preferring to play with dolls behind a woman’s screens. When the siblings are young, Sadaijin sits by, hoping that their unusual proclivities are simply a phase. Soon, though, it becomes clear that the siblings’ actions are not phases. The daughter has been accepted as a boy by her peers, and the son is known as a girl of great beauty. Urged on by the Emperor, who is unaware of the biological sex of the children, Sadaijin has the coming-of-age ceremonies for both children, with his daughter undergoing a man’s coming-of-age ceremony and the son a woman’s. The biological daughter is known as Chūnagon, the biological son as Naishi no Kami.

Thus opens *The Changelings*, translated from the Japanese by Rosette Willig. Because the story revolves

around the two siblings living as the gender opposite their biological sex, it must create convincingly gendered persona for each. Clothing plays an integral part in gendering these characters. From their childhood, the genders of the main characters are expressed through their clothing. When they enter the Imperial court, their genders determine which positions they fill, and therefore what responsibilities they have. Thus what clothing they wear determines how the siblings interact with power. This paper examines how clothing defined gender in Heian Japan, independent of biological sex, and how gender and biological sex regulate access to power, using the story of *The Changelings* as a lens into Heian court culture.

The Heian period lasted, roughly, from 794-1185CE. There are two known versions of *The Changelings*, or the *Torikaebaya monogatari*. The original, published between 1080 and 1105, is now lost to us. A later version, the *Ima torikaebaya*, was published sometime between 1100 and 1170, and appears to be mostly identical to the modern copies.<sup>1</sup> Nothing concrete is known about the author, or authors, of the *Torikaebaya monogatari*. There is debate over whether the author was a man or woman, a debate complicated by that fact the *Ima torikaebaya* was a rewritten version of the original. Some believe that it was written by a man copying the style of women writers of the period, and then perhaps rewritten by a woman.<sup>2</sup> Willig raises the possibility that the story is somewhat autobiographical, written by a woman who had lived as

---

<sup>1</sup> Rosette Willig, trans. *The Changelings* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1983) 4

<sup>2</sup> Willig, 5

“My Son for the Daughter ...”

3

a man, which could account for the mix of masculine and feminine styles in the writing. Though perhaps unusual, this idea does inject a serious note into what could otherwise be a rather humorous story.

Willig notes that even modern scholars feel compelled to downplay those elements of the work they feel are “decadent,”<sup>3</sup> an attitude which seems to have carried over from the moralistic Meiji era (1868-1912,) when the *Torikaebaya monogatari* emerged from centuries of obscurity. This is unfortunate, as I believe that this need to justify the story, to prove that it is worthy to be read despite its characters’ sexuality and/or violation of gender norms, obscures some of the most important historic themes of the *Torikaebaya monogatari*. It is a story about gender, specifically the disjoint between the genders and sexes of the two siblings. The historian cannot ignore the gender bending without missing key elements of the story.

The *Torikaebaya monogatari* is literature, a work of fiction, but it still has merit as an historical document, both on its own and for what reactions to the story can tell us about the attitudes of contemporary readers. The authors of the *Mumyō Zōshi*, a collection of Heian-era literary criticism, state that in the improved *Ima torikaebaya*, “one does not feel it to be an offensive and absurd plot that such a sex reversal occurs.”<sup>4</sup> The statement that the plot of the *Torikaebaya monogatari* was not an “absurd” one is extremely important. Though the *Torikaebaya monogatari* is meant to be an entertaining story, it is apparently not so far fetched as to be useless as a source of information about Heian

---

<sup>3</sup> Willig, 3

<sup>4</sup> Pflugfelder, 360

attitudes. By analyzing how sex and gender are handled in the *Torikaebaya monogatari*, particularly through the lens of clothing, the historian can gain a greater understanding of sex and gender in the Heian period, specifically how people thought about these issues.

Though there is much scholarship on women in Heian Japan, significantly less is specifically focused on the construction of gender, especially given the prominent place accorded to descriptions of clothing in sources such as *The Diary of Lady Murasaki*, or *The Confessions of Lady Nijō*. The two articles that examine most closely the ties between gender and flesh both use the *Torikaebaya monogatari* as their focal point. The brother and sister live as opposite genders, meaning that clothing plays an integral part in the story, because clothing is that which hides their bodies from the outside world. Takeda Sachiko shows how traditional Japanese clothing made crossdressing more feasible, and also examines Heian standards of beauty. Pflugfelder expands on how clothing defined gender. The unique situation of the characters in *Torikaebaya monogatari*, born one sex but living as the opposite gender, makes an analysis of how clothing defined gender particularly effective, because the story must consciously and convincingly show how the female sibling adopts the gender of a male, and vice versa. Stories like *The Tale of Genji* or the diaries of Heian noblewomen Lady Nijō and Lady Murasaki describe clothes, but not in the gender-conscious way that Pflugfelder and Takeda exploit for their analysis. Therefore, although there is considerable scholarship on different aspects of women and gender in Heian Japan, and the role of clothing appears in many



“My Son for the Daughter ...”

5

sources, there is little that specifically links clothing and definitions of gender.

Heian attitudes about beauty, both masculine and feminine, make differentiating gender on the basis of secondary sexual characteristics more difficult. Takeda Sachiko asserts that in Heian Japan, “proximity to feminine aesthetic ideals, to be ‘beautiful like a woman,’ was an integral condition for male beauty.”<sup>5</sup> If the sexes thus appear similar, men striving to be beautiful in the same way as women, many modern conceptions of what defines gender are inapplicable. As Takeda points out, “if the ideal male aesthetic was a ‘macho’ one as in Shakespeare’s *Twelfth Night*, a man would not be judged according to feminine categories of beauty... it takes a world ordered by a unisex aesthetic consciousness for such a serious success story to be realized.”<sup>6</sup> The idea of a “unisex aesthetic consciousness” is key to understanding the importance of clothing in Heian society. Judging the sexes by the same standard of beauty does away with many Western gender markers. Therefore, because the sexes look more physically similar, the clothes people wear become more important in determining, at a glance, which gender they are.

The downplaying of physical differences between the sexes was compounded in the Heian period by the styles of clothing, which tended to be multi-layered and loose, perfect for concealing the figure. Takeda notes the similarity of the clothing worn by Heian men and women, a “lack of division of clothing according to gender,” which is accurate in some aspects, but in

---

<sup>5</sup> Takeda, 191

<sup>6</sup> Takeda, 196

other ways misleading.<sup>7</sup> She is referring to the fact that both men and women wore *hakama*, loose pleated trousers, and that the undergarments for both sexes were basically the same.<sup>8</sup> However, the outfits worn by men and women were clearly different.

The male silhouette was basically a rectangle; defined by square shoulders the same width as ankles and very little definition at the waist. The female silhouette was more triangular, with sloping shoulders and long gowns that spread out and trailed on the floor. The waist was hardly defined at all.<sup>9</sup> “Voluminous” is the perfect word to describe the clothing of the Heian noble, male or female. It concealed everything but the hands and face, rendering differences like hips or breasts invisible. When the body vanished like this, it was the clothing that differentiated the sexes. Thus, though Takeda was right that some elements of Heian clothing were worn by both sexes, it is important to understand that men and women’s clothing were different enough to be immediately recognizable.

The role of clothing in defining the gender of Chūnagon and Naishi no Kami is not always initially obvious. When the siblings have their coming-of-age ceremonies, clothing is hardly mentioned, and yet it is a very important part of the ceremonies for both girls and boys. The omission of extensive reference to clothing is probably due to an assumption on the part of the author of *The Changelings* that the reader would already be intimately aware of the important roles of clothing in the coming-of-age ceremonies. Thus a

---

<sup>7</sup> Takeda, 205

<sup>8</sup> Takeda, 205-07

<sup>9</sup> The Costume Museum, “court lady” costumes.

“My Son for the Daughter ...”

7

deeper knowledge of the ceremonies is essential to fully understanding their significance. Sadaijin puts off the coming-of-age ceremonies for his children because he is worried about their unusual situation, and when the ceremonies are finally held, Chūnagon, Sadaijin's biological daughter, is presented to the world as a young man, just as Naishi no Kami, biologically male, is presented to the world as a young woman.<sup>10</sup> By holding the coming-of-age ceremonies for his children, Sadaijin is publicly gendering them, and this gendering is accomplished through clothing. The coming-of-age ceremonies mentioned in *The Change-lings* are the *mogi* and *genpuku*, gendered ceremonies that occurred around age twelve, though the age seems to have been fairly flexible, and besides marking the young people as adults, indicated that they were of marriageable age.<sup>11</sup>

The *mogi* and the *genpuku* ceremonies both mark puberty, and thus are different for the two sexes. The *mogi*, or the Putting On of the Train, was the ceremony for girls, in which an older female relative or respected member of court tied on the young woman's *mo*, or train. This would be the first time the young woman had worn a *mo*, as it was the final element of a woman's formal court clothing.<sup>12</sup> Heian noblewomen essentially lived behind screens, with only their close family members or serving women allowed behind the screens with them. The *mogi* ceremony was no exception, as the older woman who tied the *mo* onto the young woman would go behind the young woman's

---

<sup>10</sup> Willig, 21-22

<sup>11</sup> McCullough and McCullough, 373, 413

<sup>12</sup> McCullough and McCullough, 412-13, n. 56

screens to do so.<sup>13</sup>

The *genpuku* was the coming-of-age ceremony for young men, in which, similar to the *mogi*, a respected older man placed the *eboshi*, the tall hat worn by all men, on the young man's head. The young man, who had previously worn children's clothing and hairstyles, now had his hair cut, and put on the clothes of an adult man. The cutting of the hair and donning of the *eboshi* might be done in front of assembled guests, but when the young man changed into adult's clothes, he would go into another room to do so.<sup>14</sup>

In order for the siblings to go through the *mogi* and *genpuku* ceremonies, they must be assigned a gender, because the two ceremonies are different. Thus the coming-of-age ceremonies for Chūnagon and Naishi no Kami publicly cement their gender, regardless of their sex, and this gendering is accomplished through clothing. In both ceremonies, the transition to adulthood is marked by the young person donning, for the first time, an item of clothing. In addition, it is clothing, not biological sex, that marks the young people as man or woman. Chūnagon and Naishi no Kami are able to switch places and undergo the coming-of-age ceremony appropriate to the other sex because neither ceremony requires proof of biological sex. Unlike coming-of-age ceremonies that include body alteration, such as male or female circumcision, the Heian coming-of-age ceremonies take place with the young people fully clothed, and in the case of the young

---

<sup>13</sup> Felice Fischer, "Murasaki Shikibu: The Court Lady," *Heroic with Grace: Legendary Women of Japan*, ed. Chieko Irie Mulhern (Armonk, NY: M.E. Sharpe, Inc., 1991) 104

<sup>14</sup> McCullough and McCullough, 372-73, n. 13

“My Son for the Daughter ...”

9

women, further concealed behind her screens. The actual body of the young man or woman is never seen, save by those with whom they are already intimate: family members or servants. Society is only made aware of the young person's gender by their clothing, hence why it is so easy for Sadaijin to switch his children's coming-of-age ceremonies. Chūnagon and Naishi no Kami are gendered by the clothing they put on when they enter adulthood, not by their biological sex.

Clothing again genders Chūnagon and Naishi no Kami when the siblings switch places. Saishō, Chūnagon's closest friend, is in love with both Yon no Kimi, Chūnagon's wife, and Naishi no Kami. About a third of the way through *The Changelings*, Saishō is overcome with passion for Naishi no Kami and seeks out Chūnagon as a sort of substitute for the unattainable Naishi no Kami. As he embraces Chūnagon, Saishō realizes his friend is a woman.<sup>15</sup> The two subsequently become lovers, though Chūnagon is

---

<sup>15</sup> Willig, 82-4

The dynamics of this first encounter could occupy an entire paper. For more on the subject Takeda and Pflugfelder. Whether or not the first encounter is rape (Takeda claims that it is) is intriguing, but outside the scope of this paper. For more on rape or sexual coercion in the Heian period, see Hitomi Tonomura, “Coercive Sex in the Medieval Japanese Court: Lady Nijō's Memoir,” *Monumenta Nipponica* 61.3 (Autumn 2006) p. 283-338, as well as Margaret H. Childs, “The Value of Vulnerability: Sexual Coercion and the Nature of Love in Japanese Court Literature,” *Journal of Asian Studies* 58.4 (November 1999) p. 1062, and Anthony J. Bryant, “Forced Affection: Rape as he First Act of Romance in Heian Japan,” [http://www.sengokudaimyo.com/Forced\\_Affection.html](http://www.sengokudaimyo.com/Forced_Affection.html) (accessed December 2008)

initially reluctant, and Chūnagon eventually becomes pregnant.<sup>16</sup> After Chūnagon becomes pregnant by Saishō, she continues to live as a man for as long as possible, until the fourth month of her pregnancy when she secretly flees the court with Saishō, to a house owned by Saishō's father.<sup>17</sup> Since Chūnagon did not tell anyone, not even Naishi no Kami or their parents, about the reason behind this disappearance, people soon become very worried, and Sadaijin even sends out messengers to search for his missing child.<sup>18</sup> Finally, in the second month after Chūnagon's disappearance, Naishi no Kami decides that it is his duty to go and search for his missing sibling, for Chūnagon's own sake and for the sake of their father, who has become ill with worry.<sup>19</sup> Naishi no Kami then has a trusted servant cut his hair, and proceeds to change into men's clothing. Though Naishi no Kami has lived all his life as a woman "[i]n a man's headdress, hunting cloak and trousers, Naishi no Kami betrayed none of the awkwardness one might expect of a person wearing something new and unaccustomed."<sup>20</sup> Naishi no Kami is described as "very frail" and having "never stepped outside the innermost section of [his] room," and yet he is able to put on a man's clothes and immediately go into the outside world, with none the wiser.<sup>21</sup> Indeed, some ladies-in-waiting see Naishi no Kami, and what they see is "[a]n indescribably handsome and elegant man, a most refined man... He was

---

<sup>16</sup> Chūnagon realizes she is pregnant on page 95-6

<sup>17</sup> Willig, 109, 116-17

<sup>18</sup> Willig, 126

<sup>19</sup> Willig, 127-28

<sup>20</sup> Willig, 129

<sup>21</sup> Willig, 130

“My Son for the Daughter ...”

11

someone who had been in society, someone very splendid.”<sup>22</sup> There is no doubt in their minds that this person is a man, and not just any man: he is a cultured man, a man of refinement who has lived in the world. In other words, not a man who has been living in seclusion, as Naishi no Kami has until recently done. Naishi no Kami, who had lived all his life as a woman, who had never been out from behind a lady’s screens, is able to successfully assume a male persona just by changing his clothes. This persona is convincing enough to make those who see Naishi no Kami believe him “someone who had been in society.” Chūnagon, meanwhile, is now living as a woman, and though neither sibling realizes it at the time, her ladies-in-waiting are the ones who see and marvel at Naishi no Kami.<sup>23</sup> However, Chūnagon’s transformation is less striking in the context of this paper than that of Naishi no Kami, as it is effected in large part by the physical changes accompanying pregnancy, rather than a change of clothes. Chūnagon is forced to change her gender due to the biological reality of pregnancy. Naishi no Kami chooses to change his gender, and does so by changing his clothes, and so taking advantage of how his society defines gender.

When Chūnagon initially entered the Imperial Court as a man, she did very well, and attained high rank. The Emperor, impressed with this apparent young man, eventually appointed Chūnagon to the rank of Major Captain of the Right, that is, the head of one of the two divisions of Imperial bodyguards.<sup>24</sup> This

---

<sup>22</sup> Willig, 132

<sup>23</sup> Willig, 132

<sup>24</sup> Willig, 104

happens after Saishō has found out that Chūnagon is biologically female, and furthermore, after Chūnagon becomes pregnant by Saishō. However, neither Saishō nor the anonymous author expresses any worry about Chūnagon not being able to carry out the duties associated with the post of Major Captain of the Right. Nor does Sadaijin, the father, ever express any worry about his biological daughter being able to fulfill the duties that are bestowed on her in the belief that she is male. In short, no one who knows of the disparity between Chūnagon's sex and gender doubts her abilities based on her sex. It seems probable that this lack of concern stems, in part, from the early arrangement of the Heian Imperial Court, in which women held many positions.

“Ladies-in-Waiting in the Heian Period,” by Yoshikawa Shinji, examines not only the roles of the women in the court, but reasons for their eventual decline.<sup>25</sup> Before the eighth century, it appears that those who served in the Inner Palace, the living quarters of the Emperor, were all women, but by the tenth and eleventh centuries, there existed dual systems of ladies-in-waiting and male officials who served the Emperor.<sup>26</sup> By the eleventh century, then, when the *Torikaebaya* was written, there would still have been women serving in the Imperial court. The ladies-in-waiting were responsible not only for day-to-day tasks in the running of the Inner Palace, but for caring for the emperor himself. Therefore, the idea of a woman

---

<sup>25</sup> Yoshikawa Shinji, “Ladies-in-Waiting in the Heian Period,” *Gender and Japanese History*, Wakita Haruko, Anne Bouchy, and Ueno Chizuko, eds. (Osaka: Osaka University Press, 1999) vol. 2, 283-311

<sup>26</sup> Yoshikawa, 284-285



holding a position in the Imperial household would not have been foreign to a nobleman such as Saishō or Sadaijin. Both men and women occupied important positions in the Imperial court, and thus power was not limited to one biological sex. Power was gendered, not sexed. Had Chūnagon taken on a woman's role instead of switching genders, it would be likely that, as a noblewoman, she would have gone to court and become a lady-in-waiting. Since Chūnagon instead chose to wear men's clothing and gender herself as male, it is logical that she hold a man's post. The converse holds true for Naishi no Kami, the biological brother.

There is only one area in which Sadaijin worries about his children being able to fulfill their duties: he worries about them being able to carry out the sexual duties associated with their gender. Unlike political power, these biological duties are intrinsically sexed. Early in the story, Udaijin, Sadaijin's older brother, decides that his daughter, Yon no Kimi, should be Chūnagon's bride. When Udaijin first proposes this idea, the text says, “Sadaijin thought it ludicrous. But he despaired of getting across to Udaijin how unlikely it was that such a marriage could succeed, and so he consented.”<sup>27</sup> Sadaijin worries about the success of the marriage, because Chūnagon is unable, as a biological woman, to impregnate Yon no Kimi, “his” wife. The marriage cannot be consummated, and there will be no children, and so cannot succeed. Heian marriage was a vague and hard to define institution, but William McCullough, in his article “Japanese Marriage Institutions in the Heian Period” – probably the seminal work

---

<sup>27</sup> Willig, 26

in English on the varied and vague institutions of marriage in Heian Japan - identifies three “minimum and necessary conditions” for marriage in Heian Japan, the first of which is “the physical relationship between a man and a woman, continuing normally over an extended period of time and resulting in children.”<sup>28</sup> In her role as Yon no Kimi’s husband, Chūnagon is obviously unable to satisfy the second part of this requirement, because the two cannot have children together. This is the only aspect of Chūnagon’s abilities about which Sadaijin entertains doubts. The other two requirements for marriage are that society must recognize the relationship as acceptable and both parties must shoulder their responsibilities in the relationship.<sup>29</sup> Society certainly accepts the marriage of Yon no Kimi and Chūnagon, since it appears to be a marriage between an upstanding young nobleman and a beautiful young noblewoman. In addition, besides Chūnagon’s inability to father children, he seems to be a very kind and attentive husband. Thus, the only part of McCullough’s conditions for marriage that Chūnagon does not meet is the caveat about children.

Similar to Sadaijin’s worry about Chūnagon marrying, when the Emperor and Imperial Prince hear of Naishi no Kami’s beauty and ask that she be presented at court, Sadaijin, “put them off on the pretext that his daughter was hopelessly shy, and dismissed the notion from his mind. But he was terribly upset, hoping against hope that somehow she might actually serve

---

<sup>28</sup> McCullough, 104

<sup>29</sup> McCullough, 104

the Emperor and Prince.”<sup>30</sup> It seems clear that in this case “serve” means as a concubine. Yoshikawa discusses concubines as well as female officials. Concubines ranked higher than female officials, and most importantly, a concubine might become an official wife of the Emperor.<sup>31</sup> Sadaijin is torn between his wish that his apparent daughter achieve high rank and the biological impossibility of such an event. Thus Sadaijin's worries about his children's abilities to carry out their duties really center on their inability to have sex as others of their gender do. Sadaijin is not, however, worried about whether the siblings' biological sex will hinder their political duties. Because both sexes held positions of power in the Heian Imperial court, the idea that one sex was innately less able to wield power did not seem to have existed.

As a final point of importance, it must be noted that neither Chūnagon nor Naishi no Kami is penalized for switching gender identities. Naishi no Kami assumes Chūnagon's male identity and is eventually appointed both Minister of the Left and Regent to the young Emperor.<sup>32</sup> Chūnagon likewise assumes Naishi no Kami's female identity and becomes pregnant by the Emperor.<sup>33</sup> She gives birth to a boy, the first male child of the Emperor and thus the Crown Prince, and is elevated first to the rank of Imperial concubine and then to Empress.<sup>34</sup> Even though the siblings cross gender boundaries, they are not condemned by the narrative. Chūnagon's and Naishi no Kami's actions

---

<sup>30</sup> Willig, 23

<sup>31</sup> Yoshikawa, 284

<sup>32</sup> Willig, 239

<sup>33</sup> Willig, 206

<sup>34</sup> Willig, 227, 230

don't mark them out for punishment, nor are they portrayed as wrong. Instead, the siblings are both highly successful, and the text gives no impression that Chūnagon and Naishi no Kami are unable or ill-suited to carry out their responsibilities because they are acting as the opposite gender. Once again, the only instances in which their unusual circumstances cause problems involve sex and procreation, where it is their biological sex, not social gender, which causes problems.

At two key points in the narrative, clothing is used to create, or recreate, gendered identities for Chūnagon and Naishi no Kami. First, their coming-of-age ceremonies use items of clothing to publicly gender the siblings. Because the ceremonies used clothing-centric, instead of body-centric, rituals to confer adulthood, Chūnagon and Naishi no Kami are able to easily assume genders opposite their sex. After Chūnagon's pregnancy forces her to assume a feminine gender identity, Naishi no Kami creates a new gender identity for himself, in large part by putting on male clothing. Thus, in the *Torikaebaya monogatari* gender is constructed largely independently of biological sex. Instead, clothing is the primary marker of gender. Because both men and women held positions in the Heian Imperial court, and both sexes had economic responsibilities as well, neither sex was considered unfit to hold power. Therefore it is gender, not sex, which determines access to power in the Imperial court. Chūnagon's ability to carry out the duties and responsibilities associated with her various positions on court is never doubted on the basis of sex, not by the characters or by the narrator, despite the fact that the positions she holds are men's positions.

“My Son for the Daughter ...”

17

Because Chūnagon is gendered as a man, she holds a man's position in court, and it is how she dresses that creates her male gender identity. Thus when Naishi no Kami assumes a male gender identity, he does so by wearing male clothes, and afterwards occupies a male role in society. In the world of the *Torikaebaya monogatari*, it is how one dresses that determines how a person moves through society, what positions a person holds, and what political role a person fills. Though the *Torikaebaya monogatari* is a work of fiction, this cannot be the basis for completely discounting its historical importance. The authors of the *Mumyō zōshi* did not find the story of the *Torikaebaya monogatari* entirely ridiculous, which gives the story weight. Therefore, understanding gender and power in the *Torikaebaya monogatari* must be important to understanding gender and power in the Heian period in general.

*Ruth Avalon Caswell, a senior at Santa Clara University majoring in History with an Asian emphasis, is particularly interested in changing definitions of sexuality and gender. Her paper “Rationing Femininity: Gendered Undergarments in the Second World War” took second place at the 2008 Phi Alpha Theta Northern California Regional Conference.*

## “The Seine Ran Red With Blood”: Developments in Protestant Propaganda Before and After the Saint Bartholomew’s Day Massacre

Samantha Rauer

---

There exist certain landmark dates in history which appear on countless timelines and history books; the Saint Bartholomew’s Day Massacre is among these. In this essay, I seek to show how Protestant propaganda changed after the Massacre of Saint Bartholomew and to suggest what this shift implies about the Huguenot community as a whole. Although scholars have confirmed the importance of reactions to the massacre of Saint Bartholomew, less attention has been paid to how it altered the nature and function of Protestant propaganda. I would argue that Huguenot propaganda became sharply more aggressive after Saint Bartholomew’s Day. The anger sparked by its horrific violence was very much reflected in the propaganda campaign that followed. The violence of the Saint Bartholomew’s Day Massacre did not only provoke powerful reactions; it turned the Protestant printing industry into a vehicle for violence. In the process, the Huguenot voice transformed from a subtle and informative appeal for solidarity into a blatant and passionate call for action.

In order to understand the nature of French Protestant propaganda in the years prior to the Saint Bartholomew’s Day Massacre, it is crucial to recognize the climate of fear under which it operated. One event in particular led to the suppression of Huguenot

## “The Seine Ran Red With Blood”

19

printed works – The Affair of the Placards. On the morning of October 17, 1534, anti-Catholic posters suddenly appeared throughout Paris, Blois, Rouen, Tours and Orléans. Their content attacked the Catholic Eucharist with a headline that read “TRUE ARTICLES ON THE HORRIBLE, GROSS AND INSUFFERABLE ABUSES OF THE PAPAL MASS.”<sup>1</sup> After this event, the previously conciliatory King Francis I abandoned his attempts to protect Protestants in France. Protestant sympathizers were sent to the Châtelet prison, and leaders such as John Calvin fled to Geneva. Hostility between Catholics and Protestants increased greatly over the next three decades. Catholics believed Huguenots to be immoral, a danger to community, and therefore intolerable. Threatened by the other’s attacks, both groups took to aggression in self-defense.<sup>2</sup> Throughout this period, French Protestant propaganda was suppressed by the Catholic majority. As a result, Huguenot printed works did not focus so much on attacking Catholics as they did on nurturing the Protestant community.

The French situation contrasts with that of Germany where Protestant propaganda circulated freely and Evangelical cities prohibited Catholic publications. In the German-speaking world, propaganda found power in the masses. The German peasantry was attracted to the easily accessible and digestible pamphlets. In addition, Evangelical pamphlets were usually simple and cheap, allowing for fast production

---

<sup>1</sup> Mack P. Holt, *The French Wars of Religion, 1562-1629* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2005): 18.

<sup>2</sup> Barbara Diefendorf, *Beneath the Cross Catholics and Huguenots in Sixteenth-Century Paris* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1991): 50-64.

and distribution. Mark Edwards refers to this entire process as the “West’s first large-scale media campaign.”<sup>3</sup> In France, Huguenots did not enjoy the support of the masses; rather, they were a repressed minority. Protestant printing could not compete with Catholic propaganda which had the full support of the mainstream printing industry.<sup>4</sup> Repressive legislature took a no-toleration approach towards printing, selling or even owning heretical literature.<sup>5</sup> Since French Protestants risked imprisonment if caught, they depended upon a more secure and tightly knit system for sharing ideas and material.

Early Huguenot printing relied upon a clandestine network of printers and booksellers. The printing community was a reflection of the larger underground Protestant network present in Paris prior to Saint Bartholomew’s Day. The ties associated with the book trade gave Huguenots in Paris a means of communication and a level of emotional support. Before the massacre, most Parisian Protestants preferred to do business with one another, whether borrowing money or seeking legal advice. There existed an understood sense of mutual service. Parisian booksellers illegally imported forbidden literature from Protestant cities. For some, this risky business was a way of “living out

---

<sup>3</sup> Mark Edwards, *Printing, Propaganda, and Martin Luther* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1994): 21-39.

<sup>4</sup> Luc Racaut, *Hatred in Print: Catholic Propaganda and Protestant Identity During the French Wars of Religion* (Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2002): 21.

<sup>5</sup> Donald R. Kelley, ‘Martyrs, Myths, and the Massacre: The Background of St. Bartholomew’, *The American Historical Review* (December 1972): 1329.



## “The Seine Ran Red With Blood”

21

their faith.”<sup>6</sup> Most book-smugglers simultaneously operated another legitimate publishing business. The most frequently distributed material included copies of the New Testament, the Psalms, and Jean Crespin’s *Histoire des Martyrs*.<sup>7</sup>

The bible held special importance for Catholics and Protestants alike during the Reformation. Both groups agreed on the authority of scripture; they disagreed over interpretation. Catholics believed that the pope or ecumenical council had the right to interpret scripture, while Martin Luther campaigned for the self-evident truths of “Scripture alone.”<sup>8</sup> Presses in Geneva are said to have fueled the French Reformation by printing bibles.<sup>9</sup> In 1559, Genevan editors Nicolas Barbier and Thomas Courteau produced a miniature octavo bible measuring only 190 by 125 millimeters. These tiny bibles were structured to provide lessons; they contained tables as well as an index, annotations, chapter summaries, maps and illustrations. They instructed the growing Huguenot community on how to worship properly. Historian Francis Higman shows how they also might have served as a manual for aspiring Calvinist pastors in France.<sup>10</sup> Despite the availability of such bibles, it was often the illiterate who converted most readily. This explains the significance of the psalms, which were able to reach a much broader

---

<sup>6</sup> Diefendorf, *Beneath the Cross*, 134.

<sup>7</sup> Ibid., 132.

<sup>8</sup> Edwards, *Printing*, 109.

<sup>9</sup> Racaut, *Hatred*, 79.

<sup>10</sup> Francis Higman, “Without Great Effort and With Pleasure: Sixteenth-Century Genevan Bibles and Reading Practices”, *The Bible as Book: The Reformation*, ed. Orlaith O’Sullivan (New Castle, Del: Oak Knoll Press, 2000): 116-21.

audience than the literate public.

The Psalms were of great importance to Parisian Huguenots especially. Altogether, some thirty different Protestant presses produced about 35,000 Calvinist Psalters a year.<sup>11</sup> Since Calvinists were suspicious of woodcuts and images, versified Psalms provided an alternative method of communicating their beliefs to the illiterate.<sup>12</sup> Popular psalms included Clément Marot's *Cinquante psaumes* and Théodore Beza's *Octante-trois psaumes*. In 1558, Henri II made the public singing of psalms illegal. The prohibition of these pieces appears to have made them even more sacred to Protestants, who continued to sing them as an act of protest.<sup>13</sup> John Calvin encouraged the singing of psalms and provided eight versifications himself. These were published collectively in 1539 as *Aulcuns pseaulmes et cantiques mys en chant*.<sup>14</sup> Calvin also made reference to the Psalms in several of his writings. He used them to inspire and comfort fellow Protestants and address their suffering. In his letters to the Reformed Church in Paris written in 1557, Calvin referred to psalm 56 and 57. The first reads "Yea, in the shadow of thy wings will I make my refuge, until these calamities be overpast." The next assures believers "If God sometimes allows the blood of his faithful to be spilled, he nevertheless carefully collects their precious tears."<sup>15</sup> Calvin sympathized with the persecution of the Huguenots, and used the Psalms to

---

<sup>11</sup> Francis Higman, "Music", *The Reformation World*, ed. Andrew Pettegree (New York: Routledge, 2000): 500.

<sup>12</sup> Racaut, *Hatred*, 42.

<sup>13</sup> Diefendorf, *Beneath the Cross*, 137.

<sup>14</sup> Higman, "Music", 497.

<sup>15</sup> Diefendorf, *Beneath the Cross*, 138.

## “The Seine Ran Red With Blood”

23

assure them of their own salvation. Before the Saint Bartholomew's Day Massacre, this type of literature functioned to encourage faith; and a collective sense of faith was important for keeping the French Huguenot network alive. While the octavo bibles were instructional, the psalms were oftentimes inspirational.

Another type of early Protestant literature which played off the early suffering of the Huguenots was the martyrology. Jean Crespin's *Histoire des Martyrs* best exemplifies this genre. The first edition of *Histoire* was published in 1554 out of Geneva. In it, Crespin recalled the deaths of individuals who had suffered under the Valois monarchy. His discussion of individual martyrdom was crucial because it helped develop the image of the innocent Protestant victim. Huguenots continued to portray themselves as victims even when they engaged in armed rebellion.<sup>16</sup> The myth of the innocent martyr was a fundamental part of building French Protestant culture. Just like the psalms, stories of martyrdom would have inspired a collective sense of faith among this oppressed Huguenot community.

Protestant printing before the Saint Bartholomew's Day Massacre consisted also of images. Since Calvinist beliefs opposed the use of religious imagery, such prints were less common than the bibles, psalms, and martyrologies. The *Quarante Tableaux ou histories diverses qui sont memorables touchant les Geurres, Massacres et troubles advenus en France en ces dernieres annees* was a series of image prints published out of Geneva from 1569 to 1570 by Jean Perrissin and Jacques Tortorel. [fig. 1] One of the most

---

<sup>16</sup> Racaut, *Hatred*, 68.

striking things about these prints is that they depict violence against Catholics, as well as Protestants. The artistic representations of events are very accurate and seem more like historical documentation than propaganda.<sup>17</sup> Their subtle nature likely resulted from the environment of censorship in France. In the series preface, the artists assured that the images were accurate and reliable historical representations.<sup>18</sup> Like the octavo bibles, the prints sought to educate. Whether French Protestant works were restrained like the *Quarante Tableaux* or clandestine like other propaganda, the pieces still sought to be a source of information and hope. Since the Huguenots in France were a young and oppressed society of believers, they depended upon this material to sustain community. The Saint Bartholomew's Day Massacre would intensify the Huguenot voice and greatly increase public awareness of their presence.

The Saint Bartholomew's Day Massacre refers to the slaughter of Protestants who had gathered in Paris for the marriage of Marguerite de Valois and Henri de Bourbon, a Catholic princess and a Huguenot leader. What had been initially planned to be a ceremonial symbol of peace between Catholics and Protestants, ended in massacre that day. Legend implies that Catherine de'Médicis helped orchestrate this mass murder of Protestants. She had supposedly been threatened by her son King Charles IX's friendship with Gaspard de Coligny, the Grand Admiral of France

---

<sup>17</sup> Philip Benedict, Lawrence M. Bryant and Kristen B. Neuschel, 'Graphic History: What Readers Knew and Were Taught in the *Quarante Tableaux* of Perrissin and Tortorel' *French Historical Studies* (Spring 2005): 185.

<sup>18</sup> Ibid., 'Graphic History', 184.

## “The Seine Ran Red With Blood”

25

and leader of the Huguenot party.<sup>19</sup> Fearing Coligny would influence her son, she plotted his assassination. However, after the Admiral was shot but not killed, Catherine anticipated a Protestant backlash and therefore ordered a grand massacre to take place. The morning of August 24 1572, the slaughter began. Eyewitness accounts tell of the vicious murder of innocents,<sup>20</sup> and legend claims that the Seine “ran red with blood.”<sup>21</sup> The massacre lasted for three days in Paris. In the following weeks, news of the event traveled throughout the French provinces and a string of additional massacres ensued.<sup>22</sup>

The massacre immediately triggered dramatic reactions from both sides of this religious divide. Catholics claimed the massacre was a necessary measure. The Church and the French government attempted to defend the Catholic identity of France and issued official explanations for the event. One royalist defended the Catholics, saying “there is no gallows, cross, or torture severe enough to punish the crime of a traitor or rebel.”<sup>23</sup> Meanwhile, Protestants “screamed bloody murder.” Depending on the sources, death-counts varied from 50,000 to 300,000.<sup>24</sup> Huguenot survivors of the tragedy gave graphic accounts of

---

<sup>19</sup> Henri Noguères, *Massacre of Saint Bartholomew* (London: Allen and Unwin, 1962): 30-1.

<sup>20</sup> Kelley, ‘Martyrs’, 1338.

<sup>21</sup> Alex Karmel, *A Corner in the Marais*, (Jaffrey, NH: David R. Godine Publisher, 1998): 58.

<sup>22</sup> Raymond A. Mentzer, “The French Wars of Religion”, *The Reformation World*, ed. Andrew Pettegree (New York: Routledge, 2000): 331.

<sup>23</sup> Kelley, ‘Martyrs’, 1339.

<sup>24</sup> Ibid.

the mutilation of bodies. Their narrative of events consistently portrayed Catholics as sadistic murderers and Protestants as their innocent victims.<sup>25</sup> Accounts of the massacre carried a certain shock value which allowed for a more sensational form of propaganda than before<sup>26</sup>. Huguenot propagandists took advantage of the magnitude of the tragedy, seeking to immortalize it. Works such as Simon Goulart's historical narrative entitled *Mémoires* were meant to sear the event into Protestant memory. Goulart insisted on that point:

The memory of the massacres committed in several cities of France in the months of August and September of 1572, engraved in the hearts of an infinite number of men, made many wish that the treachery of the authors of these massacres not remain hidden in the shadows of forgetfulness and that the executioners of these abominable cruelties be punished as they deserved.<sup>27</sup>

The atrocities of the massacre caused both horror and a new determination within the Protestant community. Many Huguenots reacted with defiance and a willingness to fight to the death for their religion.<sup>28</sup>

The massacre both changed the attitude of French Protestants and altered the nature of their community. There was no longer a concentration of Huguenots in Paris after Saint Bartholomew's Day. The surviving

---

<sup>25</sup> Robert Kingdon, *Myths About the St. Bartholomew's Day Massacres, 1572-1576* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1988): 37-8.

<sup>26</sup> Diefendorf, *Beneath the Cross*, 102.

<sup>27</sup> Kingdon, *Myths*, 4.

<sup>28</sup> *Ibid.*, *Myths*, 49.

“The Seine Ran Red With Blood”

27

Protestants in France were often imprisoned and given the choice between death and conversion to Catholicism. Some converts ended up fleeing for refuge and then reverting back to Protestantism; others remained Catholics permanently, preferring to stay safely in France.<sup>29</sup> Some Huguenots stayed within France but moved to the Protestant refuges of Sancerre and La Rochelle. Finally, Huguenots also dispersed to completely new locations. In the months following the massacre, many fled to safer areas, carrying news of the massacre. A tidal wave of immigrants travelled to Geneva to join Calvin and his network; others went even farther afield, to England, Germany, or anywhere there was a Protestant community to join. The disintegration of the Parisian Huguenot community occurred around the same time that the printing wars also came to be less centralized in Paris. The growth of other provincial printing centers within France contributed to Paris's diminished reputation as a publishing capital, as did the emergence of French printing presses outside of the country. Control over Parisian printing no longer meant dominance over the distribution of printed material within France.<sup>30</sup> Thus, after Saint Bartholomew's Day, French Protestants no longer depended on the underground bookseller network which had fostered the subdued tone of previous propaganda. Moreover, the movement of Huguenots after the massacre also encouraged the internationalization of French Protestant printing.

---

<sup>29</sup> Ibid., *Myths*, 47-8.

<sup>30</sup> Andrew Pettegree “The Sixteenth-Century Religious Book Project”, *The Sixteenth-Century Religious Book*, ed. Philip Conner, Paul Nelles and Andrew Pettegree (Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2001): 14-15.

The massacre quickly caught the attention of the global Protestant population. At first, lack of efficient international communication caused the story to be vague. Word of mouth transmitted the general idea, but specifics remained blurry.<sup>31</sup> Within months, however, Huguenots relocated to new locations and contributed crucial details to the discussion of the massacre beyond Paris. This allowed Protestants outside of France and Geneva to contribute printed responses to the event. Strasbourg, the German Protestant center of printing, produced much propaganda regarding the massacre. In the wake of Saint Bartholomew's Day, Strasbourg had openly welcomed French refugees into its territory, including many educated men who provided information and material for "massacre pamphlets."<sup>32</sup> French refugees also fled to London, the Channel Islands and the southern coast of England.<sup>33</sup> Paradoxically, the international attention given to the Saint Bartholomew's Day Massacre created a greater sense of unity in the Protestant movement and strengthened the Huguenot voice both inside and outside France. The movement of Huguenots across Europe allowed Protestant material to be more widely shared. In the years following the massacre, Protestant works of propaganda were printed in much greater numbers than before,<sup>34</sup> translated frequently, and reached a larger number of international readers. The Saint Bartholomew's Day Massacre became the central focus of Protestant literature.

---

<sup>31</sup> Noguères, *The Massacre*, 147.

<sup>32</sup> Kingdon, *Myths*, 18.

<sup>33</sup> *Ibid.*, *Myths*, 20-1.

<sup>34</sup> Kelley, 'Martyrs', 1340.



## “The Seine Ran Red With Blood”

29

Often, descriptions of the massacre, which caught the attention of readers, were then used to communicate an underlying message.

Closer examination of the piece *Reveille-Matin* especially reveals the intent behind some of the propaganda concerning Saint Bartholomew's Day. The pamphlet's full title was *Le reveille-matin des François et de leurs voisins*, meaning “Call to awakening for Frenchmen and their neighbors”. As the title suggests, the piece was intended for an international audience. It referenced contemporary events in the Netherlands, Spain, Italy and the Swiss Cantons, clearly anticipating a broad audience. Historians believe several authors contributed to the text, which consisted of historical narrative, stories, poems, prayers, and political analysis. *Reveille-Matin* attacked the French royals, especially Catherine de Médicis, and encouraged Huguenots to move towards active rebellion. Most importantly, the pamphlet used the massacre to inspire sympathy. *Reveille-Matin* particularly stressed the tragic nature of the event and looked to other nations for protection. Massacre pamphlets not only called upon French Protestants to take action; they sought to attract international attention and support. The authors proposed that Protestant countries form a “general league” or grand alliance against the Catholics, something many hoped for but had yet to see.<sup>35</sup> Historians have suggested that *Reveille-Matin* and other similar pieces sought to keep the memory of the massacre alive, even to the point of exploiting it.<sup>36</sup> The defiant nature of this material reflected the shift in

---

<sup>35</sup> Kingdon, *Myths*, 76.

<sup>36</sup> Kingdon, *Myths*, 86.

Huguenot thought which occurred after Saint Bartholomew's Day<sup>37</sup>.

Within the Huguenot community in France, discussion of martyrs reflected a changing attitude among French Protestants. While previous martyr literature had stressed the victimized, passive nature of martyrs, the new rhetoric admired active rebellion. In *Right of Magistrates*, Beza wrote:

[W]e must honor martyrs not only those who have conquered without resistance, and by patience only, against tyrants who have persecuted the truth, but those also who, authorized by law and by competent authorities, devoted their strength to the defense of the true religion.<sup>38</sup>

Huguenots saw persecution as a trial from God; the Saint Bartholomew's Day martyrs were embraced as a source of pride and strength because they had suffered for their faith.<sup>39</sup> Victims were mythologized and used as examples. Most striking was General Coligny, whose assassination became a central feature of massacre pamphlets and books. In *Mémoires*, Simon Goulart depicted Coligny as fearless in the face of death. The martyr story of Coligny helped focus the attention of the relatively young Huguenot community, which had previously lacked its own myths or legends. The massacre also caused Protestants to memorialize groups of martyrs apart from the Saint Bartholomew's

---

<sup>37</sup> Donald R. Kelley, *The Beginning of Ideology: Consciousness and Society in the French Reformation* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1981): 301.

<sup>38</sup> Kelley, 'Martyrs', 1340.

<sup>39</sup> Diefendorf, *Beneath the Cross*, 143.

“The Seine Ran Red With Blood”

31

Day victims. Goulart's edition of *Histoire des Martyrs*, for example, specifically addressed entire martyr communities. This was a definite shift from the earlier *Histoire* published by Jean Crespin which had focused on individuals.<sup>40</sup> The persecuted cities of Sancerre and La Rochelle were cited as primary examples of martyr groups and were mentioned by several other authors. *The Histoire Méorable de la Ville de Sancerre*, written by Jean de Lérg in 1574, is noteworthy for its dramatic account of the siege of Sancerre.<sup>41</sup> This new focus on groups instead of individuals may have reflected the evolution of faith from private to public. Furthermore, this post-massacre martyr rhetoric suggests a new, more collective and open defense of French Protestantism. Instead of seeking to comfort the oppressed, these stories sought to rouse Protestants to joint action.

Not only did the massacre create a new determination within the Huguenot community, but also a more cynical outlook. This had a direct effect on the artistic and intellectual mood of the French Protestant population. Certain historians have gone as far as to relate the massacre with the emergence of the baroque artistic movement in France. French Protestant poet Agrippa d'Aubigné exemplifies the Huguenot artistic voice which surfaced after the massacre. His notably baroque works featured violent imagery and the theme of sacrifice— a sharp departure from the informative nature of earlier pieces. *Les tragiques* particularly embodies Agrippa's approach. Penned in 1589, this epic poem condemned the royal family in a prophetic manner, describing Catholic violence at length and in

---

<sup>40</sup> Kingdon, *Myths*, 51.

<sup>41</sup> Kingdon, *Myths*, 53.

detail.<sup>42</sup> Like d'Aubigné, Huguenot intellectuals also adopted an openly critical discourse concerning the monarchy and the concept of sovereignty. The French Protestant cause became much more philosophically defined after Saint Bartholomew's Day.<sup>43</sup> Whereas previous literature had consisted mainly of scripture and psalms, these new Huguenot pieces were less religiously focused.<sup>44</sup> While they still sought to spread ideas and foster the Protestant community, later authors were much more politically rebellious.

The politicization of French Protestant propaganda was one of the most important consequences of Saint Bartholomew's Day. Huguenots generally became much more forceful in their anti-monarchial views after that traumatic event. They were moved to rethink their political position, disgusted by a government which would permit such atrocities to occur<sup>45</sup>. As a result, multiple theories for resistance appeared. Several influential and eloquent Huguenot voices emerged to voice this opinion and suggest plans for change. *Reveille-Matin* has already been discussed as representative of the Protestant attack on nobility; other pieces expanded upon its themes. In *Francogallia*, François Hotman stressed the historical traditions supporting an elective monarchy and a national assembly, pointing out that France's current framework called for a revival of these traditions. Théodore Beza's *Right of Magistrates* similarly discussed the implicit contract between a king and his

---

<sup>42</sup> Nadine Kuperty-Tsu, 'Religious Turmoil and Aesthetics of the French Renaissance', *Poetics Today* (Spring 2007): 133.

<sup>43</sup> Kelley, *Ideology*, 308.

<sup>44</sup> Ibid., *Ideology*, 308-309.

<sup>45</sup> Mentzer, "Wars", 333.

## “The Seine Ran Red With Blood”

33

people. If the contract was violated, the ruler should be overthrown.<sup>46</sup> These pieces exemplify the Huguenots' collective cry for change. Catherine de Médicis became the target of French Protestant political propaganda. [fig. 2] The most comprehensive example was a biography entitled *Marvelous Discourse on the Life, Actions, and Misconduct of Catherine de Médicis, Queen Mother*. Although the author remains unknown, at least ten editions appeared between 1575 and 1576, in Latin, French, German and English. *The Life* portrayed Catherine as a “picture and example of tyranny in its public manifestations” and a ferocious animal who “holds us between her paws”.<sup>47</sup> Bold enough to condemn the Queen mother of France, the Huguenot voice had clearly evolved from its earlier form.

The printed response to the Saint Bartholomew's Day Massacre demonstrates the extent of power that one legendary event can have over a group of people and their discourse. The discreet, informational and internally focused nature of previous propaganda was replaced by open criticism of the French monarchy and a direct call to action. The international expansion of the French Protestant community enabled the Huguenot voice to reach a wider audience and express feelings of repulsion. Instead of speaking to the repressed community within Paris, propaganda sought to reach the global Protestant population. The Saint Bartholomew's Day Massacre evolved into a Protestant myth that could mobilize and advance the Huguenot community. As a result, the French Protestant voice was forever changed. Huguenots inside and outside of

---

<sup>46</sup> Ibid., “Wars”, 333.

<sup>47</sup> Kingdon, *Myths*, 203.

France channeled their energy into a newly cynical and forceful campaign of words and images. The sharp contrast between this campaign and printed works before the massacre shows how, after 1572, the Huguenot voice assumed a more defiant tone and called for political action.

*Samantha Rauer is a senior History major at Santa Clara University. Her area of study is European history.*

## If I Were a Rich Man: The Rothschilds and Anti-Semitism in 19<sup>th</sup> Century France

Brian Kernan

---

### **Introduction**

Napoleon Bonaparte surrendered his imperial ambitions on the fields of Waterloo on Sunday, 18 June 1815, ushering in a period for France increasingly characterized by trans-national capitalist institutions. In the wake of France's defeat at the hands of the Seventh Coalition, the Rothschild family forged the frontiers of this new age, permanently altering the role of finance, amassing one of Europe's greatest fortunes in the process. This financial success illuminated a new chapter in France's anti-Semitic tradition. While the French Revolution and the Napoleonic Code technically ensured equal rights to France's Jews, reactions to the Jews in general and the Rothschilds in particular in the context of economic change highlighted the persistence of French anti-Semitism.

Though suspicion and hatred of the Jews in Europe, with a legacy stretching back nearly two millennia, was nothing new, the rise of the Rothschilds, combined with rapid modernization, engendered a new anti-Semitism among French intellectuals that combined traditional anti-Semitic fears with the anxieties of class struggle, nationalism, and industrialization. Due to their unparalleled wealth and influence, the Rothschild family became a symbolic canvas upon which society's economic frustrations were splattered. In the views of the French socialists of the 1840s and

the French nationalists of the 1890s, the Rothschilds represented the dual evils of capitalism and transnationalism.

Providing a thoroughly researched foundation in Rothschild studies is Niall Fergusson's *The World's Banker*. In this impressive work, Fergusson provides a social and economic history of the Rothschild family, beginning with the family's 18<sup>th</sup> century Frankfurt origins and continuing until 1945. Fergusson cites a large number of earlier works, including *Rise of the House of Rothschild*, a seminal 1927 work written by Egon Caesar Corti that elaborates on the origins of the banking dynasty as well as the families' role in mid-19<sup>th</sup> century European politics and finance. Virginia Cowle's *The Rothschilds*, published in 1973, provides important biography on the family through letters, memoirs, and social history. Niall Fergusson's work, the most recent and expansive addition to this Rothschild discourse, also exhibits a wealth of primary sources that illustrate both the growth of the Rothschild fortune, financial strategies, and social reaction.

This topic also requires a history of France's intellectual movements. These social movements are separated into three categories: French Enlightenment (1789 Revolution), French Socialism (1840s), and French Nationalism (1890s). Roger Price's *A Concise History of France* provides a useful overview to this end. For the French Enlightenment, two works provide backbone. The first, Arthur Hertzberg's *The French Enlightenment and the Jews*, is cited by Fergusson and offers perspective on France's Jewish Question as well as the effects of the 1789 Revolution on the Jews of France. The second, Adam Sutcliffe's more recent



*Judaism and Enlightenment*, broadens the discourse both in term of time frame and region. Adding an economic context to this discourse is Paula Hyman's *The Jews of Modern France*, which follows the economic and social development of France's Jewish community.

The social discussion is enhanced here by K. Steven Vincent's *Pierre-Joseph Proudhon and the Rise of French Republican Socialism* and Jonathan Beecher's *Charles Fourier*. These works are useful in charting the evolution of French socialism. For primary sources, the essays of Proudhon (including his posthumously published "Carne") and Karl Marx (particularly "The Jewish Question") enhance the discussion of anti-Semitism within France's socialist movement. Also utilized are newspaper articles by Fredrieoh Engels for "The Northern Star" and anti-Semitic pamphlets of the 1830s and 1840s. These pamphlets include 1836's "The Hebrew Talisman," as well as the works of Georges Matthius-Dairnvaell and Alphonse de Toussenel. The translated works of Drumont are also analyzed. Adding context is Michel Winock's *Nationalism, Anti-Semitism and Fascism in France*. Though Winock is primarily interested in the rise of European Fascism and 20<sup>th</sup> century anti-Semitism, his work on the anti-Semites of the 1840s and 1890s is useful.

Perhaps the hardest piece is France's economic history, for which *The Cambridge Economic History of Europe, Volume VII* offers introduction. Michael Smith's recent *The Emergence of Modern Business Enterprise in France*, however, provides more useful economic history. More importantly, Smith demonstrates how the House of Rothschild shaped and was influenced by

this history. Elaborating the role of Rothschild finance specifically is Charles E. Freedman's *The Triumph of Corporate Capitalism*, which is useful for analyzing the late 19<sup>th</sup> century. Finally, the collection of essays *Enterprise and Entrepreneurs* expands on knowledge of 19<sup>th</sup> century business models. Adding social context to this economic history are the cartoons and essays of the 1840s and 1890s.

### **The French Enlightenment and the Jews**

Prior to their emancipation, Jews in France inhabited a society in which they were deemed outsiders, sporadically deprived of their rights of residency and exposed to the whims of local and national authorities. Subjected to high tax burdens, restraints on residency and employment, and poor economic conditions, the Jews formed largely self-governing communities, or *kahal*, that were tolerated to different degrees across the kingdom. Though systemically marginalized, Jews fulfilled a crucial role in France's economic system. Jews participated at the fringes of France's mercantilist colonial economy, performing niche duties reserved for them. The bulk of the economy, including production of France's most profitable commodities, was controlled by the French Christian guilds. The niche role of Jews, however, was still critical<sup>1</sup>

By the end of the 18<sup>th</sup> century, the Jewish population of France numbered approximately 40,000, a relatively small population compared to France's overall population of approximately 30,000,000. This Jewish population encompassed a number of far flung

---

<sup>1</sup> Arthur Hertzberg, *The French Enlightenment and the Jews* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1968) 79.

communities relatively isolated from each other and housed at the edges of France's borders (with a tiny unauthorized population settled in Paris).<sup>2</sup> In the Age of French Enlightenment that preceded the Revolution of 1789, the social status of these 40,000 Jews became hotly contested within France's intellectual circles as the status of French Jews became a significant lens through which the requirements of French citizenship were defined. In these discussions, anti-Semitism played a prominent role in the works of even the most forward thinking enlightenment thinkers. Voltaire in his "Sermon" wrote of the Jews:

Your enemies today add to your criminal account that you stole from the Egyptian... that you have been infamous usurers, that you too have burnt people at the stake, and that you have been found guilty of cannibalism... I admit that we too have been a barbarous, superstitious, ignorant, and stupid people, but would it be just to proceed to burn the pope and all the monsignori of Rome at the stake, because the first Romans kidnapped the Sabines and despoiled the Samnites?<sup>3</sup>

Though outwardly extending an olive branch to the Jewish community, Voltaire's statement held Jews responsible for horrendous abominations. Voltaire more explicitly revealed his feelings towards the Jews in a 1772 essay entitled "One Must Take Sides": "You have surpassed all nations in impertinent fables, in bad conduct and in barbarism. You deserve to be

---

<sup>2</sup> Hyman, 1.

<sup>3</sup> Hertzberg, 280.

punished, for this is your destiny.”<sup>4</sup>

For Enlightenment thinkers, transforming Jews into French citizens posed a social dilemma because Jews were intrinsically different from French Christians. At the heart of this was “the Jewish Question,” the struggle of Enlightenment thinkers to reconcile Jews with their egalitarian ideals. The intellectual leadership of the Enlightenment strongly believed that Jewish identity and French identity were incompatible, and therefore French citizenship first a rejection of Jewishness. While equality formed a cornerstone of the Enlightenment, equality for the Jew first required reform and regeneration. Between 1789 and 1791, the National Assembly’s most passionate supporters of Jewish emancipation reassured their fellow revolutionaries that Jews could be transformed into honest Frenchmen. Following this reasoning, Count Stanislas de Clermont-Tonnerre declared during a debate on 23 December 1789: “To the Jews as a nation, nothing; to the Jews as individuals, everything. They must renounce their judges; they must have none but ours... They must not form a political corps or an Order in the state, they must be citizens individually.”<sup>5</sup>

In June 1791, equal rights were extended to the Jews of Avignon, which included the wealthy Jewish communities of Bourdeaux. However, in Alsace-Lorraine, anxieties over the general indebtedness of Frenchmen to Jews in that province meant that civic equality was not granted until September 1791. The National Assemblies’ decision to grant full citizenship

---

<sup>4</sup> Arthur Hertzberg, “Voltaire and the Jews,” *New York Times* September 30, 1990.

<sup>5</sup> Hyman, 9.

to French Jews was coupled with the requirement that emancipated Jews swear a civic oath in which Jewish individuals renounced their Jewish identity and swore allegiance to the French State. Expectations that emancipated Jews would dissolve into the French majority, however, did not occur despite explicit attempts in Alsace-Lorraine. There, Jews continued to form a distinct community, even after a ban on beards and sidelocks was put in place.<sup>6</sup> Though legally emancipated, anti-Semitism continued in France under a new guise. As Arthur Hertzberg notes, the French Enlightenment “changed the bias towards the Jews from a religious base to a secular base.”<sup>7</sup>

The emancipation of Jews in France was coupled with the liberalization of the French economy. The French Revolution obliterated the traditional aristocratic value system that had previously regulated France’s privilege-based financial sector. Traditionally, France’s aristocratic elite, which classified business as a second-class activity, had restricted French enterprise through a regressive tax system that effectively punished entrepreneurial endeavors.<sup>8</sup> Between 1789 and 1791, this system of privilege was dismantled. This culminated in the Allard Law of 1791, which legally ended France’s guild system.<sup>9</sup> The eradication of this system, under which guilds had controlled the nation’s most lucrative industries, allowed Jews to

---

<sup>6</sup> Hertzberg, 33.

<sup>7</sup> Arnold Ages, “Book Review; French Enlightenment and the Jews,” *The Modern Language Journal* 53.5 (1969): 358.

<sup>8</sup> Michael Smith, *The Emergence of Modern Business Enterprise in France, 1800-1930* (Harvard University Press, 2006), 23.

<sup>9</sup> Smith, 24.

enter previously forbidden markets. These events served to jumpstart capitalist enterprise in France, even as revolutionary violence wreaked havoc on the nation's economy.

### **Financial Revolution in Post-Napoleonic France**

Napoleon Bonaparte's defeat on the fields of Waterloo in 1815 changed France's financial landscape. The Seventh Coalition restored the Bourbon King Louis XVIII to power, under whose supervision France enjoyed a period of relative peace that lasted from 1815 until 1848. The First Treaty of Paris, which restored a Bourbon Monarchy faced with no wartime reparations from the Sixth Coalition, France's former enemies, was replaced with a revised Treaty of Paris of the Seventh Coalition. This Treaty of Paris, signed in November 1815, leveled heavy reparations on France. Beginning in March 1816 and continuing over the next five years, 700 million francs were to be paid to members of the Seventh Coalition, mainly Great Britain. The primary purpose of these reparations was to pay for the 150,000 soldiers left to occupy France over that period.<sup>10</sup>

The period directly following Napoleon's defeat was characterized by an influx of successful Protestants and Jews, mainly from Germany and Switzerland, into France's financial sector. The Rothschilds, originally coming to France in 1811 in order to benefit from the economic distortions of the Napoleonic War, had helped pioneer the way. Initial resistance to these groups by France's conservative Catholic majority only served to unite them into more cohesive and effective

---

<sup>10</sup> Fergusson, 121

units, against which less organized Catholic bankers found it difficult to compete.<sup>11</sup> According to historian David Landes, “French entrepreneurship was set by family firms, owned and managed by blood relations, whose primary concerns were safety, continuity, and privacy.” This model, recognized under Napoleon’s *Code de Commerce* of 1807 as a single partnership company, characterized the operations of the Rothschilds as well as other Jewish and Protestant firms.<sup>12</sup> In the words of Bertrand Gille, these post-Napoleonic changes in French finances served “to pass [French finances] from a primitive structure to one that approached [modern] banking.”<sup>13</sup>

In 1815, James Rothschild’s Paris branch controlled just one-sixth of all Rothschild capital (approximately £36 million). By 1820, he was the richest merchant banker in Paris, and by 1821, his financial branch in Paris had become the most powerful within the Rothschild’s expanding financial empire.<sup>14</sup> In 1825, James’ share of the Rothschild’s assets was £1,490 million, or one-third of total Rothschild assets.<sup>15</sup> This asset expansion was coupled with an expansion of operations outside of France. Between 1815 and 1848, James Rothschild’s firm became increasingly international, beginning with the financing of American cotton

---

<sup>11</sup> Smith, 53.

<sup>12</sup> Edward Carter, Forster Robert and Moody Joseph Nestor, *Enterprise and entrepreneurs in nineteenth-and twentieth-century France*, (Baltimore :Johns Hopkins University Press, 1976): 42.

<sup>13</sup> Smith, 34

<sup>14</sup> Lottman, Herbert, *Return of the Rothschilds*, (New York: I B Tauris & Co Ltd, 1995): 15.

<sup>15</sup> Smith, 34

imports in the 1830s. By the 1840s, the branch imported a variety of goods for the French market, including tallow, lard, sugar, and Russian grain. The French Rothschilds also held importation rights to the copper of Russia's Demidoff family. Becoming increasingly involved with metals during the 1840s led the Rothschilds to become the exclusive sales agents of Europe's only mercury mines in Almaden, Spain and Idria, Dalmatia.<sup>16</sup>

According to Niall Fergusson, the operations of James Rothschild also extended, and benefited from, "a network of financial relationships with key public figures in Restoration Europe."<sup>17</sup> However, while a growing anti-Rothschild sentiment in France attributed Rothschild success after 1815 to a "web of corruption" reliant on bribery and exploitation, Fergusson concludes that it was the scale and sophistication of Rothschild operations that led James Rothschild to become a dominating figure in French finance. Fergusson notes that "James came to exercise a near monopoly over French government finance, issuing seven loans with a nominal capital of 1.5 billion francs (£60 million) between 1823 and 1847."<sup>18</sup>

### **Reaction to the House of Rothschild**

In 1830, Louis-Philippe was crowned as King of the French, popularly known as the July Monarch. In the first months of his reign, Louis-Philippe's favorable attitude towards the Jews inflamed a renewed anti-Semitism. Among the first decisions made by Louis-

---

<sup>16</sup> Smith, 56

<sup>17</sup> Fergusson, 172-173

<sup>18</sup> Fergusson, 173



Philippe's government was the approval by the Chamber of Peers on 1 February 1831 to place the Jewish religion on the state's religious budget.<sup>19</sup> Bernard Lazare wrote of the decision: "It was the definitive collapse of the Christian state."<sup>20</sup> Meanwhile, France's conservative Catholic factions of the period, led by Count Joseph Arthur de Gobineau, blamed the Jews for transforming Paris into a "Babylon of vice and decadence, criminality and incredulity, immigration, and cosmopolitanism."<sup>21</sup>

The perception of Louis-Philippe's pro-Jewish sentiments, coupled with the extravagant wealth of the Rothschilds and other Jewish families, caused outrage among the general populace. Fanning these flames was the unstable situation caused by rioting workers in Paris and other cities. Demanding higher wages, shorter working days, and a ban on dangerous machinery, many of these workers resented France's economic transformation. In November 1831, the temporary seizure of Lyons by armed workers was met with stiff repression of workers' organizations.<sup>22</sup> Government repression under Louis-Philippe cemented notions of class struggle amongst workers and worked to popularize the anti-capitalist and often anti-Semitic writings of French socialists in the 1840s.

Writing in the fall of 1843, Karl Marx addressed the

---

<sup>19</sup> Michel Winock, *Nationalism, Anti-Semitism, and Fascism in France*, (Stanford University Press, 2001): 135.

<sup>20</sup> Winock, 135.

<sup>21</sup> Jonathon Judaken, *Jean-Paul Satre and the Jewish Question: Anti-Semitism and the Politics of the French Intellectual*, (University of Nebraska, 2009): 10-11.

<sup>22</sup> Roger Price, *A Concise History of France*, (Cambridge University Press, 2005): 195.

Jewish Question which earlier enlightenment thinkers had grappled with. For Marx, the Jewish question did not concern allegiance to the nation-state but rather, the moral legitimacy of the Jew. Marx wrote:

The decomposition of man into Jew and citizen, Protestant and citizen, religious man and citizen, is neither a deception leveled at citizenship, nor is it circumvention of political emancipation; it is political emancipation itself, the political method of emancipating oneself from religion.<sup>23</sup>

Calling for the emancipation from religion, Marx focused special attention on the Jewish community, asking;

What is the worldly religion of the Jew? Huckstering. What is his worldly God? Money. Very well then! Emancipation from huckstering and money, consequently from practical, real Judaism, would be the self-emancipation of our time.<sup>24</sup>

In this economic framework, it was modern devotion to wealth and not religion that formed the crux of social transformation. And if money was the religion of the Jew, then Rothschild was the Goliath standing between the oppressed worker and economic emancipation, at whose feet the rulers of Europe stood subservient.

As France's socialist discussion continued through the 1840s, the Rothschilds came to personify the

---

<sup>23</sup> Karl Marx, *On the Jewish Question* (Deutsch-Französische Jahrbucher, 1844): 9.

<sup>24</sup> Marx, 19.

excesses of capitalism, making them natural targets. As a focal point of socialist frustrations, the French Rothschilds served as an enduring symbol of greed and exploitation. Friedrich Engels, Marx's co-author, in an 1846 article entitled "Government and Opposition in France," wrote of perceived Rothschild domination of French government:

The money lords rejoice in their strength, and guessing it will not last very long, they make the best of the present moment ... The majority of the middle class, voters of Paris, belong to the party of Thiers and O. Barrot; they want to do away with the exclusive rule of Rothschild and Co., to recover an honorable and independent position for France in her external relations ...<sup>25</sup>

In this article, Engels addressed an anti-Rothschild sentiment that was growing among workers and intellectuals alike. Tying in explicit contempt towards the Rothschilds, he continued, "The hatred against Rothschild and the money lords is enormous, and a German paper says, Rothschild might take this as a warning that he had better take up his headquarters somewhere else than upon the ever-burning volcano of Paris."

The writings of Pierre-Joseph Proudhon offered a more conservative and French alternative to Marx's radical overthrow of social norms. Unlike Marx, Proudhon was a religious man and believed that God was essential, but that the myths of religion were what

---

<sup>25</sup> Friedrich Engels, *Marx/Engles Collected Works Volume 6*, "Government and Opposition in France," (The Northern Star No. 460): 61.

hindered social progress. Another critic of capitalism, Proudhon argued that the 1789 Revolution had not yet completed the task of ensuring equality. Capitalism, he believed, had accomplished only half its work. Proudhon addressed what he saw as symptoms of modernity: urbanization, secularization, and industrialization in French society. Like Marx and Engels, Proudhon was critical of the Jews. In Proudhon's economic framework the Jew was frequently referred to as the anti-producer and contrasted with the economically enslaved French worker.<sup>26</sup> Though not as explicitly anti-Semitic as other socialists of his time, Proudhon's posthumously published "Carnets" reveal an insidious hatred of the Jews and the Rothschilds. In them, he declared:

The Jew is the enemy of the human race. This race must be sent back to Asia, or exterminated. H. Heine, A. Weil, and others are simply secret spies. Rothschild, Crémieux, Marx, Fould, evil choleric, envious, bitter men ... who hate us.<sup>27</sup>

In the 1845 pamphlet "Juifs roi de l'époque," Alphonse de Toussenel elaborated on the perceived distinctions between Jew and Frenchmen while calling for a call to arms against the Jews: "Power to the strong! Death to parasitism! War on the Jews! That is the motto of the new revolution!"<sup>28</sup> "Juifs roi de l'époque" would become a seminal work for future anti-Semites like Edouard Drumont.

---

<sup>26</sup> Winock, 92.

<sup>27</sup> (Carnets, vol. 2, p. 337: No VI, 178) "Proudhon's diaries (Carnets, ed. P. Haubtmann, Marcel Rivière, Paris 1960 to date)

<sup>28</sup> Winock, 92.

The frenzy of Rothschild hatred that erupted in the 1840s led to James Rothschild being blamed when a train on France's Rothschild-owned Northern Line crashed on 8 July 1846 near the farming village of Fampoux, killing 57 people and wounding over 100. Many saw the event as yet another example of Jewish greed placing profit above the interest of the French people.<sup>29</sup> Following the event, French socialist Georges Matthius-Dairnvaell wrote a pamphlet entitled "Histoire edifiante et curieuse de Rothschild, roi des juifs" that attacked the Rothschilds for subjecting honest Frenchmen to economic feudalism. Over 60,000 copies of the anti-Semitic pamphlet were sold in 1846 alone.<sup>30</sup> Matthius-Dairnvaell, in a series of anti-Rothschild pamphlets that followed, emphasized James Rothschild's German origins in order to highlight his distinct separateness from French society. While the revolution of 1848 resounded across France, Emile Barrault wrote in a "Letter to M. Rothschild":

Shareholders, shopkeepers, manufacturers, pensioners tumble down in a mass of people, grand on petty, crushing the crushed. Alone, in the midst of so much ruin you [M. Rothschild] don't waver. Reached by the first shock in Paris, your house stands firm in Naples, Vienna, Berlin, while buffeted by a revolution advancing, meeting you in Europe. You remain upright. In short, all opulence collapses, all glory is

---

<sup>29</sup> *La reforme*, 14 July 1846. On train accidents in nineteenth-century France, see Francois Caron. "Le role des accidents de voyageurs dans la gestion des chemins de fer en France," *Entreprise et Histoire* 17 (1997), 85-93.

<sup>30</sup> *Cerfberr de Medelsheim, Les Juifs, leur histoire, leurs moeurs* (Paris, 1847): preface.

humbled, all domination is cast down; the Jew, *king of the epoch* retains his throne.<sup>31</sup>

As the 1840s came to an end, the revolutionary spirit that culminated in 1848 became less vocal, and as it did so the Rothschilds received less focus. However, the accusations that the Rothschilds were the new economic kings of Europe prevailed, to resurface during periods of social distress or unrest.

### **French Nationalism and Anti-Semitism on the Eve of the Dreyfus Affair**

While the 1840s witnessed the development of French socialism's economic anti-Semitic framework, the hate-spewing of these socialists did not necessarily represent the views of France's political leaders. Furthermore, the socialist economic framework attacked the Rothschilds for their wealth as much as their Judaism. In the late 19<sup>th</sup> century, France would experience a wave of anti-Semitism that was far more politically explicit. Following the dissolution of the Bourbon Monarchy and re-establishment of the Napoleonic Empire under Napoleon III in 1852, French society became increasingly nationalistic. Perhaps no event better intensified French nationalism than the loss of Alsace-Lorraine to Germany following the Franco-Prussian War (1870-1871). In this period of nationalistic frustration, France received an influx of Jewish immigrants from Eastern Europe starting in the 1880s. These Jews were the target of a re-energized discussion of France's Jewish Question, a

---

<sup>31</sup> Emile Barrault, *Letter to M. Rothschild* (Lettres Contemporaines, Paris, 1848).

discussion that transformed anti-Semitism in France into a political doctrine.<sup>32</sup>

The Rothschild family was attacked with renewed vigor leading up to the 1890s. The families' critics during this time period applied new accusations on the foundations of traditional anti-Rothschildism. Leading the way in keeping anti-Semitism alive in France was August Chirac, whose 1883 book *Kings of the Republic* highlighted myths regarding Napoleon's defeat at Waterloo. Again, the Rothschilds were blamed for undermining the Bonaparte Empire, but Chirac added the German heritage of the Rothschilds to the equation. Not only had France been undermined by transnational finance, Chirac argued, but worst, it had been a family of German Jews that was responsible.<sup>33</sup> In an age of fierce French nationalism, the combination of German and Jew juxtaposed the traditional enemy of Christianity with the modern political threat of Germany.<sup>34</sup>

Édouard Adolphe Drumont, an admirer of Toussanel, became the de-facto leader of France's anti-Semitic movement in the 1890s. As founder of the Antisemitic League of France in 1889, Drumont possessed a variety of methods to spread his anti-Semitic beliefs throughout France. He argued that France had fallen under Jewish oppression as a result of Jewish emancipation. Emancipation allowed the Jews, previously confined to their ghettos, to take over the nation's financial institutions.<sup>35</sup> With the 1886

---

<sup>32</sup> Hyman, 120.

<sup>33</sup> Fergusson, 785

<sup>34</sup> Fergusson, 786

<sup>35</sup> Winock, 91

publication of Drumont's bestseller "La France juive," the Jewish Question was re-introduced into society's mainstream discourse. In it, Drumont combined traditional anti-Semitism with new conspiratorial theories.<sup>36</sup> In 1889, Drumont wrote "La fin d'un monde" to highlight Jewish control over France's media and legal system. In this work, Drumont wrote: "They [Jews] have strengthened the points, by which they might have been taken, have silently modified laws that troubled them, or have obtained warrants that paralyze the implementation of those laws. They have made the press the servant of capital, so that it is unable to speak."<sup>37</sup>

Controlling Jewish movement and participation in French society became a centerpiece of Rightist anti-Semitic doctrine. Leon Daudet, a prominent Monarchist and friend of Drumont, further elaborated on the need to control French Jews:

Kept under close surveillance by a power as clear-sighted as the monarchy, the Jews could be tolerable and almost acceptable ... To persecute Israel would be unwise and odious. But to lay down guidelines limiting Jewish activity, particularly in the political sphere, would be a good thing, and a benefit that the Jews themselves would quickly appreciate.<sup>38</sup>

This new level of control included the Rothschilds in France. Beginning in 1892, Drumont found a new

---

<sup>36</sup> Cowles, 185

<sup>37</sup> Winock, 87

<sup>38</sup> Quoted in Stephen Wilson, *Ideology and Experience: Anti-Semitism in France at the Time of the Dreyfus Affair*, (East Brunswick, New Jersey, 1982): 672-673.



platform to spread his ideas as editor of “La Libre Parole.” As editor, Drumont leveled attacks on Alphonse Rothschild and began a campaign to expel Jews from the French army.<sup>39</sup> In 1894, just two years later, Captain Alfred Dreyfus, a Jew, was arrested and convicted for selling French military intelligence to Germany. This event, arguably more than any other, served as a flashpoint of 19<sup>th</sup> century anti-Semitism in Europe.

### **Conclusions**

The Rothschilds represented many things to many groups in 19<sup>th</sup> century France. To their fellow Jews, they symbolized economic emancipation from the Jewish Ghetto, with Amschel Rothschild capably pulling himself up from humble beginnings and founding one of the century’s most enduring legacies. To others, the Rothschild model pioneered the rise of international financing, effectively reforming a system that had once been reserved for the privileged few. However, to many Frenchmen, the success of the Rothschilds represented the grim menace of the wandering Jew usurping French society while profiting from the misery of the disenfranchised. Although the revolutionaries of 1789 attempted to address the Jewish Question, the inability of Frenchmen to see past Jewish difference kept this issue alive and well. Prior to Emancipation, the Jew was despised in a Christian context, with even the most influential thinkers of the Enlightenment viewing the Jew through a lens of accusation. Jewish Emancipation ironically added new accusations to the long list of crimes the

---

<sup>39</sup> Cowles, 185

Jews were deemed responsible for.

For the socialists of the 1840s, the Rothschild family represented a bourgeois elite sucking the lifeblood out of France's workers while subjecting the people of France to an economic transformation that was destroying nearly every aspect of French society. As transnational Jews, the Rothschilds represented nothing less than a foreign invasion of France's political economy, with the Jewish Kings usurping Europe's rulers and corrupting the very Enlightenment Ideals that had granted them Emancipation to begin with. The nationalists of the 1890s added the German charge against the Rothschilds, juxtaposing the traditional enemy of Christian Europe with the modern political enemy of France. Taken altogether, 19<sup>th</sup> century attacks on the Rothschilds came to mirror those less tangible forces the attackers most feared. Alone, the Rothschilds in Europe came to symbolize opulence, so much so that the in 1902, Ukrainian author Sholem Aleichem wrote a monologue entitled *Ven ikh bin Rothschild* (If I were Rothschild, a title that inspired Fiddler on the Roof's "If I were a Rich Man."<sup>40</sup>

*Brian Kernan is a senior history and economics double major. He is particularly interested in economic history of China and Western Europe.*

---

<sup>40</sup> Sholom Alechem, *Tevye's Daughters* (Sholom Aleichem Family, 1999): 16–19.

## Economies of Excrement: Public Health and Urban Planning in Meiji Japan

Anthony Walsh

---

The most common scholarly discussions about modernity and its social effects encompass issues of economic and industrial change, the development and employment of new technology, and a general restructuring of existing social orders. One area that seems to be overlooked as a key marker of modernization, especially in the history of Japan, is the junction between the development of public health practices and urban planning.

This study will explore the history of public health and urban planning in Meiji Japan, 1868-1912. Sanitation, a key element of public health systems, was not ignored before the Meiji Restoration. During the two hundred fifty years of Tokugawa (1603-1868) peace and stability that preceded the Meiji Restoration, human excrement and urine was collected as part of a highly organized and regulated economy of fertilizer production. This system of nightsoil collection, nightsoil being a euphemism for excrement, was so efficient, profitable and sanitary that it defied replacement by modern sewage and water supply systems even in newly expanded urban areas of Japan well beyond the Meiji Restoration. Japanese attitudes toward excrement were radically different than in the West.<sup>1</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> Edward S. Morse, "Latrines of the East" *The American Architect and Building News* (1876-1908): March 18, 1893; 39; 899. pg. 172.

Western-style sewage systems and chemical fertilizers were not implemented in large scale projects until the latter half of the twentieth-century. Nevertheless, the adoption of public health discourse, influenced by German notions of *Gesundheitspflege*, was easily integrated into the Meiji government's bureaucratic system.<sup>2</sup> Why were some Western practices adopted by Meiji officials and others left out?

The Meiji period was characterized by increased interaction with Western countries. New ideas, technologies, and discourses that had not been articulated earlier in Japan poured into the country. Many technologies and ideas were embraced, while others experienced resistance.<sup>3</sup> Many Japanese sought to embrace completely all that Western nations represented, from technology and clothing style, to the management structure of private and public offices. This perceived "wholehearted adoption" of all things Western, and thus "modern," has led some historians to patronizingly characterize the Japanese as "clever little copiers."<sup>4</sup> Many other Japanese, however, sought to modernize only in order to compete with Western nations and emerge from the humiliation of the unequal treaties, imposed on Japan in the 1850s by Western nations. For these Japanese thinkers and

---

<sup>2</sup> Susan L. Burns "Constructing the National Body: Public Health and Nation in Nineteenth Century Japan," in Timothy Brook and Andre Schmidt eds., *Nation Work: Asian Elites and National Identities* (Ann Arbor: The University of Michigan Press, 2003), 17.

<sup>3</sup> D. Eleanor Westney ed., *Imitation and Innovation: The Transfer of Western Organizational Patterns to Meiji Japan* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1987) 1-9.

<sup>4</sup> Ibid.

officials, rampant modernization and too much change meant giving up a sense of Japanese identity.<sup>5</sup> Officials who felt this way, like Japan's first head of the Board of Hygiene, Nagayo Sensei, tempered the influx of potentially culturally damaging Western discourse with a motion to only take "useful" Western practices and improve upon them in ways that would make them uniquely Japanese. In turn, this was thought to fuel nationalist sentiment that many saw as key to Japan's emergence as an independent modern nation.<sup>6</sup>

Public health is a useful framework for understanding Japan's interaction with modernity in the nineteenth-century because it applies to so many areas of Japanese life, urban and rural. Meiji-era officials and civilians selectively adopted Western practices while leaving some traditional institutions untouched. By not immediately adopting Western style sewers, Japanese officials displayed a level of critical thinking erodes the outdated idea that the Japanese were "clever little copiers." Instead, they were successful innovators who fulfilled a millennia-old Japanese practice of borrowing practical ideas from other cultures and leaving out less useful ones.

It may initially appear as though Western hygiene discourse expressed dominance and hegemony over Japanese traditions. However, there was a unique discourse of flexibility at work within Japan that valued taking useful parts of systems and leaving out others. This concept, called by its modern derivation,

---

<sup>5</sup> Ibid.

<sup>6</sup> Mahito H. Fukuda "Public Health in Modern Japan: From Regimen to Hygiene" in Dorothy Porter ed., *The History of Public Health and the Modern State* (Atlanta: Rodopi, 1994), 385-9.

*itōkō-dōri*, can be seen in the ancient Japanese adoption of Chinese calligraphy symbols, but not the adoption of Chinese language or grammar structure.<sup>7</sup> A way of thinking that sought a “give and take” relationship with the West was at work in Meiji Japan. Japan modernized and incorporated much of the technology of America, Britain, and France, but never became a colony when much of the rest of the world had. Japan stayed under Japanese control, but also changed in a complex way.

Several sources address the advent of public health practices in Japan. Louis G. Perez’s chapter, “Night-soil” (2002), Ann Bowman Jannetta’s *Epidemics and Morality in Early Modern Japan* (1987), and Susan B. Hanley’s “Urban Sanitation in Preindustrial Japan” (1987) provide secondary source information for the background of what constituted health and sanitation before the Meiji restoration.<sup>8</sup> Also, these sources connect religious practice to notions of cleanliness that may have limited the spread of diseases prior to the advent of medicalization. Susan L. Burns’s “Constructing the National Body” (2003) and Mahito H. Fukuda’s “Public Health in Modern Japan” (1994) each outline the advent of the idea of public health in Japan, the development of sanitation institutions, and how the image of public health became a flash point of

---

<sup>7</sup> Roger J. Davies and Osamu Ikeno eds., *The Japanese Mind: Understanding Contemporary Japanese Culture* (Rutland, VT: Tuttle Publishing, 2002), 127-33.

<sup>8</sup> Ann Bowman Janetta, *Epidemics and Mortality in Early Modern Japan* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1987); Perez 217-26. Susan B. Hanley, “Urban Sanitation in Preindustrial Japan” in *Journal of Interdisciplinary History* (Summer 1987), 1-26.

nationalist sentiment.<sup>9</sup> Alan Macfarlane's, *The Savage Wars of Peace: England, Japan, and the Malthusian Trap* (1997), Takeo Yazaki's *Social Change and the City in Japan* (1968) and David Kornhauser's *Urban Japan: its Foundation and Growth* (1976) each discuss specific public sewage and water supply projects that were started during the Meiji Era.<sup>10</sup> In addition, Macfarlane's book describes the role of nightsoil collection in urban Tokyo as well as the complexity and size of Japan's human fertilizer industry. These works provide the raw data of what was actually built for public health purposes in Japan as it modernized.

One way in which historians examine Japan's process of modernization is by looking at how leaders emulated Western organizational structures. D. Eleanor Westney argues that "[T]he emergent characteristics of the developing organizations have received surprisingly little systematic study. One reason for this partial neglect may be that emulating the patterns of another society has connotations of a lack of originality and even of intellectual piracy."<sup>11</sup> Late nineteenth century officials in Japan, however, felt that the country should build itself up as a "worthy" member of a family of modern nations by modeling Western bureaucratic structures as well as methods of carrying

---

<sup>9</sup> Burns, 17-49; Fukuda, 385-402.

<sup>10</sup> Alan Macfarlane, *The Savage Wars of Peace: England, Japan, and the Malthusian Trap* (Oxford: Blackwell Publisher Ltd., 1997) 154-70; David Kornhauser, *Urban Japan: Its Foundations and Growth* (New York: Longman, 1976) 149-60.

<sup>11</sup> Westney, 5.

out public works projects.<sup>12</sup> Meiji leaders maintained originality through innovation.

Meiji health officials imitated the West by creating bureaucratic structures like the Board of Public Health (1875), the Bureau of Hygiene (1874), and the Central Sanitary Committee (1879). Each department was overseen by the Home Department and Interior Ministry. Along with the establishment of “National Schools” like the Tokyo Jikei Medical Hospital, the government created offices that were recognizable to Westerners, but were not entirely imitative of Western practices.<sup>13</sup> Indeed, the Tokugawa *bakufu*’s (Shogun-led government 1603-1868) use of a strong bureaucracy in the two centuries before the Meiji Restoration meant that centralized organizations of authority were hardly novel concepts to the Japanese.<sup>14</sup>

Meiji officials, therefore, did not feel that emulating the West meant stepping away from a distinctively Japanese identity. Rather, as Jong-Chan Lee notes, “[a]ll Meiji policies emanated from basic concern with the nation.”<sup>15</sup> In terms of public health, Lee notes that the discourse between national prestige and public health was given a language of such importance that it inspired novelist Natsume Sōseki’s satirical remark: “What a horror if we ... eat for the nation, wash our

---

<sup>12</sup> Jong-Chan Lee, “Modernity of Hygiene in the Meiji Era, 1868-1905: Moralizing Imperial Bodies” *Korean Journal of Medical History* June, 2003. 34-6.

<sup>13</sup> Lee, 3-4.

<sup>14</sup> Perez, 220.

<sup>15</sup> Lee, 2.



faces for the nation, go to the toilet for the nation.”<sup>16</sup> People’s bodies, in terms of their health and hygiene, became state business at the end of the nineteenth century. According to Susan L. Burns, Nagayo felt that devising a national apparatus to protect and promote the “health and welfare of citizens was one of the most important functions of the modern state.”<sup>17</sup> Personal cleanliness became public health; public health became “state health.”

In Tokugawa era Edo (now Tokyo), the success of waterworks infrastructure, sewage disposal systems, and nightsoil collection provide examples with which the extent of Japanese innovation inside the context of Western urban planning and hygiene discourse can be assessed. There is strong evidence, collected by Susan B. Hanley and Louis G. Perez, that indicates that the practice of nightsoil removal for agricultural fertilization purposes kept excrement out of Edo’s water supply and greatly curtailed instances of epidemics.<sup>18</sup> The realization that the level of sanitation was higher in premodern Japanese cities than in the cities of the West in the same centuries may come as a shock to some readers. Part of the reason this information seems obscure is because it appears the situation has been the opposite in Japan during the latter half of the twentieth-century. Hanley notes that “Even after World War II, the Japanese continued to use nightsoil as a fertilizer and thus were seen as backwards to Western-

---

<sup>16</sup> Natsume Soseki, “My Individualism” (1914) in *Kokoro: A Novel and Selected Essays* (Lanham, MD: Madison Books, 1992) 313 as qtd in Lee, 2.

<sup>17</sup> Ibid., 2-3.

<sup>18</sup> Hanley, 6-8. Perez, 220-5.

ers.”<sup>19</sup> However, because the premodern methods for dealing with nightsoil were economically positive and also relatively hygienic, both in collection and overall sanitation, the Japanese were slow to modernize their toilet and sewage systems.

Hanley concludes that “the very success of the premodern waste disposal system inhibited modernization in this area, for, despite the shortcomings of sanitation, the Japanese today have the longest life expectancy of any major nation in the world.”<sup>20</sup> Though theoretically correct, Hanley’s compliments of the Tokugawa era sewage disposal systems seem to be missing out on how important the Japanese considered nightsoil. Hanley merely states that waste disposal was efficient and thorough, but mentions nothing about how lucrative a business the nightsoil trade was. Moreover, Hanley’s interpretation that the effectiveness of premodern waste disposal “inhibited modernization” seems to fall into the mental trap of rationalizing the Japanese as “clever little copiers.” By making it appear as though all forms of Japanese modernization were tied to technological innovations and drastic public works projects, Hanley does not consider a more complex view: By *not* drastically changing sewage disposal techniques, Japanese officials showed that they were critically thinking about Western practices and choosing not to employ them. Night soil, after all, was not waste but treasure; it was not a problem of disposal, but a contest for possession

In premodern Japan, sewage and clean water

---

<sup>19</sup> Hanley, 26.

<sup>20</sup> Ibid, 26.

supply were also separately addressed by officials and civilians. Hanley and Perez each provide a good overview of the early development of these systems and demonstrate how intricate and flexible they really were. The first water system constructed during the Edo period, the Kanda system, drew its water from the Inokashira spring east of the city. Water was carried to the city limits in exposed aqueducts, and then underground wooden pipes moved water within the city. The Kanda system was forty-one miles in length and had 3,663 subsidiary ducts. By the mid-seventeenth-century, however the Kanda system was inadequate for the growing city's needs.<sup>21</sup> Four new sewer systems were also added in 1657 –the Honjo, Aoyama, Mita, and Sengawa sewers. These systems largely moved waste water away from the city and did not deal with excrement; *all* night soil was collected by hand and taken out of the city.<sup>22</sup> Hanley also notes the increasing sophistication of techniques employed by Japanese engineers: by 1657, engineers had not only mastered efficient methods of creating and laying pipe systems, but had also begun designing the layout of these systems using methods involving trigonometry and triangulation. These measures greatly improved surveying results and helped solve problems created by differing elevations along pipe routes.<sup>23</sup> These pipe systems were built to ensure the flow of clean water into the city; this improved public health by supplanting the general public's use of standing water and

---

<sup>21</sup> Ibid., 6.

<sup>22</sup> Macfarlane, 154-70.

<sup>23</sup> Hanley, 7.

brackish well water.<sup>24</sup>

Sewage disposal and excrement removal became important issues in the urban planning of Edo only *after* the Tokugawa administration had largely solved the city's water supply demands. Perez argues: "From the mid-seventeenth century on, waste disposal was a major concern for urban administrations."<sup>25</sup> The most important difference between sewage disposal in the West and in Japan was that human excreta was not regarded as "something that one paid to have removed, but rather as a product with a positive economic value."<sup>26</sup> So complex was the issue of nightsoil collection that the *bakufu* issued edicts to control the collection of nightsoil. Only peasants could engage in the practice. Perez points out that this was mainly to keep merchants from gaining some kind of profit from the enterprise: "Contracts had to be employed. Land-owners and landlords were judged to be the owners of the solid feces, but the renters and residents continued to "own" their own urine."<sup>27</sup> The nightsoil collection "industry" was made possible and profitable by gigantic networks of collection, fermentation and composting, and distribution. Enormous barges were employed to ship the nightsoil, while tankers transported urine all the way to the cotton fields of Kinai.<sup>28</sup> Even though the idea of "sanitation" may not have worked its way into Tokugawa discourse, nightsoil collection undoubtedly helped keep urban areas clean. In addition, the governmental complexities ascribed to

---

<sup>24</sup> Ibid.

<sup>25</sup> Perez, 222.

<sup>26</sup> Ibid.

<sup>27</sup> Ibid., 222.

<sup>28</sup> Ibid., 223

nightsoil collection show that Japan maintained a long legal and bureaucratic history of allowing and encouraging private ventures that would later become discursively linked to the sanitation movement of the latter half of the nineteenth-century.

Perez also looks at the remarks made by the Portuguese Jesuit priest, Joao Rodrigues, who visited Japan in the early seventeenth century. Perez notes that Japanese privies, according to Rodrigues, were much different from those found in Europe.

The interior of the privies is kept extremely clean and a perfume pan and new paper cut for use are placed there. The privy is always clean without any bad smell, for when guests depart the man in charge cleans it out if necessary and strews clean sand so that the place is left as if it had never been used. A ewer of clean water and other things needed for washing the hands is nearby.<sup>29</sup>

Not only does Rodrigues's account show that Japanese lavatories were carefully maintained for the comfort of occupants, but the Jesuit's account also indicates that premodern Japanese lavatories were not places where pathogens and contaminants from human waste could come in to contact with the public water supply: Tokugawa privies were hygienic in an era when the discourse of hygiene had not even been thought of. Moreover, solid waste was collected from buckets that were present in the lavatories, thus rendering privies a space of economic importance. Most societies pay to have human waste shipped away. In Tokugawa Japan, however, solid waste was a commodity that people

---

<sup>29</sup> Ibid.

were paid to produce. Perez concludes: "It is hard to overemphasize the importance of nightsoil collection for the agricultural productivity of the period...it was perhaps Japan's third national commodity after rice and cotton."<sup>30</sup>

In the beginning of twentieth-century, nightsoil collection remained very important to Tokyo, but human "waste" was increasingly carried away by sewer systems that were augmented by a network of canals linked to the lower sections of the Kanda system.<sup>31</sup> That the Japanese separated human waste from the drinking water supply, and did so with the combined use of canals and sewers, indicates that changes in the nineteenth-century were not the result of radical shifts in ideology, but rather an innovative melding of Japanese and Western ideas that applied to "nation building" in a practical way. The public, signifying the national polity, was kept clean and healthy by an effective water supply system, night soil collection, and the limited application of sewers and canals where needed. Japanese "utilities," including nightsoil collection, were multilayered in a way that brought clean water in, took excrement out, and even provided a living for those who acted as agents between urban lavatories and rural rice fields.

Hanley argues similarly that "Edo's system was so well designed that when it was modernized at the end of the nineteenth century, the only major change was to replace wooden pipes with impervious metal ones."<sup>32</sup> In this way, the Japanese kept using the main features

---

<sup>30</sup> Ibid.

<sup>31</sup> Hanley, 16.

<sup>32</sup> Hanley., 17.

## Economies of Excrement

67

of a system constructed in the seventeenth century when they added a water supply system two centuries later which was based on modern technology.<sup>33</sup>

Even though Hanley observes that water pipe systems were merely replaced with stronger materials, the same cannot be said about the increasing, but still limited, number sewage lines built in Meiji-era Tokyo. Seidensticker argues that the collection of nightsoil had the important effect of keeping Tokyo clean at the time, but the city was growing too large to not be helped by the placement of sewer lines. By the Taisho era (1911-1925), the distance over which nightsoil had to be carted by horse and bucket from the center of Tokyo was considerable, thus making the traditional method impractical: "Houses near the center of the city could no longer sell their sewage, but had to pay someone to take it away. As this crisis mounted, tanks [that held sewage] would be deliberately broken in order that the stuff might quietly slip away, or sewage was carried out and dumped during the night. Edo was no doubt a smelly city, but Tokyo as it passed its semicentennial must have been even worse."<sup>34</sup> This perceived breakdown of nightsoil collection in the most populated parts of Tokyo did not immediately inspire the building of new sewers. It seems that urbanization, not sanitation, ultimately challenged Tokyo's pre-modern night soil economy. At least for the city center, these years marked an important shift in thinking about the products of the body. Excrement was no longer something that was purchased, but something

---

<sup>33</sup> Ibid.

<sup>34</sup> Edward Seidensticker, *High City, Low City: Tokyo From Edo to the Earthquake* (New York, Alfred A. Knopf, 1983), 283.

that people paid to have taken away. For many, excrement became *waste*, rather than simply sewage or product.

There were, however, days during the 1890s when farmers purchased nightsoil from deep within Tokyo. Seidensticker notes that farmers were willing to pay more for sewage from richer families: "The upper-class product was richer in nutriment, apparently. So, apparently, was male excrement. In aristocratic mansions where the latrines were segregated by sex, male sewage was more highly valued than female."<sup>35</sup> This distinction may have also been informed by ideas of male superiority. Men usually ate better food than their wives and their excrement was thought to be richer in nutrients, thus earning a higher price.<sup>36</sup> Rich households could still be paid to produce excrement in the late Meiji era, but the same cannot be said for slum areas of Tokyo. The dropping price of excrement as more and more people *paid* to have it taken away, may have exacerbated unsanitary slum conditions and caused outbreaks of disease.<sup>37</sup> Many people simply could not pay to have their excrement taken away, and areas lacking effective sewers and canals suffered. Shinjuku, on the Western edge of the city, was even called the anus of Tokyo.<sup>38</sup>

Governmental response to the physical growth of Tokyo, as well as its growing sanitation problem, came in 1888 with the passage of the Tokyo City Improve-

---

<sup>35</sup> Ibid.

<sup>36</sup> Macfarlane, 66.

<sup>37</sup> Andre Sorensen, *The Making of Urban Japan: Cities and Planning from Edo to the Twenty-First Century* (New York: Routledge, 2002) 72-3.

<sup>38</sup> Seidensticker, 83.



ment Ordinance (TCIO).<sup>39</sup> Even though various bureaucratic departments had already been set up to improve health in Tokyo, the TCIO was Japan's first modern urban planning law that sought to restructure the city. According to Andre Sorenson, the TCIO included plans for the "building and widening of 315 streets, improvements to canals, provisions for the extension of the main railway...many new bridges, 49 parks, 8 markets, and 6 cemeteries."<sup>40</sup> The TCIO still managed to affect a number of important redevelopments, most notably to the water system. The sewage system was not as lucky. When the third stage of the TCIO was completed in 1918, only a small portion of the originally planned sewer system had been finished, and only occupied about six percent of the TCIO's budget for that time.<sup>41</sup>

Seidensticker continues Sorensen's analysis by stating that "Sewers scarcely existed at the end of the Meiji [and into the Taisho era]. Kanda had a tile-lined ditch for the disposal of kitchen wastes, but body wastes were left to the *owaiya* (peasant class urban workers that serviced latrines) with his dippers and buckets and carts."<sup>42</sup> Under these conditions, it was fortunate that sewage disposal problems only reached crisis levels after the end of the first world war. The prosperity of Japan's interwar period ushered in larger public sewage projects that further consigned the collection of nightsoil to less populated environs.<sup>43</sup> Both Sorenson and Seidensticker agree that between

---

<sup>39</sup> Sorensen, 70.

<sup>40</sup> Ibid., 72.

<sup>41</sup> Ibid., 73.

<sup>42</sup> Seidensticker, 83.

<sup>43</sup> Macfarlane, 55.

the 1870s and 1890s, nightsoil collection, though diminishing in the city center, was able to meet the demands of most of Tokyo because it was augmented by canals and sewers.<sup>44</sup>

Nevertheless, new TCIO built sewers and canals were not only relatively ineffective, but their construction further shunted nightsoil collection into the suburbs.<sup>45</sup> Nightsoil collectors in the late Meiji and Taisho era (1911-1925) years did not operate in areas that had waste water carriage canals and sewers.<sup>46</sup> In a clear way, Western urban planning and increased urban populations created a sanitation problem where one had not previously existed. “Modernization” led to “primitive” conditions in areas of Tokyo that had once been serviced by nightsoil collectors.

Even though Taisho-era sanitation conditions in Tokyo indicate how modern and traditional methods of sewage management challenged each other, Meiji era sanitation maintained its traditional roots in the face of proposed modernization in other areas. This can be seen in the construction of the common urban latrine space. I have already examined latrines belonging to the Tokugawa era by looking at Joao Rodrigues’s seventeenth-century report. It is noteworthy that the differences between seventeenth-century privies and late nineteenth-century privies are barely discernable. When Edward S. Morse traveled to Japan in the late 1880s, he commented not only on the “cleanliness” of Japanese privies, but also on their function as places of agricultural and economic importance:

---

<sup>44</sup> Seidensticker, 282, Sorensen, 73.

<sup>45</sup> Ibid.

<sup>46</sup> Macfarlane, 59

## Economies of Excrement

71

In every house, except among the poorest classes, one finds in the immediate vicinity of a privy a receptacle for water and a towel, which is always used for hand-washing...The scrupulous care shown in the preservation of this important fertilizer is in striking contrast to the way in which we wastefully discharge it, thus polluting our air and water...Lowell and Lawrence with their typhoid fever, and Chicago with its overwhelming problem before it, show how far we are yet from dealing properly with this great and perplexing question... Indeed, so valuable is this substance that in Hiroshima, I was informed, in the renting of the poorer houses, of three persons occupied a room together the value of this product paid for the rent of one, and if five occupied the room, no rent was charged.<sup>47</sup>

Morse's commentary indicates that by the end of the nineteenth century Japanese lavatories still maintained the same aesthetic of cleanliness that they did in centuries past. Moreover, privies were still considered places of economic importance. Even though many modernizing practices came into Japan by way of the West, foreigners were taken aback by how the Japanese were in control of a centuries-old method of dealing with what Westerners would have called a "problem." To the Japanese, excrement was not seen as the same type of problem it was in the West. Instead, it was the opposite, an *opportunity* to make money. Excrement only became a problem to some residents of Tokyo when the city's expansion rendered nightsoil collection in their areas inefficient. Even then, human excrement was still thought of differently

---

<sup>47</sup> Morse, 172.

than in the West.

To the Japanese, even those who lived well into the twentieth century, the body's natural processes did not seem to hold the same repugnance as they did in Western discourse.<sup>48</sup> This distinction is crucial because it explains how nightsoil collection practices were able to flourish in Japan, whereas in the West they did not. Moreover, it appears that Japanese attention to the aesthetics of the privy created conditions above and beyond what Westerners would have called "sanitary." Macfarlane argues that the need for fertilizers and a "great attention to cleanliness led to the early development of toilet facilities."<sup>49</sup>

Writing in the 1870s, Morse stated that "the secret of sewage disposal has been effectually solved by the Japanese for centuries, so that nothing goes to waste." As a result, "that class of diseases which scourge our communities as a result of our ineffectual efforts in disposing of sewage, the Japanese happily know but little."<sup>50</sup> Not only are Morse's comments good indicators of the cleanliness of Japanese toilets and sophistication of the methods of taking sewage away, but his comments also indicate the sorry state of Western sanitation, despite all of its scientific approach, at that time. Judging by how awful Western conditions could be, there is small wonder that Japanese officials were slow to "modernize" sewage lines. Simply put, the Japanese system was seen as better, even to some Westerners.

---

<sup>48</sup> Tanizaki Junichiro, *In Praise of Shadows*, (New Haven, Conn: Leete's Island Books, 1977) 3-5.

<sup>49</sup> Macfarlane, 159.

<sup>50</sup> Edward S. Morse, *Japan Day by Day. 1877, 1878-79, 1882-1883*(New York: Houghton Mifflin, 1917) 61.

## Economies of Excrement

73

This study, shows that nightsoil collection was an important part of Tokugawa and Meiji-era economic policy. It not only kept urban areas free of human excrement, which in turn had the hygienic effect of curtailing epidemics and enhancing life expectancy, but its collection and marketing as a fertilizer also drove Japan's ability to feed a large population. The early modern Japanese implicitly understood that human excrement, as well as urine, are very effective fertilizers because they are rich in elements needed to sustain plant life: nitrogen, potassium, and phosphorous.<sup>51</sup> F.H. King documents how much human fertilizer was used in Japan in 1908. This is an important year for this analysis because it shows that even though some areas of Tokyo experienced distressing sewage conditions related to urban expansion and inefficient excrement collection, the nightsoil trade in the late Meiji period was invaluable for sustaining the national population of Japan: "Japan produced, in 1908, and applied to her fields, 23,850,295 tons of human manure; 22,812,787 tons of compost, and she imported 753,074 tons of commercial fertilizer, 7,000 of which were phosphorous in one form or another."<sup>52</sup> The fact that these figures even exist attests to the importance of nightsoil to the Japanese. Furthermore, the unique way in which nightsoil was stored and fermented in cement-lined pits for three to six months created, according to Macfarlane, the most efficient and bacteria free mixture possible. Perhaps the

---

<sup>51</sup> Macfarlane, 158.

<sup>52</sup> F.H. King, *Farmers of Forty Centuries: or, Permanent Agriculture in China, Korea, and Japan* (Emmons, Pa: Organic Gardening Press, 192?) 194.

unintended consequence of the way nightsoil was stored was that the heat generated by the process fermentation killed much of the harmful bacteria and fly-larvae that would otherwise manifest in open air waste fields.<sup>53</sup> This advanced system was over two hundred years old by the beginning of the Meiji period.

During the Tokugawa era, Japanese officials oversaw public and private systems of sewage transport and waterworks. These systems not only reduced instances of epidemics in the cities, but also provided the foundation of the fertilizer industry and helped to sustain growing urban and rural populations well into the twentieth-century. The continued efficient use of centuries-old public water systems in Tokyo and the agricultural and economically sound system of night-soil collection throughout the country erodes the idea that Meiji-era Japanese were “clever little copiers” of *all* things Western. The persistence of “old systems” into the twentieth century indicates that the Japanese held a more complicated view of modernity than some scholars have assumed.

It is true that Japanese officials at the end of the nineteenth century directly modeled Western practices at many levels. The Japanese government emulated Western bureaucratic structures with the development of The Board of Public Health and the Bureau of Hygiene. However, because the Tokugawa was also a heavily centralized government before it was influenced by the West, the idea of a functioning bureaucracy was not a strange concept to Meiji officials. Even though Western sanitation discourse had not entered Japan prior to the Meiji restoration, it easily attracted

---

<sup>53</sup> Macfarlane, 167.

followers in the Meiji government like Gotō Shinpei and Mori Rintarō. It seems the Western concepts of hygiene did not conflict with or revolutionize already existing Japanese notions of cleanliness and religious purification. To these officials, the creation of agencies that oversaw public health issues, including sanitation, was a logical step that came from blending Western discourse and Japanese tradition.

The cleanliness ascribed to Japanese toilets at this time was also directly linked to the fact that Japanese attitudes toward excrement were radically different than Western ones. The acceptance among Japanese that excrement was a valuable fertilizer allowed for the creation of a nightsoil economy. Nightsoil collection became so popular and efficient, even in urban areas, that it successfully avoided being “replaced” by Western-style water carriage sewers until much later in the twentieth century. By 1908, Tokyo’s urban population had grown so dense in some sections of the city that nightsoil collection became impractical. For these areas, water carriage sewer systems were built, but only to the extent that they needed to be.<sup>54</sup> This trend continued in urban Japan well into the 1920s.<sup>55</sup>

Meiji era officials clearly recognized that private systems of nightsoil collection provided a valuable service to urban and rural populations. It kept cities clean; it fertilized fields; it provided a livelihood for thousands; and helped feed the nation. In conjunction with an efficient water supply system in Tokyo, the preponderance of clean lavatories, and a bureaucracy that recognized public health, the practice of nightsoil

---

<sup>54</sup> Hanley, 20.

<sup>55</sup> Macfarlane, 169.

collection can be seen as part of a moneymaking industry that simultaneously fed Japan and helped keep the nation relatively free of many diseases. Nightsoil collection was not actively replaced by a government that wanted to “copy” every aspect of the West. Meiji officials looked at Western methods of handling sewage critically and decided that their own method met the agricultural and public health needs of the country more efficiently. Indeed, Meiji officials were successful innovators that streamlined Western ideas about hygiene with already existing infrastructures and sewage management techniques.

*Anthony Walsh is a senior History major at Santa Clara University. His paper “The Economics of Excrement: Public Health and Urban Planning in Meiji Japan” has won the Santa Clara University History Department McPhee Prize, given for the best presentation of original historical research and first place in the undergraduate division of the 2009 Northern California Phi Alpha Theta Regional Conference.*



“Yes, Sir, I am Here!”

77

## “Yes, Sir, I am Here!”: Images of American Women in World War I Propaganda

Alexandra M. Bisio

---

Serious, but with a hint of a smile pulling at the corner of her mouth, a uniformed woman stands at attention, a stray curl peaking out from under her military cap. In the background another female figure stands in front of a motorcar emblazoned with the insignia of the Motor Corps of America. “Yes, Sir, I am here! Recruits Wanted,” the poster’s caption reads, imploring American women to do their bit for the 1917 war effort.<sup>1</sup> Another uniformed woman is pasted on the wall next to the stern, if not completely stoic, driver. In a Navy peacoat, her capped curls also caught in a breeze, her eyes heavily lidded and lips parted, a “Christy Girl” stands with her hands in the pockets of her men’s naval uniform. “I want you [...] for the Navy,” is underlined beckoning men to their local recruiting station to sign up and join the fight “over there.”<sup>2</sup> Margaret Mary Fitzgerald saw a poster featuring a woman in 1918. “American Navy,” it read, “We need YOU!” Inspired by the image, Fitzgerald enlisted to serve her country as one of the Navy’s first female

---

<sup>1</sup> Edward Penfield, *Yes Sir – I am Here!*, 1917 in Gary A. Borkan, *World War I Posters* (Atglen, PA: Schiffer Publishing Ltd, 2002), 50.

<sup>2</sup> Howard Chandler Christy, *I want you for the Navy*, 1917 in Gary A. Borkan, *World War I Posters* (Atglen, PA: Schiffer Publishing Ltd, 2002), 24.

yeomen.<sup>3</sup> Images of women in World War I propaganda, ranging from motherly, to alluring, to serious, were meant to shape public opinion and inspire Americans to patriotic acts. They did more than merely shape public opinion of the war, however; they reflected and reinforced changes in American culture already in progress before the war's beginning.

America's commercial illustrators entered the war effort in the midst of what has been arguably deemed the "Golden Age," of American illustration.<sup>4</sup> Advertizing at the turn of the century had become a recognized profession and lucrative trade with the increased circulation of newspapers and, more importantly, magazines. New technology allowed for less complicated and less expensive methods of image reproduction, and illustrators became a key part of the proliferation of mass culture in the form of print media.<sup>5</sup> Illustrated posters had been an extremely popular advertizing media in the 1890s and would become the principal propaganda medium of the First World War.<sup>6</sup> The United States printed more than 20,000,000 copies of 2,500 different war propaganda posters, and many of those posters employed images of women to serve as symbolic icons to sell the war to the nation.<sup>7</sup>

---

<sup>3</sup> Lettie Gavin, *American Women in World War I: They Also Served* (Niwot, CO: University Press of Colorado, 1997), 10.

<sup>4</sup> Michele H. Bogart, *Advertising, Artists and the Borders of Art* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1995), 15.

<sup>5</sup> Ellen Mazur Thomason, *The Origins of Graphic Design in America 1870-1920* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1997), 11.

<sup>6</sup> Stewart Halsey Ross, *Propaganda For War* (Jefferson, NC: McFarland & Company, Inc. Publishers, 1996), 251.

<sup>7</sup> Walton Rawls, "Wake Up America!" *American History Illustrated* 23 no. 5 (1998): 35.

To be persuasive, propaganda images must be rooted in the culture of the nation in order to garner the response the government wishes to elicit in its citizenry. There is an element of social change pictured within war posters, especially with regard to gender roles, but also contradiction between traditional and non-traditional elements of American culture. What were women, when viewing these images, internalizing about their own standing in American society? Images of women in American World War I propaganda reveal evidence of changes in the construction of popular gender roles for women in early the twentieth century, as well as cultural gender anxiety. These images also demonstrate an acceptance of women's public visibility, public service, sexuality, and paid employment during times of national crisis. Though contradictory, propaganda images reinforced the necessary abandonment of many lingering nineteenth century prescriptions for women and the official adoption of women's presence in the public sphere.

Many historians of American propaganda begin their study with an examination of the government advertizing agency directed by George Creel, the Committee of Public Information. The Committee of Public Information (CPI) was the first government organized propaganda machine in the United States; it was created under Executive Order 2594, on April 13, 1917, seven days after the official declaration of war.<sup>8</sup> Historians have also, however, emphasized the importance of gender, and changes in gender roles at the turn of the century, when studying the culture of America during the First World War. Peter Gabriel

---

<sup>8</sup> Ross, 218.

Filene, in his essay entitled “In the Time of War,” emphasizes issues of masculinity and the contemporary perception that the American male had in some-way become too “feminine,” and that war would provide a “ground where they [American men] could enact and repossess the manliness that modern American society had baffled.”<sup>9</sup> Indeed, this view may be due, in part, to the fact that more women were entering the public sphere, the exclusive realm of men, through reform work and various professions. As Kathleen Kennedy states in *Disloyal Mothers and Scurrilous Citizens*, an analysis of the application of wartime disloyalty laws on women peace activists, “to their detractors, disorderly women embodied the social and political chaos that could accompany the entrance of women into the public sphere.”<sup>10</sup> The emphasis on motherhood in World War I propaganda certainly demonstrates the lasting emphasis of women’s role within the home. The government, however, required the mobilization of women, as well as men, to run the machinery of war in America. The acceptance of this need produced some of the most interesting of World War I imagery.

Michele J. Shover, in her 1975 article, “Roles and Images of Women in World War I Propaganda,” contends that the poster art was certainly used to express changes in women’s roles in society, but asserts that images of women in this type of propaganda were used to “expand the feminine role to meet the wartime needs

---

<sup>9</sup> Peter Gabriel Filene, “In the Time of War,” in *The American Man*, ed. by Elizabeth H. and Joseph H. Pleck (Englewood Cliffs, Prentice Hall, Inc., 1980), 322.

<sup>10</sup> Kathleen Kennedy, *Disloyal Mothers and Scurrilous Citizens* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1999), xvi.

“Yes, Sir, I am Here!”

81

of public policy” rather than reflect any change in society as a whole.”<sup>11</sup> She continues, “although roles were expanded for women in times of crisis, art associated with propaganda also served to “preserve the traditionally passive feminine role.”<sup>12</sup> Once war ended, women were naturally expected to reclaim their traditional roles in the domestic sphere. Martha Banta, in *Imaging American Women: Idea and Ideals in Cultural History*, makes a similar conclusion. “These women,” she states, “were natural heroines, but of the kind intended for return to the regulated life once peace was achieved.” She also notes, that “government poster art created a fantasy world where the heroic female image reaches for the timeless and sublime.”<sup>13</sup> However, for the first time, publicly active, socially independent women were visually celebrated in government art along side traditional motherhood. It is likely that not all women understood that, once the war ended, American culture was meant to return to pre-war ideals given changes that had already occurred in American society before the war.

### **From True Womanhood to Public Motherhood: The Development of Municipal Motherhood**

Nineteenth century society prescribed an ideal of total domesticity for American women. Sheltered from the public world of male competition, women were told of their position in society as “angels of the home”

---

<sup>11</sup> Michele J. Shover, “Roles and Images of Women in World War I Propaganda” *Politics and Society* 5 no. 3 (1975): 469.

<sup>12</sup> Ibid.

<sup>13</sup> Martha Banta, *Imaging American Women: Idea and Ideals in Cultural History* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1987), 574.

tasked with creating a retreat for their husbands and a loving and well disciplined atmosphere in which to raise their children to be productive citizens.<sup>14</sup> Most women could not attain this ideal version of womanhood prescribed to white middle class women. Still, this all consuming vision of middle-class white womanhood dominated popular culture. As Paula Baker notes, by the end of the first half of the nineteenth century “etiquette manuals written by both men and women prescribed more insistently the proper behavior for middle-class ladies [...] Motherhood was now described as woman’s special calling – a ‘vocation,’ [...] that, if preformed knowledgeably and faithfully, represented the culmination of a woman’s life.”<sup>15</sup> Motherhood became the only acceptable vehicle for women to assert their influence in American society.<sup>16</sup> Middle-class white women by the 1870s would fashion a new definition of motherhood still within their role as keepers and protectors of the domestic sphere; one that allowed them greater autonomy and influence in the public world of men.

Though American women’s rights activists before the 1870s fought to expand women’s political involvement as citizens, women in the progressive reform movements of the later nineteenth century and early twentieth century would expand women’s participation

---

<sup>14</sup> Peter G. Filene, *Him/Her/Self: Sex Roles in Modern America*, (Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1974), 8.

<sup>15</sup> Paula Baker, “White Women’s ‘Separate Sphere’ and Their Political Role, 1780-1860,” in *Major Problems in American Women’s History third edition*, ed. Mary Beth Norton and Ruth M. Alexander (New York: Houghton Mifflin Co., 2003), 113.

<sup>16</sup> *Ibid*, 110.

within the male sphere of public life through the revised rhetoric of domesticity. Middle-class women, heavily involved in social reform endeavors, argued that their innate domestic qualities made them uniquely suited to solving public problems related to issues of the home, as well as those relating to women and children. Through reform work, it was written in 1891, women learned “to know themselves, to understand the highest duties of motherhood, to feel the sacredness of home life, to see existing wrongs and to apply needed remedies.”<sup>17</sup> Though this rhetoric did not free women from patriarchal ideals regarding domestic qualities innate to females, it did allow women to move more freely in the public sphere. These new ideals would also allow women to leave their homes for the battlefields of France to become Red Cross volunteers, some of the “greatest mothers in the world” during the First World War.<sup>18</sup>

Though the United States did not enter the war until its end in 1917, the American Red Cross began to offer its services to all belligerent nations as early as September of 1914.<sup>19</sup> In 1916 the U.S. surgeon general commissioned the Red Cross to establish fifty base hospital units, later to serve as Army and Navy hospitals in the British Isles and on the continent.<sup>20</sup> 20,000 nurses would provide medical care and social relief for

---

<sup>17</sup> Kate Tannatt Wood, “What Women’s Clubs have Done For Women,” *The Chautauquan; A Weekly News Magazine*, August 1891. APS Online.

<sup>18</sup> A.E. Foringer, *The Greatest Mother in the World*, 1917, in Gary A. Borkan, *World War I Posters*, (Atglen, PA: Schiffer Publishing Ltd, 2002), 157. See appendix.

<sup>19</sup> Gavin, 180.

<sup>20</sup> Ibid, 181.

soldiers and European refugees alike.<sup>21</sup> These women took their skills out of the confines of the home and the urban neighborhoods to which progressive reformers had been devoted. Though they applied skills described as befitting a woman's place in society, these women would have their lives, and self-perceptions, altered serving on edges of European battlefields.

### **“The Greatest Mother in the World:” The Art of the American Red Cross**

The poster artists responsible for the creation of advertisements for the Red Cross utilized the recognizable rhetoric of municipal motherhood, firmly established by female progressive reformers, to recruit volunteers and implore American citizens to donate to the international relief organization. This imagery signified an official cultural adoption of women's role as caretaker of the public in addition to her own family. Some historians believe, however, that due to male gender anxieties, “the war effort role for women was thoroughly traditional: service-support-sacrifice. Hence, the war effort constituted a substantial reaffirmation of women's traditional roles.”<sup>22</sup> Certainly, the propaganda of the Red Cross played upon nineteenth-century attributes of women, yet at least in U.S. propaganda, they did so in a way that recognized the changing aspects of popular American womanhood.

### **“The Comforter”**

In an image by propaganda artist Gordon Grant,

---

<sup>21</sup> Susan R. Grayzel, *Women and the First World War* (London: Pearson Education Limited, 2002), 46.

<sup>22</sup> Shover, 473.



entitled *The Comforter*, the Red Cross nurse is put in a classic posture reinforcing her innate qualities as not only a mother, but also as a loving and patient wife.<sup>23</sup> The Red Cross nurse brings the comforts of domesticity to those who have lost those comforts; she is an asexual middle-class wife of those who require one and the mother of motherless children. Grant’s image suggests the nurse has found a noble way to apply her innate strengths and skills to those in need. At the same time, this poster sends a message to women who might wish to leave the confines of home to serve their country and help soldiers at the front or the citizens of beleaguered European nations. Any woman had the skills necessary to join the Red Cross, merely by circumstance of her sex and the skills inherent to her gender. Within nineteenth century gender roles, middle-class women were allowed to enter a world which might have been deemed too aggressive and dangerous for their stereotypic delicate natures.

**“Motherless-Fatherless-Starving: How much to save these little lives?”**

More so than *The Comforter*, this image by an unknown propagandist speaks to the American idea of women’s public service as municipal motherhood, an ideal that had become more commonplace for middle-class women at the end of the last century.<sup>24</sup> As in *The Comforter*, the Red Cross nurse is once again extend-

---

<sup>23</sup> Gordon Grant. *The Comforter*, 1918, in Gary A. Borkan, *World War I Posters*. (Atglen, PA: Schiffer Publishing Ltd, 2002.), 154. See appendix.

<sup>24</sup> Maureen Flanagan, *America Reformed: Progressives and Progressivism 1890-1920* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2007), 89.

ing her maternal gifts outside the home. This nurse, appearing at the center of a group of children, is more of a mother of the community rather than simply a surrogate.<sup>25</sup> It is also clear that she is an outside figure come to help a group of unfortunates, not unlike middle-class female reformers in working-class settings. The French woman who so pleadingly offers her child is somehow aware that the Red Cross nurse, because of her official station and perhaps even her American origin, knows how to better care for her child during this time of crisis.

Motherhood, at the end of the nineteenth century and at the beginning of the twentieth, underwent what historians have termed a period of professionalization, “essentially a defensive reaction to the emergence of young women in the late nineteenth century, but it was also a reaction to some major shifts taking place with American society generally.”<sup>26</sup> Though this may have contributed to the emphasis on so-called scientific motherhood, it is more than likely that this trend had more to do with the shift towards a focus on the professional as the knowledgeable authority.<sup>27</sup> The Red Cross nurse is pictured as the middle-class progressive woman who, because of her class status and almost scientific domestic and maternal knowledge, was believed to know how to better care for children. Educated, reform minded women often found “class

---

<sup>25</sup> *How Much to Save these Little Lives? The Greatest Mother in the World*, 1917, in Gary A. Borkan, *World War I Posters*, (Atglen, PA: Schiffer Publishing Ltd, 2002.), 147. See appendix.

<sup>26</sup> Joseph M. Hawes, “The Strange History of Female Adolescence In the United States,” *The Journal of Psychohistory* 13 (Summer 1985): 54.

<sup>27</sup> Flanagan, 82.

and cultural divides between the middle-class native born and the immigrant working class and the poor always gave the settlement house workers the upper hand in all their dealings.”<sup>28</sup> The artist conveys the same sentiment commonly held in American middle-class culture.

Objection to the entrance of women into public sphere, by the First World War, subsided enough that expanding the domain of women into war zones was deemed acceptable enough to be used in propaganda images. In a large scale total war, like World War I, nineteenth century gender conventions no longer served the state in practical ways. Though the entrance of women into public society had caused anxiety among middle-class males, authorities had no choice but to promote the appropriateness of women’s entrance into the male sphere. The call to action, cloaked in the mantle of motherhood, made the images of women’s power and independence more palatable to those who might have rejected the idea of American mothers on European battlefields. Fundamentally, however, women were shown a choice within the rhetoric of motherhood as to what sort of women they wished to be. They could follow their mothers and be domestic or they could actively engage in a more municipal version of motherhood in service to the nation and the international community. It was not only motherhood, however, that was changed. Ideas about sexuality and the appropriate, public presentation of women’s sexuality were also changing as young women gained greater independence from the insular world of family and the domestic sphere.

---

<sup>28</sup> Flanagan, 37.

### **Sex and the New Woman: The Visibility of Female Sexuality in the Public Sphere**

The early nineteenth century saw a new construction of middle-class, female gender known as “The Cult of True Womanhood.” The preservation of a woman’s purity was given particular importance in rules governing middle class propriety. A girl was taught, not only by her parents but by popular media as well, to “value her virginity ‘as the ‘pearl’ of great price’ which was her greatest asset.”<sup>29</sup> Courting and interaction with the opposite sex, outside family members, were closely chaperoned. Indeed, “a woman outside the home without a respectable male escort risked ruining her reputation irreparably, for she would immediately be suspected of participating in something immoral or socially marginal.”<sup>30</sup> Anxieties related to middle-class sexuality were aroused as women maneuvered their way into the public sphere. “Women are crowding into the public gaze,” an article published in 1877 in the *New Englander* stated, “and men invite them there, without necessity or special occasion [...] The very atmosphere of the times is changing, and the instinctive sense of delicacy that forms its oxygen so far as female character is concerned, is charged with poison.”<sup>31</sup> By the First World War, however, women’s presence in the public sphere was becoming generally accepted, and even seen as necessary once the United States entered the war. If “True Womanhood” had disappeared, as the author of the *New Englander*

---

<sup>29</sup> Cruae, 188.

<sup>30</sup> Ibid, 194.

<sup>31</sup> “Shall Womanhood be Abolished?,” *New Englander*, July 1877. APS Online.

article lamented, what sort of womanhood took its place?

Middle-class women's increased visibility within the public sphere, brought about not only through reform work but also paid employment socially suitable for middle-class women, began to change certain cultural ideals and popular strictures regarding women's social independence. More girls were attending secondary school in the late nineteenth century and especially early twentieth, there girls often “discovered that life could be more than marriage, home, children and family.”<sup>32</sup> Attitudes regarding the relative sexual independence of women were changing as the nineteenth century became the twentieth. Some attitudes remained conservative, especially in American courts, when faced with prospect of women's sexual self-assertion.<sup>33</sup> Yet popular culture gave women a different message about sexual expression in the public arena with the creation of the “New Woman” in the 1890s. Visually, young women would be presented with images that typified this popular “New Woman,” and gave American women a new figure with which to identify.<sup>34</sup> Dressed in fashions that recall Charles Dana Gibson's famous “Gibson Girl,” the “New Woman” was “granted the traits of physical attractive-

---

<sup>32</sup> Hawes, 54.

<sup>33</sup> Nancy F. Cott, “The Modern Architecture of Marriage,” in *Major Problems in American Women's History* third edition, ed. Mary Beth Norton and Ruth M. Alexander (New York: Houghton Mifflin Co., 2003), 319.

<sup>34</sup> Charles Dana Gibson, *Scribner's for June*, 1896, in Martha Banta, *Imaging American Women: Idea and Ideals in Cultural History* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1987), 89. See Appendix.

ness, independence, strong mindedness, and zest for the experience of the world.”<sup>35</sup> The image of the independent woman was so popular among women at the turn of the century that the image, often meant to be couched in an atmosphere of artistic irony, began to threaten men and women invested in the traditional order of society. For others this image was far from threatening, in fact, the “New Woman,” and her sexuality, would become profitable to those in the early pictorial advertizing industry.

### **I Want You...For the Navy: Women's Sexuality in Propaganda**

Illustrators at the turn of the twentieth century began to push the boundaries of public propriety in order to make products more competitive on the national market. Images of women, or at least stereotypic “American” white beauties such as the Gibson Girl and the Christy Girl frequently used as icons of the marketing game, would later become propaganda icons as well.<sup>36</sup> These early twentieth century advertisements, though limited as to diversity in their subjects, began to make more free use of women's sexuality, or at least the suggestion of sexual appeal, in order to sell products and magazines. These advertizing tactics would be easily transferred to images of women in propaganda.

Some of the most overtly sexual images women used in the First World War were employed in enlistment images targeted at men featuring women in male military uniforms, uniquely tailored to emphasize

---

<sup>35</sup> Banta, 58

<sup>36</sup> Ibid, 53.

“Yes, Sir, I am Here!”

91

feminine figures. Certainly, these images attracted the attention of the young men needed to fight in the war as these posters have been likened to the burlesque posters of the era.<sup>37</sup> Truly, these images do seem to have more in common with later pin up art than anything created by Gibson. Yet, these images would not have been deemed appropriate for mass viewing had there not been some artistic precedent. Anne Classen Knutson, in her dissertation on images of women in World War I propaganda, asserts that these images suggested to men a sexual reward for their service to the nation. “Their sexuality,” she writes of these women, “is the sexuality of reward, the sexuality of the boudoir.”<sup>38</sup> Men, however, were not the only people viewing these images; women also received messages about their own sexuality, and the display of that sexuality, through these images.

### **“I summon you to Comradeship in the Red Cross”**

Though Red Cross images usually played upon the rhetoric of sainted or public motherhood in order to persuade their viewers to support their volunteer organization, an image by illustrator Harrison Fisher entitled *I summon you to comradeship in the Red Cross* does not utilize this common strategy.<sup>39</sup> Just like the nurses pictured in war ravaged Europe, the woman in Fisher’s image stands in the foreground dressed in a

---

<sup>37</sup> Banta, 572.

<sup>38</sup> Anne Classen Knutson, “Breasts, Brawn and the Selling of a War: American World War I Propaganda Posters 1917-1918” (Ph.D. diss., University of Pittsburgh, 1997), 166.

<sup>39</sup> Harrison Fisher, *I summon you to comradeship in the Red Cross*, 1917, in Gary A. Borkan, *World War I Posters*. (Atglen, PA: Schiffer Publishing Ltd, 2002.), 150. See appendix.

white uniform signifying her membership in the Red Cross. She is certainly not, however, the surrogate mother of other Red Cross images; rather she strikes a pose closer to that of a music hall girl than a dutiful nurse.

Indeed, according to Banta, the use of the music hall and burlesque image was somewhat common in the more noticeably sexual propaganda posters of World War I.<sup>40</sup> For men, this image of a sexual Red Cross nurse, a traditionally middle class figure, resembled a more familiar lower class, and therefore more sexually available and less culturally threatening, female image. However, this suggests that these images only fell under traditional male gaze. Propaganda images were, however, exposed to the general public. The use of this sort of female figure in a poster created for the Red Cross is surprising; unlike other organizations that used this kind sexual imagery, the American Red Cross was a predominantly female organization. The connection of a middle-class figure with visible sexuality might have suggested to female viewers a greater acceptance of their own sexuality.

**“Gee! I wish I were a man! I’d join the Navy!”**

One of the most famous propaganda images from the First World War was a Navy enlistment poster by illustrator Howard Chandler Christy entitled *Gee, I wish I were a man! I’d join the Navy!* Banta uses this image as a primary example of what she describes as the popular image of “Columbian Amazons” in military uniform commonly seen on the burlesque circuit. “Howard Chandler Christy’s famous poster for the U.S.

---

<sup>40</sup> Banta, 572



Navy,” Banta explains, “is close in its tone to the burlesque poster [...] and to the cover for the 1919 Ziegfeld Follies, ‘My Baby’s Arms.’”<sup>41</sup> The image that Christy presents is interesting as an example of a wide, public display of what could have been considered a rather risqué image. The text that accompanies the image, however, reveals much about public reactions to changes in gender during the First World War.

Around the turn of the century, many believed that society was in some way becoming “feminized.” Opportunities for the expression of masculinity were disappearing as education and labor became less male dominated and its expression less physically demanding.<sup>42</sup> The war and participation in the armed forces, as Filene explains, came to be seen as a chance for American boys to prove their manhood. “Americans entered the Great War,” Filene explains, “to achieve not simply political principles, but psychological reassurance as well. [...] Indeed, the incessant propaganda that filled newspapers, magazines, auditoriums, and street corners focused primarily on those who were not in uniform.”<sup>43</sup> The Christy sailor’s gentle taunt, “Gee! I wish I were *a man*,” on a poster designed for enlistment, can be interpreted as a slight on the masculinity of those who did not enter the armed

---

<sup>41</sup> Banta, 573. See appendix.

<sup>42</sup> Jeffery P. Hantover, “The Boy Scouts and the Validation of Masculinity,” in *The American Man*, ed. Elizabeth H. and Joseph H. Pleck (Englewood Cliffs, Prentice Hall, Inc., 1980), 291.

<sup>43</sup> Filene, 323.

forces.<sup>44</sup> However, this image can easily have another meaning tied to women's entrance into traditionally male dominated sectors of society. Dawn Schmitz asserts that images of sexualized women in cigarette ads often parodied images and popular trends associated with the New Woman. "The New Woman," Schmitz writes of an 1888 cigarette ad, "signaling [...] sexual independence, is called up only to be mockingly dismissed. [...] The threat to masculinity posed by the New Woman- who demanded entrance into spheres of work, education and recreation that had previously served to define manhood- is blunted."<sup>45</sup> This phenomenon can also be seen in Christy's propaganda images. Women had, in fact, begun entering the U.S. Navy as yeomen in early 1917.<sup>46</sup> Christy's image can be seen, perhaps, as a lashing out at the more than 11,000 women who had joined the Navy, thereby violating the male sphere.<sup>47</sup> By portraying his sailor girl in such a manner, it could be said that Christy was serving to mock the steps towards female independence taken by these early naval women.

In the decades before the turn of the century, sexuality in advertizing, both as a way to simply sell products and to subtly mock women's sexual inde-

---

<sup>44</sup> Erika A. Kuhlman, *Petticoats and White Feathers: Gender Conformity, Race, the Progressive Peace Movement, and the Debate over War, 1895-1919*, (Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 1997), 1.

<sup>45</sup> Dawn Schmitz, "Only Flossy, High-Society Dudes Would Smoke 'Em: Gender and Cigarette Advertising in the Nineteenth Century," in *Turning the Century: Essays in Media and Cultural Studies*, ed. Carol A. Stabile (Boulder: Westview Press, 2000), 112.

<sup>46</sup> Gavin, 2.

<sup>47</sup> Ibid.

pendence became an even more evident trend. The necessity of women's independence in the public sphere became apparent during the First World War, as did the understanding that the new sexuality of women could be used to sell the war just as it had sold products. Where images of the New Woman's sexuality might have before been limited to a male audience, propaganda images were meant for a general audience, including women. Middle-class women were given a different reflection of themselves in these suggestive images. With unintentional support from the government, American women began to develop new perceptions of their own sexuality.

**“When men go a-warring, women go to work:”  
American Women and Visibility of Labor**

Since the beginning of American industrial production in the early nineteenth century, women had been a prime source of low wage, unskilled labor. Women did tedious and grueling work in factories, work that they would be publicly praised for during the First World War. Opportunities for greater independence grew as more jobs began to appear. Between the years 1880 and 1900 the number of employed women doubled. During the next decade it increased by another 50 percent. Most non-college educated women, however, joined the labor force out of necessity rather than as a “glorious adventure.”<sup>48</sup> Though clearly women's paid work had been a large part of the American workforce before the First World War, it was during the war that women's work was given new positive attention.

---

<sup>48</sup> Peter Gabriel Filene, *Him/Her/Self*, 33.

Harriot Stanton Blatch commented upon this phenomenon, “America is witnessing the beginnings of a great industrial and social change. [...] They have opened up every line of service. There is not an occupation in which a woman is not found.”<sup>49</sup> Many of these occupations were publicly visible in comparison to the work women had done traditionally. Blatch spoke of highly visible uniformed women trolley conductors and elevator operators, and while she seems to deem their presence as hopefully lasting yet somewhat quaint, Americans were exposed to the sight of women in non-traditional occupations.<sup>50</sup> The flurry of propaganda posters illustrating women’s place in war industry were produced supporting their visibility.

### **“Remember the Girl behind the Man behind the Gun:” The Y.W.C.A. and Images of War Work**

Though not a government organization, a large amount of propaganda related to women’s work was produced by the Young Women’s Christian Association (Y.W.C.A.). Most popularly the organization was known for giving young women inexpensive rooms when away from their family homes and hot meals when in need.<sup>51</sup> As the United States entered the war, however, many tenets of the organization had changed as organization leaders were forced to conform to the growing needs of the female workforce. The Y.W.C.A. found that it needed to respond to “the practical needs of working women who turned to the Y.W.C.A. for assistance in

---

<sup>49</sup> Blatch, 88.

<sup>50</sup> Ibid.

<sup>51</sup> Janice Dilg, “Uncovering “The Real Work” of the Portland YWCA, 1900-1923,” *The Journal of Women’s History* 15 (Autumn 2003):175.

addressing the stark financial realities and bleak industrial conditions they confronted at their work places.” Set in a tone of patriotism, the Y.W.C.A actively educated women participate in war work; a task to which the Y.W.C.A was “well fitted to wrestle, as they have had an industrial department for a number of years” prior to the United States’ entry into the war.<sup>52</sup> Certainly, propagandists for the Y.W.C.A. played on the idea of patriotic, sisterly service to the nation to convince women to join the American war effort both on the home front and abroad. Even before U.S. entrance into the war the organization had openly encouraged women’s work and its expansion. The propaganda of the Y.W.C.A was some of the most visually supportive of women’s work and often embodied the ideals of the organization.

### **“For Every Fighter a Woman Worker”**

Ernest Hamlin Baker’s Y.W.C.A. propaganda for the United War Work Campaign features a veritable sea of women marching united as a great army. These women were always pictured as confident in their work, more than able to do the tasks that the nation required of them.<sup>53</sup> “For Every Fighter a Woman Worker,” the caption reads, “Back our Second Line of Defense.”<sup>54</sup> Like many Y.W.C.A. propaganda pieces, this piece seems to be focused on supporting “the line of defense” than the enlistment of women to their

---

<sup>52</sup> Ida Clyde Clarke, *American Women and the World War* (New York: D. Appleton and Company, 1918), 194.

<sup>53</sup> Shover, 478.

<sup>54</sup> Ernest Hamlin Baker, *For Every Fighter A Woman Worker*, 1918, in Gary A. Borkan, *World War I Posters*. (Atglen, PA: Schiffer Publishing Ltd, 2002.), 167. See appendix.

ranks. More than anything, propaganda of this type attempted to convince the American public to support their fighting men by doing what the Y.W.C.A. had been actively doing since the turn of the century, supporting working women and the expansion of their employment. The work that the Y.W.C.A. had done in order to support women in industry and other forms of paid work had, at least for the duration of the war, been formally adopted by American culture and propaganda images like Baker's clearly reflected that point.

Not every Y.W.C.A. image explicitly supported the continuation of women's expanded work during the war. Some had a slightly more domestic undertone, although that was not inconsistent with the more traditional, Christian tenets of the Y.W.C.A. Most Y.W.C.A. images, however, urged the American public to support the woman worker, and to "care for her through the Y.W.C.A."<sup>55</sup> Women were given a positive image of their call to work, and the feeling that their work would be supported. Whether or not that support would last after the war had ended was another question, but these images were not likely to be ones that women would soon forget.

## Conclusion

In America at the turn of the twentieth century women began to see themselves popularly depicted in new ways. Deviating from the nineteenth-century

---

<sup>55</sup> Adolph Triedler, *For Every Fighter A Woman Worker*, 1918, in Gary A. Borkan, *World War I Posters*. (Atglen, PA: Schiffer Publishing Ltd, 2002.), 166. See appendix.

image of the passive female, women began to be portrayed as more active. Advertising agencies were drawn to this vivacious New Woman and gave her a new occupation as an effective saleswoman in magazine and poster ads. The First World War brought changes in women's roles, especially public roles, to the forefront of public life in America. Gender roles had already begun to change long before the war, but social upheaval radically challenged American perceptions of gender. During a time of crisis, like this “Great War,” women's skills both domestic and occupational and her presence and visibility, within the public sphere was required.

Pictorial propagandists set to work making images to mobilize not only American men, but also women to support the war. With their well honed advertizing skills, these artists borrowed from progressives and suffragettes and turned this publicly minded, angel of public domesticity, into the model of municipal motherhood. Elements of female sexuality inspired by women's increasing visibility in the public sphere were borrowed to convince citizens to support the war. Finally, in addition to mobilizing women on the home front, propaganda posters urged the public to respect and support working women.

Non-traditional elements of gender were sometimes paired with, or set against, more common nineteenth-century notions of women's role in public society. Propaganda images were contradictory in nature, both supporting and subverting women's new public roles. The inconsistent nature of propaganda imagery speaks to the medium's tendency to give multiple, meanings depending upon the viewer of the depictions of women. Propaganda artists struggled to retain the conservative

nineteenth-century views of women in their art. These views, however, were in opposition to the needs of the state during the war. The more non-traditional images had to be shown to support the roles the government required women to fill during the war. The new self perceptions women gained during the war could not simply be forgotten. Even women who were not actively involved in the war effort saw these images of publicly minded mothers, sexually aware women, and working women and were informed, in a way, about their own changing cultural identity as American women.

*Alexandra Bisio is a senior American History major with a special interest in women's and gender history. She currently works at the Orradre Library in Archives and Special collections and will be pursuing a Master's degree in Library and Information Science at Simmons College beginning next fall.*



## “We Must Get into the Arena”: The Feminism of Judge Sarah T. Hughes

Emma Nagengast

---

An ardent advocate of women's rights, Judge Sarah T. Hughes said, “The sooner we get to consider women as individuals rather than as women, the better it will be. All women are not alike, just as all men are not alike.”<sup>1</sup> Contemporary American women continue to advocate for their full equality, a fight introduced in the 1800s. Many women, like their predecessors, use the legal system to force society to apply the Constitution's guarantee of equality. As an activist, lawyer, politician, and judge, Sarah T. Hughes paved the way for contemporary American feminists.

Hughes strenuously advocated women's rights. Born on 2 August 1896, she lived an atypical life for a woman of her time. Contrary to the norms for women in American society during the 1920s, she attended college. While working as a police officer, she studied law. Hughes stepped out of the prescribed domestic sphere and became an educated, working professional.<sup>2</sup> Her professional life continued to be unique. She paved the way for women in the legal profession. In 1935, Hughes was appointed judge of the fourteenth District Court in Dallas, becoming Texas's first female

---

<sup>1</sup> “Her Honor Takes the Bench,” *New York Times*, 29 January 1965. Article accessed at: <<http://www.time.com/time/magazine/article/0,9171,839164,00.html>>.

<sup>2</sup> Mary Beth Norton and Ruth M. Alexander *Major Problems in American Women's History*, 3<sup>rd</sup> ed. (New York: Houghton Mifflin Company, 2003.)

district judge. That would not be the only barrier she would break for women; in 1961 President John F. Kennedy appointed her to the federal bench, making her the first woman to serve as a federal district judge in Texas.<sup>3</sup> Hughes became nationally known on 22 November 1963 when she administered the presidential oath of office to Lyndon B. Johnson after the assassination of President John F. Kennedy. In a time of national tragedy Hughes stepped in and became the first woman to swear a president into office.<sup>4</sup> While making remarkable advances as a woman and a judge, Hughes used her intelligence and passion for women's rights to pave the way to equality for all American women. Ruling in cases such as *Roe v. Wade* and *Shultz v. Brookhaven General Hospital*, Hughes ruled in favor of women's rights. Hughes used her career and the power of the law to advance the position of women in American society.

The feminist, political activist was born on 2 August 1896 to James Cooke Tilghman and Elizabeth Haughton. Sarah was not brought up in a life where her gender strictly defined her ability. Throughout her childhood, despite the family's modest circumstances, Sarah's mother constantly reminded her that

---

<sup>3</sup> William Hicks, "Judge Sarah T. Hughes Collection," *University of Northern Texas Libraries*, Accessed at: <<http://www.library.unt.edu/archives/historical-manuscripts/historical-manuscripts-exhibits/hughes/>>.

<sup>4</sup> Robert S. LaForte and Richard Himmel, "Sarah T. Hughes, John F. Kennedy and the Johnson Inaugural, 1963," *East Texas Historical Journal* vol. 27 (1989): 1.

## “We Must Get into the Arena”

103

she was capable of doing anything she dreamed.<sup>5</sup> Sarah carried this mindset with her throughout her life. Also unique to Hughes's childhood was her early introduction to politics. When she attended the 1912 Democratic National convention in Baltimore, at the age of sixteen, Sarah was “exposed to Progressive rhetoric” and felt that one day she would like to be onstage at such a convention.<sup>6</sup> Sarah Hughes always felt she had “politics in her blood.”<sup>7</sup>

Sarah Tilghman's early desire to become involved in politics differed from the norm. Women stayed out of the “public sphere,” including politics. Women's limited role in the political arena in the late 19<sup>th</sup> century was directly tied to their role as mothers; “ambitious” women worked to raise their sons and persuade their husbands to align with their political mindset.<sup>8</sup> However, the Progressive Era brought change, which influenced Tilghman. Her parents fostered her ability to be a politically conscious citizen during her youth, creating a strong foundation for her later political involvement.

Many factors influenced the political and social stances that Hughes took throughout her career as a lawyer, politician, and judge. As a high school senior in 1912 Sarah Tilghman demonstrated her feminist ideals during a heated debate over women's suffrage.

---

<sup>5</sup> Sarah T. Hughes interview by Fred Gantt (Gantt), 15 Jan. 1969. Interview 27C.2, transcript, North Texas State University Oral History Collection (NTOHC), Dallas, TX. 2.

<sup>6</sup> Payne, 10.

<sup>7</sup> Gantt, 15 Jan. 1969, 11.

<sup>8</sup> Jane Fishburne Collier, “Women in Politics,” *Woman, Culture, and Society*, ed. Michelle Zimbalist Rosaldo and Louise Lamphere (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1974), 93.

Tilghman “resolved that women should vote,” and led her team to victory.<sup>9</sup> As a young, successful debater, influenced by her family’s involvement in politics and the Progressive era, Tilghman’s motivated, intelligent personality took shape. It was key to the success of her career and allowed her to advance the position of women.

Like many elite women of the early 1900s, Sarah Tilghman continued her education in an all female college. In September 1913 she enrolled in Goucher College in Baltimore. The education of the white elite women was mostly separated from men’s, and formed the groundwork of the women’s movement of the early twentieth century. College education was a significant stepping-stone to this transformation for some women, including Tilghman.

Just as educational opportunities were often segregated by gender, postgraduate career options were split by similar barriers. The 19<sup>th</sup> century women’s culture, centered around “reverence for the home and respect for the house wife, was rapidly dismantled.”<sup>10</sup> While this advancement must not be overstated (“as late as 1930 only 11.7 percent of married women were gainfully employed outside the home”), some women were breaking out of their prescribed domestic sphere and into the public world.<sup>11</sup> Certain new careers in the public sphere, such as teaching and nursing, were seen as women’s professions. Tilghman became a teacher. According

---

<sup>9</sup> Payne, 10-11.

<sup>10</sup> Glenna Matthews, *The Rise of Public Woman* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1992), 177.

<sup>11</sup> Ibid.

## “We Must Get into the Arena”

105

to Tilghman, “about the only thing a girl could do at that time was teach school. At least I thought that was about the only thing I could do.”<sup>12</sup> This career path did not interest Sarah for long. Her personality lacked the patience for teaching, opportunities for advancement were limited, and she feared the monotony: “she told an interviewer years later—that if she remained there she might become a stereotypical old maid teacher.”<sup>13</sup> The career was too limited for her ambitious personality.

Tilghman’s decision to leave her teaching career diverged from the normal path of the typical middle-class white woman in the early twentieth century. Following in the footsteps of her childhood hero, her older male cousin, she decided that she would study law.<sup>14</sup> On 19 October 1919, she matriculated as a student of law at George Washington University in Washington D.C.

As a law student, Tilghman did not notice a divide between male and female students.<sup>15</sup> George Washington University’s law school was extremely advanced in gender equality; in 1921, 15 percent of the students were women.<sup>16</sup> (Even years later, in 1947, women enrolled in American Bar Association-approved law schools constituted only three percent of all law students.<sup>17</sup>) During her years as a student Tilghman

---

<sup>12</sup> Gantt, 15 Jan. 1969, 1.

<sup>13</sup> Payne, 17.

<sup>14</sup> Gantt, 15 Jan. 1969, 2.

<sup>15</sup> *Ibid.*, 3.

<sup>16</sup> Payne, 22.

<sup>17</sup> Gita Wilder and Bruce Weingarter, ed. *Databook on Women in Law School and in the Legal Profession* (Newton: Law School Admissions Council, 2003), 50.

was very involved in women's organizations on campus; she was one of "sixty-four members of the Women's Legal Club, dedicated to the promotion of a high standard of professional ethics and the preparation of women students for a fully and worthy participation in the American system of self-government," and a member of her school's women's legal fraternity, Kappa Beta Pi.<sup>18</sup> Although she never personally felt discrimination as a woman, as a member of these groups she continually advocated equality between men and women at the university.<sup>19</sup>

In order to finance her study of law Tilghman applied for a position as a police officer in the District of Columbia.<sup>20</sup> Only nine years after Alice S. Wells of Los Angeles became the first American policewoman, Tilghman joined the force.<sup>21</sup> Many women had fought to join the force as "part of a social movement with a special mission... to reshape their place in society and alter society's major social institutions, as part of a social crusade tied to larger reforms." Their goal was to "'save' wayward youth and helpless women from the evils of industrialism, alcohol, and other abuses."<sup>22</sup> A main reason for this goal was the "girl problem" that arose in the late 19<sup>th</sup> and early 20<sup>th</sup> centuries. Premarital pregnancy was on the rise, from 12.6 percent of all pregnancies between 1841 and 1880, to 24.4 percent between 1881 and 1910. Women sought to join the

---

<sup>18</sup> Ibid.

<sup>19</sup> Gantt, 15 Jan. 1969, 2.

<sup>20</sup> Ibid.

<sup>21</sup> Susan Ehrlich Martin, *Breaking and Entering Police Woman on Patrol* (Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1980), 21.

<sup>22</sup> Ibid, 21-22.

police force, in part, to “clean up” the sexual rebellion taking place during the Progressive Era.<sup>23</sup> Tilghman’s work as a police officer reflects these original goals: “It was a matter of patrolling the cafes and the dance halls and skating rinks to see that there were no girls who should be taken into custody.”<sup>24</sup> Later Tilghman looked back in irony on her career as a police officer: “This was before women had the right to vote... So the women leaders who were trying to get women the right to vote picketed the White House while I was there, and I was one of those assigned to see that there was no disorder.”<sup>25</sup> Tilghman found herself patrolling the morality of young women and controlling women demanding their voice through the vote, when she herself supported women’s freedom and right to vote.

Attending law school at night and policing Washington D.C. during the day, Tilghman was distinct from other contemporary women’s lives. She had separated from the norm and would later —as a politician, lawyer, and judge— break barriers for all women.

A month before graduation, 13 May 1922, Tilghman married George Ernest Hughes Jr. After law school the couple moved to Texas, George’s home state. Sarah Hughes became very passionate about Texas politics. The couple “roomed and boarded with a family who belonged to the Ku Klux Klan,” and after this face-to-face experience with racism she decided to campaign for any candidates who were anti-Klan. This

---

<sup>23</sup> Janis Appier, *Policing Women* (Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 1998), 25.

<sup>24</sup> Gantt, 15 Jan. 1969, 3.

<sup>25</sup> Ibid.

marked the beginning of Hughes's involvement in Texas politics.<sup>26</sup> In Dallas the Klan had a stronghold as a political party: "all public officials were Klansmen."<sup>27</sup> Hughes's dedication to remove the racist political party from politics was an ambitious goal, but it was the goal that would keep her in politics fighting for equality for many years to come.

Upon receiving the right to vote, Hughes was one of the many women to become more politically active. "Beyond suffrage and the first trickle of women into elective office, the political achievements of public womanhood at the local and state level were extraordinary during the Progressive period."<sup>28</sup> Hughes was very active in women's groups and in Texas's political scene.

In her first seven years in Dallas, Hughes campaigned for democratic candidates in "every" election.<sup>29</sup> Her speeches were mostly to "get the women's vote" for her candidates.<sup>30</sup> She was a member of the League of Women Voters, the American Association of University Women, the Business Professional Women's Club, and the Zonta Club, a "classified club of business and professional women." Women's clubs like these were an avenue by which many upper class women got involved in politics. By joining clubs, women were able to step farther out of the domestic sphere and into the public eye, out from the margins and into the center of

---

<sup>26</sup> Gantt, 15 Jan. 1969, 6.

<sup>27</sup> Ibid.

<sup>28</sup> Matthews, 174.

<sup>29</sup> Gantt, 15 Jan. 1969, 7.

<sup>30</sup> Frantz, 2-3.



## “We Must Get into the Arena”

109

progressive social reform.<sup>31</sup> Hughes encouraged women to vote for democratic candidates, to get involved in politics, and to run for public office.

As a white, educated, middle-class woman, Hughes was privileged to be a member of women's clubs and promote civil rights. She recognized the importance of equality for racial minorities. However, the social changes she desired were not going to occur if politics did not change. Hughes decided to go beyond campaigning for others in order to create the social changes in which she so passionately believed. She said, “That's the way you have to do. These women who just think they're going to get things by sitting back and waiting for them are wrong! You've got to work for things. You can't get them by just sitting back and waiting.”<sup>32</sup> In 1930, Hughes ran for a seat in the Texas Legislature.

During her campaign she experienced some opposition from both women and men because she was a woman stepping into uncharted public territory. In 1921 there were thirty-three women in state legislatures –and approximately 10,000 men. Ten years later, women like Hughes were still a minority in politics.<sup>33</sup> Criticized because of her sex Hughes faced tough competition. A telling incident during her

---

<sup>31</sup> Kathryn Kish Sklar, “Differences in the Political Cultures of Men and Women Reformers During the Progressive Era,” *Major Problems in American Women's History*, ed. Mary Beth Norton and Ruth M. Alexander, 3<sup>rd</sup> ed. (Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 2003), 271.

<sup>32</sup> Sarah T. Hughes interview by Ronald E. Marcello (Marcello), 23 Aug. 1979. Interview 489 transcript, NTOHC, Dallas, Tx. 28.

<sup>33</sup> Matthews, 174.

campaign occurred when she was shaking hands with a young woman, saying she hoped the young woman would vote for her. The young woman replied, "Indeed, no, I won't. You shake hands too hard."<sup>34</sup> The idea of a woman in public office was extremely unfamiliar. Most women had internalized the societal prescriptions and remained within the domestic sphere. In a subsequent political campaign her male opponent gave a speech and said, in response to Hughes, that he would "slap her in the face and send her back to the kitchen," and the crowd "simply went wild."<sup>35</sup> Despite the widespread prejudices, Hughes was elected in 1931.

Hughes was a dedicated public servant. Coming into the predominately male world of politics, Hughes joined three other females in the Texas legislature—two representatives and a senator. These four women in the House for the 41<sup>st</sup> session would be among only six women to serve throughout the 1930s.<sup>36</sup> Her goal was simple: "be a good legislator."<sup>37</sup> She achieved this by facing the problems of the time, representing the people, and also pushing legislation in which she was politically invested. The majority of the problems the state faced at this time were economic: "thousands of people were out of work" and there was no "state welfare."<sup>38</sup> Hughes spent most of her time opposing "bad" legislation rather than promoting what she considered good legislation.<sup>39</sup> She was dedicated to serving the public and promoting

---

<sup>34</sup> Gantt, 15 Jan. 1969, 13.

<sup>35</sup> Ibid, 14.

<sup>36</sup> Payne, 48.

<sup>37</sup> Gantt, 15 Jan. 1969, 18.

<sup>38</sup> Ibid, 17.

<sup>39</sup> Ibid, 19.

## “We Must Get into the Arena”

111

what she thought to be in the people’s best interest.

When Hughes was asked what she considered to be her most important contributions as a member of the Texas House of Representatives, she responded, “my opposition to the West Texas Land Bills.” These bills would have “taken more and more of the permanent school land away from the state,” giving it to “either oil companies or land owners.”<sup>40</sup> Hughes’s “hardest fight” was getting the state income tax bill approved.<sup>41</sup> The majority of the legislation Hughes worked for was social welfare legislation.<sup>42</sup> This general interest allowed Hughes to act as a feminist. She “introduced a bill ... to make the acknowledgement of a married woman the same as that of a single woman or of a man.”<sup>43</sup> Although it was not introduced immediately, in 1934 Hughes was also the co-author of the constitutional amendment giving women the right to serve on juries. Disappointed when it did not progress in that session, she nevertheless understood that “legislation of that kind takes a long, long time before it can finally be adopted.”<sup>44</sup> She also brought the status of women equal to men in divorce cases and in the workplace. She introduced a bill that would require either parent to support children in the case of a divorce, and also introduced a minimum wage law for women (to match the existing minimum wage law for men).<sup>45</sup> During her career as a legislator Hughes was dedicated to serving the people who elected her, but

---

<sup>40</sup> Ibid, 20.

<sup>41</sup> Ibid, 21.

<sup>42</sup> Ibid, 22.

<sup>43</sup> Ibid, 23.

<sup>44</sup> Ibid, 23.

<sup>45</sup> Ibid, 24.

she was also dedicated to advancing the position of all American women.

Hughes continued to pave the way for women: in 1935, Sarah Hughes was the first woman to be appointed state district judge in Texas. As a state district judge, Hughes tried a wide variety of cases, except for criminal cases; the majority concerned divorce, automobile collisions, and workers' compensation. Hughes recognized her ability to impact the lives of individuals and make positive change. She deemed juvenile cases as the "most important to her," because "you might be able to change the life of a delinquent if you actually worked at it hard enough and if you had the cooperation—and we generally did—of the Probation Department."<sup>46</sup> The power of knowing you "had the life of a child in your hands and it was up to you to try to decide what would ultimately be best for the child" at times worried Hughes, but ultimately the possibility of positively changing one life continued to drive her career.<sup>47</sup> To Hughes changing individual lives was a form of bettering society as a whole. Her career remained focused on social welfare issues.

As a judge, Hughes was breaking barriers for women, and she did not stop there. She continued to be a presence in the political realm and in the public eye. During her time as a state district judge Hughes continued to advocate for an increased presence of women on juries. The constitutional amendment she coauthored during her time in the Texas legislature remained a priority to Hughes. The Business and Professional Women's Club, of which Hughes was an

---

<sup>46</sup> Gantt, 28 Feb. 1969, 3.

<sup>47</sup> Ibid.

## “We Must Get into the Arena”

113

active member, adopted the bill as one of its legislative projects. The bill did not get passed, but again Hughes did not get discouraged.<sup>48</sup> In her words, the opposition felt that “it [the jury] wasn’t any place for women. Women were subject to their emotions too much, and they would have to change all the facilities at the court house... it would cost too much. They [women] were needed at home.”<sup>49</sup> Hughes recognized that her bill did not fit societal norms. People would have to become accustomed to this new idea before they accepted it. She worked to form a state committee consisting of both men and women to get voters familiar with the idea of women serving on juries. She also reached out to many bigger women’s organizations, such as the General Federation of Women’s Clubs, Parent and Teacher’s Association, and League of Women Voters, successfully organizing people behind these portions of the women’s movement in Texas.<sup>50</sup> In 1953 her dedication and determination paid off: the bill finally passed. Again, Hughes’s presence in the public eye and her dedication to the feminist movement advanced the position of women in society, and gave them a stronger voice.

Drawing national attention to the need for women in public office, Hughes was endorsed at the Democratic National Convention as a vice presidential candidate in 1952. The Business and Professional Women’s Club raised funds and organized for women to be nominated in both democratic and republican conventions: Senator Margaret Chase Smith for the

---

<sup>48</sup> Ibid, 4.

<sup>49</sup> Ibid, 4-5.

<sup>50</sup> Ibid, 4.

Republicans and Judge Sarah T. Hughes for the Democrats.<sup>51</sup> Hughes admitted, "I am not so naïve as to believe that this year there will be a woman Vice President, but we must get into the arena."<sup>52</sup> Hughes continually encouraged women to get involved in politics and government: "Women have the right to vote, the right to serve on juries in all but six states and the legal right to hold public office, but even these gains do not make them full citizens. Their lack of real influence in government is demonstrated by the few women holding public office."<sup>53</sup> Her nomination as vice president symbolized her strong belief that in order for women to achieve equality, they needed to be a part of the political system that governed their lives. She said, "[Women] care, but not enough," and urged that women become 'full citizens' of the nation, not only in the privileges granted to them but in the use made of those privileges."<sup>54</sup> Hughes spoke mainly on behalf of white women who were recognized as full citizens. However, she added: "All legal discrimination must be removed." She advocated the passage of the Equal Rights Amendment and its inclusion in the platforms of the two major parties.<sup>55</sup> She believed, "Women must be accepted by men as full partners,'... To do this ... they must create favorable public opinion on the contribution that women can make as 'co-pilots' and not 'back seat drivers.'"<sup>56</sup> By stepping into the

---

<sup>51</sup> Ibid, 26.

<sup>52</sup> Emma Harrison, "2 Women Endorsed For Vice President," *New York Times*, 1 July 1952, 15.

<sup>53</sup> Ibid.

<sup>54</sup> Ibid.

<sup>55</sup> Ibid.

<sup>56</sup> Ibid.

## “We Must Get into the Arena”

115

political arena in this way, which was unfamiliar for women, Hughes hoped that women would recognize what it means to be “full citizens” and become part of government and policy making.

Sara Hughes hoped to be an example to other women capable of holding political office. She also asserted that to be recognized as human and full citizens meant more than just equality in the law. She challenged the ideas of equity feminism, which holds that women should have full legal equality with men and once that is achieved nothing more should be demanded.<sup>57</sup> Hughes knew the importance of legal equality, but believed that until women were represented in government, giving them a real voice in the decisions that impact their communities, they would not achieved their equality.

While her work during this time was directed primarily towards encouraging women to run for government offices and be involved in politics, Hughes’s judicial work also continued to impact many American women. In January 1961 Hughes was appointed as the Federal District Judge for the Northern District of Texas, once again breaking barriers as a woman. She credited her appointment to her political affiliation with Vice President Lyndon B. Johnson, Texas Senator Ralph W. Yarborough, and Texas Congressman Sam Rayburn, underplaying her own accomplishments. She recalled a car ride in Dallas with President John F. Kennedy and Vice President Lyndon Johnson. “Mr. Johnson... said to Mr. Kennedy, ‘Now here is a woman you should appoint when you

---

<sup>57</sup> Martha Nussbaum, *Sex and Social Justice* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1999), 132.

have the opportunity to some position.”<sup>58</sup> Being an active woman in politics, Hughes took advantage of her connections to in order to become appointed. However, she also credited “work of the Business and Professional Women Clubs.”<sup>59</sup> By being an active face in the political sphere Hughes was recognized on the national level and promoted to a federal judgeship.

As a federal judge, Hughes presided over cases that continue to impact the lives of American women. In *Shultz v. Brookhaven General Hospital*, the Court addressed a situation in which male “orderlies” were paid more than females “aides.” The males were not superiors in merit, education or seniority. Their work was equal to the women’s in skill, effort, responsibility and performed under similar working conditions.<sup>60</sup> Hughes concluded, “The pattern of sex based wage discriminations evidenced in this case is prohibited by the Equal Pay Act.”<sup>61</sup> The term “Equal’ as used in the Equal Pay Act of 1963 does not mean identical, but that insubstantial differences in the skill, effort and responsibility requirements of particular jobs should be ignored. The job requirements are to be viewed as a whole.”<sup>62</sup> Brookhaven General Hospital was guilty of “violating the provisions of ... the Act and from withholding payment of minimum wage compensation due employees under the Act.”<sup>63</sup> Hughes again mandated

---

<sup>58</sup> Frantz, 5.

<sup>59</sup> Ibid, 13.

<sup>60</sup> *Shultz v. Brookhaven General Hospital*, 305 F. Supp. 424 (1969). Legal Research, LexisNexis Academic, <<http://www.lexisnexis.com/us/lnacademic/>>.

<sup>61</sup> Ibid.

<sup>62</sup> Ibid.

<sup>63</sup> Ibid.



## “We Must Get into the Arena”

117

that women be treated equally in comparison with their male coworkers. Gender was not a basis for discrimination.

The case that Hughes would later recognize as her most important case nationally was *Roe v. Wade*. This case declared unconstitutional the Texas abortion law, which provided that a woman could have an abortion only if her life was endangered.<sup>64</sup> Hughes concluded, “The fundamental right of single women and married persons to choose whether to have children is protected by the Ninth Amendment, through the Fourteenth Amendment. The Texas Abortion Laws infringe upon this right.”<sup>65</sup> The court faced a controversial debate about a woman’s control over her own body. The outcome:

The court found that the Texas Abortion Laws unconstitutionally vague and overbroad, the laws violated the fundamental right of women to choose whether to have children, and the state failed to show that the Texas Abortion Laws were necessary to support a compelling state interest. The court dismissed the married complaint and the application for injunction.<sup>66</sup>

Hughes, along with the two other judges on this case, made a decision that continues to impact women in the United States. Before the case Hughes was in

---

<sup>64</sup> Marcello, 23 Aug 1979, 16.

<sup>65</sup> *Roe v. Wade*, 314 F. Supp. 1217 (1970). Legal Research, LexisNexis Academic, <<http://www.lexisnexus.com/us/lnacademic/>>.

<sup>66</sup> *Ibid.*

favor of permitting abortion.<sup>67</sup> Through the power of the court, Hughes ensured that this “privilege” remained. Hughes later said, “It was just unconstitutional, that’s all. It was a privilege for a woman to decide what she wanted to do, and it was an invasion of that privilege.”<sup>68</sup> Hughes’s action on the bench made symbolic statements about a woman’s role in government, but she also influenced major decisions that changed the way women’s day-to-day lives were lived.

As a judge, Hughes was able to influence cases that had an impact on all Americans. Of the 412 federal judgeships in 1965, only three positions were held by women, including Judge Hughes.<sup>69</sup> As a female judge, she was clearly an exception, but she utilized her rare position in politics to improve social welfare, particularly for women, and ensure that these protections were integrated into the law. *Shultz v. Bookhaven General Hospital*, and *Roe v. Wade* are only two of the many cases over which Hughes presided that improved social conditions for women. Her legal philosophy, as she explained it, was not “interested in the technical aspects of law. I am in [interested] the way it affects human beings,” which is illustrated by the types of cases over which she presided.<sup>70</sup> Although Hughes believed women needed more than legal equality and recognition, her work as a judge enabled her to ensure that this minimum requirement for equality was upheld.

---

<sup>67</sup> Marcello, 23 Aug. 1979, 17.

<sup>68</sup> Ibid, 18.

<sup>69</sup> “Her Honor Takes the Bench.”

<sup>70</sup> LaForte, 4.

## “We Must Get into the Arena”

119

Judge Sarah T. Hughes was an exceptional woman of her time, and used her legal position to improve the status of American women. Influenced by her family as a young girl, she took an interest in politics, an interest that would drive her career. When she made the decision to continue her education at law school, her rejection of a career as a teacher in order to search for something more symbolized her divergence from prescribed societal norms. Once Hughes began breaking barriers as a woman, she encouraged other women to do the same.

Hughes recalled her term within the Texas legislature as the most important time in her career. She was dedicated to listening to the voice of the people, and she strongly encouraged all citizens to voice their opinions and become involved in politics. She pressed women to pursue the changes they demanded, by becoming feminists and working to improve social conditions. She defied the norms by being a woman in politics. She dedicated her career to listening, but knew that unless women were also working to make their voices heard they would not be represented in politics. She was an example of her own message: she became active within politics and vocalized her concerns; she was able to get elected and make significant changes.

Already breaking barriers by becoming an elected official, it was Hughes's work as a judge that had the greatest impact on American women on a whole. Hughes ruled in cases based on principles that continue to be debated: whether or not women have the right to control their reproduction and whether equal women's work is deserving of pay equal to their male counterparts. Hughes asserted women's rights and

their autonomous power as individuals. She was a legal visionary and her rulings continue to be relevant.

As a politician and judge Sarah T. Hughes fought to improve social welfare for all, a goal that could not be accomplished without working to eradicate both racism and sexism. She called to members of society who wanted change, specifically women, to voice their demands. "We must get into the arena!" she demanded. Hughes was a major player within political arena. Her life, career as a legislator, and work as a judge illustrate how one woman can model for others how to break barriers and advance feminism in the United States.

*Emma Nagengast is a senior History major at Santa Clara University. Her area of study is American history.*

Supreme Court to the Basketball Court 121

## From the Supreme Court to the Basketball Court: The Achievements and Limitations of the Racial Integration of College Sports

Carolyn Linck

---

“[Sports] offer...people something to pay attention to that’s of no importance. That keeps them from worrying about...things that matter to their lives.”<sup>1</sup> With these words social commentator Norm Chomsky summed up the beliefs of many Americans who find sports to be trivial, a superficial aspect of society that is not worthy of serious study or consideration. Politics, economics, religion, literature, art – these are the things, according to critics like Chomsky, that bring true value to society. The history of the racial integration of collegiate athletics, however, proves that sports can play an enormously important role in shaping society’s culture and values for the better. With an African American leading the United States in 2009, it is astonishing that a mere forty-seven years earlier, blacks, by virtue of their race, were not considered intelligent enough to play point guard for a basketball team or skilled enough to quarterback a football squad. Throughout the 1960s, blacks were considered by many Southerners to be unworthy opponents for white teams. “Name one field of endeavor that has

---

<sup>1</sup> Free Republic. *Chomsky on Sports*.

<<http://www.freerepublic.com/focus/f-news/1333247/posts>>  
accessed 10 March 2009.

been taken over by Negroes and succeeded. Name one!” was the angry challenge of a *Jackson* [Mississippi] *Daily News* editorial in 1961 on the subject of racially integrating athletics.<sup>2</sup> For many whites, the idea of associating with black people in any way was detestable, dangerous, and to be avoided at all costs. The landmark 1954 Supreme Court decision, *Brown v. Board of Education*, however, forced the South to undergo the slow and painful process of integration. It would take years – not until the early 1970s – before Southern collegiate sports were truly integrated.

The racist and exclusionary policies employed by Southern universities from 1954 to 1972 were – as such practices always are – detrimental to black and white athletes alike. All-white teams struggled to create schedules that were competitive and would keep them in the national limelight but did not interfere with policies of segregation. Several of these teams were prohibited from post-season play because of their refusal to face teams with black players. Eventually, all-white teams were at a competitive disadvantage. On the other hand, for years black athletes were excluded from competition completely or forced to play for either historically black institutions in the South or integrated universities in the North or West. Even on integrated teams, black athletes faced enormous obstacles on predominantly white campuses: discrimination, harassment, negative stereotyping, and isolation. Some were barred from road trips to Southern universities, forced to sit out games, or required to

---

<sup>2</sup> Frank Fitzpatrick, *And the Walls Came Tumbling Down: Kentucky, Texas Western, and the Game That Changed American Sports* (New York: Simon & Schuster, 1999), 45.

## Supreme Court to the Basketball Court 123

stay in different hotels and eat in different restaurants than their white teammates. Often black athletes were targets of vicious taunts and threatening hate mail, told whom they could date, relegated to play only in particular positions, or denied playing time based on the racial makeup of their team. Over the course of nearly two decades, several events – including the 1966 NCAA Championship game between Texas Western and the University of Kentucky, and the 1970 college football opener between the University of Southern California and the University of Alabama – helped to change attitudes and policies, eventually leading to the racial integration of Southern collegiate athletics and to the betterment of American sport and society as a whole.

Athletic integration has been a favorite topic of scholars, with significant contributions coming from the fields of history and sociology. There is a vast amount of literature on the exclusionary policies of Southern universities' athletic programs and the effects of those policies on athletes of both races. In their 1984 article, "The Arrival and Ascendence of Black Athletes in the Southeastern Conference, 1966-1980," Joan Paul, Richard V. McGhee, and Helen Fant masterfully detail the slow process through which black athletes came to play in the SEC. Dana Brooks and Ronald Althouse provide an excellent overview of problems pertaining to race in college sports in *Racism In College Athletics: The African-American Athlete's Experience* (1993). Frank Fitzpatrick's 1999, *And The Walls Came Tumbling Down: Kentucky, Texas Western, and the Game That Changed American Sports*, highlights the social significance of the 1966 NCAA Championship game and details the game's key players and

coaches. Finally, David K. Wiggin's 1997, *Glory Bound: Black Athletes in a White America*, sheds light on the experiences and mistreatment of African-American athletes at predominately white universities and follows their involvement in the Civil Rights movement. This paper will explain the process through which color barriers were broken in collegiate football and basketball in the South over a period of eighteen years, beginning in 1954, with the *Brown v. Board of Education* decision, and ending in 1972 when all ten SEC teams had at least one varsity athlete of color. It will show that the integration of Southern athletic teams contributed to the betterment of the universities, teams, surrounding communities, black and white athletes alike, and America as a whole. It will also show, however, that the process of integration was by no means simple or painless: problems of discrimination, harassment, stereotyping, and bigotry persisted even after blacks were added to athletic rosters.

College basketball and football teams in the South in 1954 were lily-white, containing no black players or coaching staff. Until the early 1960s, maintaining the status quo of athletic segregation appeared to be practical and beneficial to these universities and their sports programs. Indeed, several Southern universities enjoyed remarkable successes with all-white teams up to the mid 1960s. The University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill won the 1957 NCAA Men's Division I Basketball Championship, and the University of Kentucky won the same title the following year in 1958 – both with all-white squads. The dominance of segregated teams was even more pronounced in college football: Auburn University won the national



## Supreme Court to the Basketball Court 125

title in 1957, Louisiana State University in 1958, and the University of Alabama won at least a share of the national crown (achieved by ending the season ranked number one in either the AP Writers or the Coaches poll) in 1961, 1964, and 1965 without any black players.<sup>3</sup> Proponents of segregation pointed to this success on the athletic field as proof of white supremacy, maintaining that integration was undesirable and unnecessary: "A few myopic individuals even confidently predicted that the inclusion of black athletes would add little or nothing to a team's strength."<sup>4</sup> Once this illusion began to dissipate, however, it soon became clear that segregation was hurting Southern athletics in a variety of ways.

Beginning in the 1940s, talented black players were leaving the South in increasing numbers to play at integrated universities in the North and West. Eventually, this put Southern teams at a competitive disadvantage by vastly constricting their recruitment pool. For the most part, the effects of this were felt in basketball earlier than football. For instance, the University of San Francisco won back-to-back NCAA Championships in basketball in 1955 and 1956 with six black players, including future Celtics legend, Bill Russell.<sup>5</sup> Like talented black athletes, some white players opted to attend integrated schools as well. During his push for integration at the University of

---

<sup>3</sup> Allen Barra, "Bear Bryant's Biggest Score," *The Magazine of African-American History*, (Winter 2006): 58-64.

<sup>4</sup> Charles H. Martin, "Jim Crow in the Gymnasium: The Integration of College Basketball in the American South," *The International Journal of the History of Sport* 10, no. 1 (April 1993): 69.

<sup>5</sup> Fitzpatrick, 61.

Alabama, football coach Paul “Bear” Bryant insisted, “segregation was costing Alabama the top white talent as well.”<sup>6</sup>

By the mid 1960s segregation was beginning to have athletic as well as social implications. Teams from the Deep South that refused to play schools with black athletes were unattractive nationally and received less respect because their schedules were perceived as easier than teams who faced all comers, regardless of race. Again, the 1966 University of Alabama football team illustrates the point perfectly: coming off of back-to-back national titles and going undefeated, the Crimson Tide finished the season ranked behind Notre Dame and Michigan State, both of whom had lost once and tied a game.<sup>7</sup> Playing a regional, strictly segregated schedule was hurting Alabama’s reputation as a football powerhouse. The University of Kentucky’s basketball team, the Northern-most team in the SEC, fell on the opposite end of the spectrum. This team demonstrated that playing quality, integrated competition lead to national clout. Head coach Adolph Rupp chose to play against teams with black players, earning his program national acclaim. Rupp pointed to his team’s difficult schedule as a sign of its superiority over other members of the Southeastern Conference: “We play teams from the Big Ten and the Missouri Valley Conference who have Negro boys who can jump a mile...and we hold our own.”<sup>8</sup>

Aside from being seen as weaker by the national

---

<sup>6</sup> Barra, 59.

<sup>7</sup> Ibid.

<sup>8</sup> Fitzpatrick, 46.

## Supreme Court to the Basketball Court 127

audience, there were logistical problems associated with playing exclusively against other segregated teams. These problems arose in the post-season, when Southern teams could no longer select their opponents. Controversy arose over the 1956 Sugar Bowl at which all-white Georgia Tech was invited to play the integrated University of Pittsburg. Georgia Governor Marvin Griffin loudly protested the matchup, saying, "The South stands at Armageddon," and that he saw no difference in "compromising the integrity of race on the playing field than doing so in the classrooms."<sup>9</sup> Another controversy over post-season play involved the Mississippi State University basketball team. Mississippi State's all-white team, winners of the SEC championships, turned down invitations to the 1959, 1961, and 1962 NCAA tournaments because of the state's staunch segregationist policies. In 1959 Mississippi State head coach "Babe" McCarthy indicated his approval: "As a real segregationist bred in Mississippi...I would not want to jeopardize the segregationist cause in my state."<sup>10</sup> After three years of sitting out the post season, however, Mississippi State fans, students, alumni, and players were frustrated enough to challenge the state's politicians and play in the NCAA tournament. Still, some remained vehemently opposed to playing in the post-season if that meant facing African Americans. An editorial in the Jackson *Clarion-Ledger* warned, "We play integrated

---

<sup>9</sup> John Sayle Watterson, *College Football*, (Baltimore: The John Hopkins University Press, 2000), 316-17.

<sup>10</sup> Russell J. Henderson, "The 1963 Mississippi State University Basketball Controversy and the Repeal of the Unwritten Law: 'Something More Than the Game Will Be Lost,'" *The Journal of Southern History* 4 (November 1997): 835.

teams abroad – next we play integrated teams at home, – next we recruit Negro stars to strengthen our teams, – and the fast cycle of integration is completed.”<sup>11</sup> Nevertheless, even Coach McCarthy changed his position in 1963: “It makes me heart sick to think that these players, who just clinched no worse than a tie for their third straight Southeastern Conference championship, will have to put away their uniforms and not complete in the NCAA tournament.”<sup>12</sup> In a bold move, McCarthy ultimately defied an injunction by Mississippi state legislators and took his team to the NCAA tournament where it lost to Loyola of Chicago – a team with four black starters.<sup>13</sup> Clearly, policies of segregation were adversely effecting Southern universities’ ability to compete at the highest level nationally.

One game in 1966 crystallized this fact, forever changing the face of college athletics in America. On 19 March 1966, Don Haskins, head coach of Texas Western, started five African-American players in the NCAA Championship basketball game against Adolph Rupp’s all-white University of Kentucky team. Texas Western beat Kentucky seventy-two to sixty-five. The significance was lost on no one. Texas Western had defied all prevailing racist stereotypes and conventional wisdom. Many people still believed that in order to win, a team still needed at least a few white players for strategy and leadership on the court. According to the stereotypes, “blacks weren’t disciplined enough. They weren’t mentally tough. They didn’t have heart...At least one white was required...to provide

---

<sup>11</sup> Ibid., 828.

<sup>12</sup> Ibid., 831-32.

<sup>13</sup> Fitzpatrick, 49.

## Supreme Court to the Basketball Court 129

stability and discipline.”<sup>14</sup> Ignoring these notions, external pressure, and malicious comments from bigots, Haskins started his five best players and ultimately changed the country. The integration of Southern basketball teams came on the heels of his team’s performance. As historian Charles Martin notes, “It was quite clear after March 1966 that Southern basketball teams would have to change or become increasingly noncompetitive nationally.”<sup>15</sup> The following year Perry Wallace became the first African American to play basketball in the Southeastern Conference, joining Vanderbilt University’s team. The barrier had officially been broken in men’s basketball.

The effects of the 1966 NCAA Championship game were also felt in football. In 1967 Nat Northington became the first black football player in the SEC, playing for the University of Kentucky. Football, however, proved to be more resistant to change than basketball, as teams from the Deep South like Mississippi and Alabama remained segregated for several years. Though not as symbolically rich as the Texas Western and Kentucky championship game, the 1970 season opener between the University of Southern California (USC) and the University of Alabama stands out as a final turning point for the integration of collegiate football. Bear Bryant, who had been trying unsuccessfully to integrate his team for years, personally invited John McKay’s USC Trojans to open the season at Alabama. USC’s black running back, Sam Cunningham, ran all over Alabama’s defense, scoring three touchdowns. The Trojans crushed the Crimson

---

<sup>14</sup> Ibid., 26.

<sup>15</sup> Ibid., 28.

Tide forty-two to twenty-one in front of a sold-out, all-white, Birmingham crowd. Unwilling to accept mediocrity and finally realizing the athletic disadvantage the team faced by excluding African Americans, Alabama added its first black player, Wilbur Jackson, the following year. In the words of Bear Bryant, Sam Cunningham “did more to integrate Alabama in one afternoon than Martin Luther King had in years.”<sup>16</sup> By 1972, just nine years after Alabama Governor George Wallace famously blocked the doorway of the University of Alabama to black students Vivian Malone and James Hood, all ten SEC schools had integrated football and basketball teams.<sup>17</sup>

Unfortunately, being added to the team was only the first battle in the war for full acceptance. Even after the teams were integrated, black football and basketball players at predominately white universities faced enormous social and athletic problems. They were the victims of discrimination all over campus, from other students, faculty and staff members, and fans at games both home and away. Basketball players from University of Texas El Paso (formerly Texas Western of 1966 Championship fame) spoke out about prejudice and isolation at their school. Black players complained that athletic director, George

---

<sup>16</sup> Barra, 58-64.

<sup>17</sup> Joan Paul, Richard V. McGhee, and Helen Fant, “The Arrival and Ascendence of Black Athletes in the Southeastern Conference, 1966-1980,” *Phylon: The Atlanta University Review of Race and Culture* 45, no. 4 (Winter 1984): 287.

## Supreme Court to the Basketball Court 131

McCarty, referred to them as “niggers.”<sup>18</sup> In addition they were told whom they could date, since interracial dating was still extremely controversial. UTEP football coach told *Sports Illustrated* in 1968, “I wouldn’t advise interracial dating...I don’t know what I’d do if I had a Negro athlete going with a white girl and he wouldn’t stop.”<sup>19</sup> These problems, along with being isolated from the larger community and continuously stereotyped as ignorant, stupid, and lazy, were the main social grievances of black athletes at the University of Texas El Paso and across the country.

There were also a number of athletic problems facing black players on integrated teams. One – racial stacking of positions – was the consequence of ongoing negative stereotypes. Stacking was the result of black athletes being seen as suited to play only particular positions: the ones that required pure athleticism rather than intellect. It excluded them from playing quarterback or linebacker in football or point guard in basketball because these positions ostensibly entailed more responsibility, leadership, and intelligence than they could handle.<sup>20</sup> In addition, many integrated teams used quotas, restricting the number of blacks who could play at any given time. “Even at the most liberal colleges, basketball coaches observed strict racial quotas. The whispered motto for many of them

---

<sup>18</sup> Jack Olsen, “In An Alien World,” *Sports Illustrated*, 15 July 1968, SI Vault, <  
<http://vault.sportsillustrated.cnn.com/vault/article/magazine/MAG1081383/index.htm>> accessed 15 Jan. 2009.

<sup>19</sup> Ibid.

<sup>20</sup> Dana Brooks and Ronald Althouse, eds., *Racism In College Athletics: The African-American Athlete’s Experience* (Morgantown: Fitness Information Technology, 1993), 61.

was: "Two blacks at home. Three on the road. And four when behind."<sup>21</sup>

Another problem was racial tension on integrated teams, both on and off the field. Despite the best efforts and intentions on both sides, long-term racial differences often led to uncomfortable and awkward relations between teammates. As one black athlete explained to *Sports Illustrated*, "We get sick of going over to sit with the whites...We go over and sit with them and right away the whole atmosphere changes. Invariably there'll be one who thinks that the way to be friendly with us is to tell the latest 'nigger' joke...The whites all laugh to show how relaxed they are, and we choke on our Wheaties."<sup>22</sup>

African Americans' fight for civil rights and inclusion from 1954 to 1972 took place in every aspect of society – including on the college football field and basketball court. Some of the fiercest battles for equality took place in the sports arena. For black football and basketball players, this could mean a variety of things. Some black athletes only wanted to compete against white teams. Others wanted to play on the same team with white players. Some longed for the recognition and playing time they deserved, and still others demanded better treatment from members of the community and university for which they had been recruited to represent. In stark contrast, many white Southerners viewed athletics as the final stronghold for segregation – a place where race mixing

---

<sup>21</sup> Fitzpatrick, 24-25.

<sup>22</sup> Jack Olson, "Pride and Prejudice," *Sports Illustrated*, 8 July 1968, SI Vault, < <http://vault.sportsillustrated.cnn.com/vault/article/magazine/MAG1081353/index.htm> > accessed 15 Jan. 2009.



## Supreme Court to the Basketball Court 133

should never be tolerated. What these racist individuals finally came to realize, however, was that excluding blacks was detrimental to their teams and universities. Through tumultuous social events and watershed performances in key NCAA match-ups by several courageous pioneers, the walls of athletic segregation cracked and eventually crumbled. By 1972 all major Southern universities had black athletes on their rosters. Athletic integration, though fiercely opposed and accompanied by painful and ugly incidents, represents an important shift in racial attitudes in the South and highlights the power of sport in American history.

*Carolyn Linck is a sophomore undergraduate at Santa Clara University double majoring in History and Communication. She is a member of the University Honors Program and a Distinguished Scholar at Entry. Her paper "From the Supreme Court to the Basketball Court: The Achievements and Limitations of the Racial Integration of College Sports" received the Santa Clara University Department of History Redwood Prize, given for best essay on a historical subject.*

## Saffron, Spice and Everything Nice?: A Study of Women in *Hindutva*

Deepti Shenoy

---

### Introduction

The Hindu Nationalist Movement, or *Hindutva*, a traditionally masculine bastion, has been subject to a quiet but significant assault on its core philosophy. Interestingly, this attack has come from within the movement, in the form of a near insurgency. Women have penetrated its ranks and carved unique niches for themselves and have started focusing on creating a more inclusive agenda. Women in *Hindutva* catapulted themselves into positions of power within the movement in the 1990s, and this has significantly changed the face of the movement. Though the transformation into a democratic and feminist *Hindutva* is far from complete, women have made their mark and helped to chart a positive course for its ideology.

*Hindutva* begins with the belief that India has always been and should be a Hindu *rashtra*, or nation. It is firmly rooted in the conviction that citizens of India must accept a cultural, if not religious Hinduism. This explicitly religious affiliation has often led leaders of the *Hindutva* movement to adopt fundamentalist, or anti-feminist, stances on women's issues.<sup>1</sup> Scholars have underlined many instances of the movement

---

<sup>1</sup> Ram Puniyani, "Degrading Women," *The Times of India*, 9 September 1999.

Saffron, Spice and Everything Nice? 135

herding women into particular, limited, roles.<sup>2</sup> At first glance, one may understandably wonder what would lead women to accept such an ideology.

Feminist scholars have both documented the extensive participation of women in organizations that subscribe to *Hindutva* ideology and, in many cases, voiced their belief that this participation is not empowering for women. To quote Meera Sehgal, paramilitary training offered to women within the movement is “more effective in constructing an alarmist, besieged mentality rather than the self-confident and self-reliant one proclaimed by the Samiti’s discourse of empowerment.”<sup>3</sup> Sehgal focused and based her conclusions on the Rashtra Sevika Samiti, a women’s wing of one particular *Hindutva* organization, the Rashtriya Swayamsevak Sangh. When one examines the situation of women within *Hindutva* over time and across various organizations, however, it appears that they are more empowered by their participation in these organizations than one might imagine. A comprehensive examination of the role of women in the many disparate organizations that come under the saffron banner of *Hindutva* reveals two things. First, the definition of femininity and the role of women within the movement have, far from remaining static, evolved greatly over time. Second, the different roles played by women in different organizations demonstrate that the saffron women come in different hues. Rather than allowing themselves to be defined by any particular

---

<sup>2</sup> Meera Sehgal, “Manufacturing a Feminized Siege Mentality: Hindu Nationalist Paramilitary Camps for Women in India,” *Journal of Contemporary Ethnography* 36 (2007).

<sup>3</sup> Sehgal, *Manufacturing a Feminized Siege Mentality*, 179.

notion of femininity within the movement, women expand the concept of femininity to reflect their various disparate actions and beliefs. By refusing to be limited by a restrictive definition of femininity, women behave as active agents within the movement. Women within *Hindutva* shape the movement as they carve a place for themselves within it. Throughout their participation in the movement, women have conformed to some extent to their organizations' evolving requirements. This paper argues that by making themselves indispensable in this way, *Hindutva* women have carved unique niches for themselves and, on a larger scale, contributed to the empowerment of women in terms of rejecting traditional roles for less restrictive ones.

### **Saffron Beginnings: Early *Hindutva***

The establishment in 1925 of the Rashtriya Swayamsevak Sangh (RSS) marked the crystallization of a movement based on a spirit of Hindu revivalism that can be traced back to the late 1800s. Hindu revivalism is associated with resistance to British Christian missionary activity in the 1800s, Hindu misgivings about Muslim mobilization during the Khilafat Movement in the 1920s, and the desire of upper caste Hindus to perpetuate their worldview.<sup>4</sup> Following the establishment of the RSS by Keshav Baliram Hedgewar, *Hindutva* became an established movement working toward the defined goal of reclaiming India as a Hindu *rashtra*.<sup>5</sup> In the course of this

---

<sup>4</sup> Christophe Jaffrelot, *The Hindu Nationalist Movement in India* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1996), 12-14.

<sup>5</sup> Jaffrelot, *The Hindu Nationalist Movement*, 33.

Saffron, Spice and Everything Nice? 137

endeavor, the RSS established several sister organizations, including the Rashtra Sevika Samiti (Samiti) in 1936, the Vishwa Hindu Parishad (VHP) in 1964, and the Bharatiya Janata Party (BJP) in 1980. The RSS is professedly apolitical and focuses on the central goal of establishing the cultural Hindu *rashtra*, while the VHP focuses on the preservation and propagation of Hinduism as a religion. The BJP, as a national party, is explicitly political, and, therefore, often treads a more religiously and culturally neutral path. The organizations, while structurally similar and considered affiliated, are still separate, each with its own leaders and specific goals. Each has one or more women's wings that are, again, affiliated but in many ways separate. These various organizations are collectively known as the Sangh Parivar.

Even a cursory look at the early years of *Hindutva* reveals a marked emphasis within the movement on masculinity and a concomitant relegation of women to a narrow and limited role. The imagery of nation as motherland is likewise pervasive in early *Hindutva* writings. M.S. Golwalkar, a prominent RSS leader, effusively wrote of India, "This is our sacred land, Bharat, a land whose glories are sung by the gods... well, this is the mother of us all, our glorious motherland."<sup>6</sup> Within this framework, with the nation viewed as mother and female, Hindus, particularly those within the Sangh Parivar, were envisioned as brave masculine soldiers standing ready to do battle for her. Golwalkar's book, which adjures Hindu men to be "men with capital 'M'" (sic) and goes into great detail

---

<sup>6</sup> M.S. Golwalkar, *Bunch of Thoughts* (Bangalore, India: Vikrama Prakashan, 1966), 81.

about how to mould men with a mission, demonstrates the masculinist bias inherent in early *Hindutva*.

The way the RSS was conceptualized and organized reflected this early masculine focus. The fact that it was originally formed as an all male organization, and that women, rather than being integrated directly into the RSS, were brought into the Samiti, a separate wing, meant at the very least a basic gender segregation. The choice of saffron as their banner color was inspired by the flag of the legendary Hindu hero Shivaji, and metonymically to the *sadhus* and *sadhvis*, or religious renunciates, of Hindu tradition, who were always garbed in saffron. The system of *shakhas*, or local groups, which the RSS instituted, and the emphasis on exercise, discipline, physical and strength training reflect the early *Hindutva* masculine focus. Golwalkar considered one of the greatest problems in Hindu society to be the fact that, as he put it, "In dress, in habits, in literature and in every aspect of our day-to-day life 'modernism' has come to mean effeminacy."<sup>7</sup> Golwalkar thus encouraged his followers to reject what he perceived as western modernity, and to embrace traditionalism. Traditional gender roles were key to the kind of traditionalism he advocated, and this required that men within the movement distance themselves from what he perceived as effeminacy in the rest of society. The decidedly masculinist emphasis of early *Hindutva* is reflected in the attempt of men within the Sangh Parivar to carve out a masculine identity while rejecting what they considered feminine.

While the Sangh Parivar was crafting an ideal masculine identity, it was likewise defining femininity.

---

<sup>7</sup> Golwalkar 230.

## Saffron, Spice and Everything Nice? 139

Golwalkar, drawing on the Hindu epic *Ramayana*, states, “When the five Pandavas went to see Kunti, their mother, before the war of Mahabharata, she blessed them saying, ‘Go ye all to battle. This is the occasion for which Kshatriya women give birth to sons’...Let every mother speak in the same heroic strain to her sons even now.”<sup>8</sup> The distinction between women as passive, resigned mothers and men as active, brave warrior sons is clear. The fact that this is one of the sole references in Golwalkar’s book to cultural expectations of women or definitions of femininity underscores the fact that at the time the maternal role was the primary role open to women within *Hindutva*. The other role Golwalkar defined for women was that of devoted, self-sacrificing wife. Moreover, *Hindutva* tended to herd women more towards the private sphere than the public one. Pralay Kanungo notes,

The RSS did not approve of any overt political role for women during the Golwalkar era. It could not swallow the fact that the highest political office in India was held by a woman. The RSS mouthpiece *Organiser* described Indira Gandhi’s rule as disastrous and admirably quoted Napoleon: ‘A statesman has his heart in his brain; a woman’s brain is generally in her heart.’<sup>9</sup>

### **Ram Janmabhoomi: A Turning Point**

While the role of *Hindutva* women has always been to some extent fluid, the *Ram Janmabhoomi* movement

---

<sup>8</sup> Golwalkar 271.

<sup>9</sup> Pralay Kanungo, *RSS’s Tryst with Politics: From Hedgewar to Sudershan* (Delhi: Manohar, 2002), 160.

of the 1980s and 1990s offered women an unprecedented opportunity to break out of the traditional feminine role that had been defined for them within the movement. In the years immediately following the Partition of India, the Sangh Parivar was compelled to moderate its rhetoric for fear of being banned by a fiercely anti-communalist Congress. The bans instituted on the RSS after the assassination of Mohandas Karamchand Gandhi in 1948 and during the State of Emergency declared by Prime Minister Indira Gandhi in 1975 reinforced these fears. In the 1980s, however, two factors came together to result in widespread legitimization of *Hindutva* across India: the weakening of the Congress government's opposition to communalism and the increased militancy of minorities, including the Muslims (who pushed for and brought about the institution of Muslim Personal Law, under which Muslims were subject to *Shariat* rather than a Universal Civil Code) and Sikhs (who were agitating aggressively for the construction of a separate Sikh state).<sup>10</sup> The Sangh Parivar's return to a more hardline stance is reflected in the adoption in 1984 of the issue of reclaiming the *Ram Janmabhoomi* temple in Ayodhya as a central goal for the organizations. The construction of the temple envisioned by the Sangh Parivar would have involved the repossession of a piece of land which was home to a sixteenth-century mosque called the Babri Masjid, which was not being used in the 1980s as a site of worship. The dismantling of the mosque would have been a necessary first step in the construction of the temple. The Sangh Parivar justified this on the basis that the mosque had been built

---

<sup>10</sup> Jaffrelot 331-332.



Saffron, Spice and Everything Nice? 141

by the Mughal conqueror Babar over the ruins of a destroyed Hindu temple.<sup>11</sup>

The *Ram Janmabhoomi* movement was unique in the history of *Hindutva* in the sense that it unified Hindus in the movement in a common, definable and more immediate goal than the more abstract and long-term notion of a Hindu India. While the movement was gaining critical mass, women were able to join the mainstream as active players in the common endeavor. They were able for the first time to participate in various ways, as planners, organizers, and activists. While the roles individual women played were multifaceted, there was a relative homogenization of women's roles within the various organizations under the saffron umbrella. For instance, while Sadhvi Rithambhara, a member of the VHP's Sadhvi Shakti Parishad, had gained significant notoriety as a rouser of communal passions, in line with her organization's relatively hardline philosophy, Uma Bharti, a member of the more political BJP's Mahila Morcha, participated in similar ways. Both Bharti and Rithambhara became prominent symbols of the movement, aggressively calling Hindu men to action. The Babri Masjid was visualized by *Hindutva* activists as a remnant of a time when the nation had been conquered by foreign invaders (the Mughals) and it was thus seen as a blight on India's honor. Given the fact that in *Hindutva* ideology the nation is conceptualized as feminine, the symbolism of women calling on men to defend their own and their country's honor would have resonated significantly with *Hindutva* men. In one instance, Sadhvi Rithambhara declared, "You keep saying that

---

<sup>11</sup> Jaffrelot 363.

you will sacrifice yourselves. But before we sacrifice ourselves we will compel 'others' to sacrifice themselves. We will not only shed our own blood but we will also make the blood of 'others' flow."<sup>12</sup> This newly aggressive stance was a clear departure from the more benign role of resigned wife or mother that had been defined for women in the movement in the early years.

The immediate project of reclaiming the country's honor (as the *Hindutva* leadership perceived it) by removing the stain they viewed the Masjid as being on its landscape, required women, as living symbols of the feminine nation, to become aggressive in their demands that Hindu men defend them. The resigned, self-sacrificing image of passivity that women were earlier asked to project within the movement would hardly have resonated with the men in such a way as to draw them into violence.

Capitalizing on the *Ram Janmabhoomi* movement's needs and requirements, therefore, women within *Hindutva* came out of their virtual *purdah* in droves, taking on newly active roles within the movement. In 1992, a number of *Hindutva* activists broke through barriers and dismantled the Babri Masjid. Thousands of *Hindutva* women participated in the demolition. Women who had previously been adjured to be passive homemakers became proponents of violence. A *Washington Post* article from the time documents women as having "turned their wrath on journalists, beating dozens of reporters and smashing cameras in a rush of violence against the news media unprecedented in

---

<sup>12</sup> Kumkum Sangari, "Consent, Agency and Rhetorics of Incitement," *Economic and Political Weekly* (May 1993), 879.

Saffron, Spice and Everything Nice? 143

this part of the world.”<sup>13</sup> Paradoxically, some of the *Hindutva* women also shielded journalists and photographers from the fury of the mass hysteria. Hundreds of female activists threw themselves on the streets in an attempt to stop police troops from reaching the site at which the demolition was taking place.

The newly varied and militant roles played by women in the *Ram Janmabhoomi* movement brought them into a level of prominence they had never before achieved. As Amy Waldman described it, “After seeing the fervor of women leading up to and culminating with the 1992 destruction of the mosque in Ayodhya, Hindu nationalists also have tried to harness the power of women as militants.”<sup>14</sup> In the years following the incident, women’s organizations within *Hindutva* came to play a more prominent role within the movement, and women themselves came increasingly to the forefront as leaders.

Another outcome of the *Ram Janmabhoomi* incident was a parting, to a certain extent, within the Sangh Parivar between the more explicitly religiously affiliated organizations (the VHP and the RSS, in particular), and the more politically oriented BJP. The days immediately following the demolition of the mosque witnessed large scale riots that left around three thousand people, Hindus as well as Muslims, dead.<sup>15</sup> Horrified at this outbreak of communal violence, many potential supporters began to turn away from the BJP.

---

<sup>13</sup> Molly Moore, “When the Mob Turns Against The Messengers; After Mosque Assault, Hindus Attack Journalists,” *Washington Post Foreign Service* (December 1992).

<sup>14</sup> Amy Waldman, “Win an Election? Tough Part is the Nomination,” *New York Times*, December 5, 2003.

<sup>15</sup> Jaffrelet 460-461.

On December 15<sup>th</sup>, the BJP led governments of Himachal Pradesh, Rajasthan, and Madhya Pradesh were disbanded by the Congress-led national government. V.K. Rai states:

After the destruction of Babri mosque, the BJP leadership began to realise the limitations to religious mobilization. It found that the crowds in election meetings did not respond to the virulent anti-Muslim speech and did not approve of the actual destruction of the mosque or the 'Ekatmata Yatra' (march for unity) of the VHP.<sup>16</sup>

The BJP came to realize that it would have to change its strategy if it wanted to remain relevant in the Indian political context.<sup>17</sup>

### **Saffron Split: Ideological Divergences after 1992**

The BJP began, therefore, to moderate the religiosity of its rhetoric in order to distance itself somewhat from the *Ram Janmabhoomi* issue. In this, it differed from the RSS and VHP, which continued to hold dear the goal of reclaiming the primary Hindu sites of worship on which mosques were based. As a result, there was something of an ideological split between the organizations; thus, a VHP leader states, of the 1993 election, "There were some differences in the high commands of the BJP and the VHP. VHP and RSS are purely Hindu minded and pro-Hindu bodies while the BJP, being a political body, certain Muslims are also

---

<sup>16</sup> V.K. Rai, "In Search of a New Balance: Caste, Region and Community in Uttar Pradesh," *Economic and Political Weekly*, 2406.

<sup>17</sup> Jaffrelot 480.

Saffron, Spice and Everything Nice? 145

members of it, so their perspectives are to some extent different from our outlook" (sic).<sup>18</sup>

The ideological divergence that occurred between the political and religious sister organizations was mirrored in the divergent trajectories of women under the saffron umbrella. While women within the VHP's Durga Vahini and the Samiti continued to adopt relatively provocative and hardline positions, those within the BJP's Mahila Morcha considerably softened their stances and adopted a more secular approach. This contrast is captured when one examines the stances of three women in particular: Sadhvi Rithambara (on the religious side), and Sushma Swaraj and Uma Bharti (on the political side).

Sadhvi Rithambara became the founder and leader of the VHP's ultra militant women's wing, the Vahini, in 1991. Her vision of militant womanhood involved equipping women with a much more intense training in the martial arts. This involved indoctrinating the members to shed all traces of passivity and to be prepared to fight to defend their own and the country's honor. During the *Ram Janmabhoomi* movement, Teesta Setalvad notes, members of the Vahini were given *katars*, sheathed knives, and adjured by Rithambara to defend themselves, if need be, and to "ensure your *katars* taste blood."<sup>19</sup> After 1992, the Vahini remained the most militant of the *Hindutva* women's organizations, and among those most committed to religious and cultural Hinduism. Rithambara

---

<sup>18</sup> Jaffrelot 489.

<sup>19</sup> Teesta Setalvad, "The Woman Shiv Sainik and Her Sister Swayamsevika," in *Women and Right-Wing Movements: Indian Experiences*, eds. Tanika Sarkar and Urvashi Butalia (London: Zed Books Limited, 1995), 235.

herself continued to take a hardline stance after the *Ram Janmabhoomi* incident. While she never again achieved the notoriety she had at that time, she continued to be a prominent ideologue within the Vahini. While the target of her vitriolic attacks in the early 1990s was the Indian Muslims, during the later 1990s, this was also broadened to include the Indian Christian missionaries. Rithambara, along with the VHP's Swami Brahmananda, said in 1999 "that John Paul II could visit India" on the express condition that "he put an end to induced conversions of Hindus to Christianity in India."<sup>20</sup> Rithambara's continued militancy is evident in the fact that she courted arrest on multiple occasions during the course of the 1990s by making inflammatory statements calculated to arouse communal passions among the Hindus.<sup>21</sup> Her continued preoccupation with communal rabble-rousing was very much in line with the goals and commitments of her own organization (The Vahini, and by extension, the VHP). Rithambara was making it increasingly clear that she was not going to recede into the political wilderness once the need of the hour had been met.

While Rithambara, and the Vahini, continued to adopt a martial stance after 1992, the BJP women began to moderate the intensity of their rhetoric considerably. The contrast between the divergent trajectories of the more religious *Hindutva* women and the more political ones is starkly evident when one

---

<sup>20</sup> "VHP Sets Terms for Pope Paul's Visit," *Hindustan Times*, October 22, 1999.

<sup>21</sup> Hindu Nun Calls Mother Teresa 'Magician,' Arrested," *Agence France-Presse*, April 25, 1995.

Saffron, Spice and Everything Nice? 147

considers Uma Bharti, who, like Rithambara, had become a prominent symbol of the *Ram Janmabhoomi* movement. During the latter half of the 1990s, Bharti moved increasingly into the political arena, and concomitantly distanced herself from her earlier belligerent stance. She rarely referred to the *Ram Janmabhoomi* question and even explicitly stated in 1998 that two other previously contested Hindu holy sites, Kashi and Mathura, would not be on her party's political agenda.<sup>22</sup> The softening of her earlier anti-Muslim perspective is showcased in her 1999 statement that she would reach out and offer her assistance to all, including Muslims. She commented at the time, "I have already told them clearly that I will not wear a green dupatta around my neck to please them. Nor have I asked them to wear saffron."<sup>23</sup> Green and saffron representing, respectively, the Muslim and Hindu communities, the statement was evocative of Bharti's desire to reach out to the other community while acknowledging their deep-seated differences. Her newly moderate stance echoed her organization's adoption, after 1992, of a more neutral and mainstream position. Uma Bharti continued to be a leading voice in *Hindutva* discourse throughout the 1990s.

Taking into account the varied stances of the saffron women after the *Ram Janmabhoomi* incident, two things become clear: that women were increasingly able to empower themselves through participation in *Hindutva* organizations, and that through these

---

<sup>22</sup> "Mathura, Kashi Not on BJP's Agenda," *Times of India*, January 9, 1998.

<sup>23</sup> Archana Masih and Vaihayasi Pande Daniel, "When They See Me, Even Chain-Smokers Stub Their Cigarettes," *Times of India*, September 18, 1999.

positions of power, they were able to empower other women, albeit in different ways. Simply by virtue of being prominent, powerful leaders within the movement, women like Rithambara and Bharti would surely have inspired other Hindu women both within and outside the organizations to transcend the limitations of the traditional role that had previously been defined for them. The different perspectives and positions these women brought to the table lent complexity to the movement's definition of femininity. Amrita Basu, speaking of *Hindutva* women leaders, notes that:

None of them is particularly nurturing... Regardless of the personal hardships they may have experienced, they depict themselves as powerful agents rather than passive victims... Moreover, these women's backgrounds and life histories do not conform to a singular model of Indian womanhood.<sup>24</sup>

While, in Golwalkar's time, femininity was defined within *Hindutva* as simple, self-sacrificing passivity, the variety of roles played by Bharti, Rithambara and other leaders of the movement expanded this definition considerably. During the *Ram Janmabhoomi* movement, both Bharti and Rithambara were especially noticed for their incendiary, passionate rhetoric aimed at inciting Hindu men into violence. While Bharti later took on a role of almost diplomatic rapprochement, Rithambara continued to define herself as a militant guardian of Hindu values. In her essay, Basu con-

---

<sup>24</sup> Amrita Basu, "Feminism Inverted: The Gendered Imagery and Real Women of Hindu Nationalism," in *Women and Right-Wing Movements: Indian Experiences*, eds. Tanika Sarkar and Urvashi Butalia (London: Zed Books Limited, 1995), 159.



Saffron, Spice and Everything Nice? 149

cludes that women within *Hindutva* play a more complex role than one might imagine. Bharti and Rithambara's experiences would appear to bear out this assertion.

Apart from inspiring women simply by virtue of their presence as leaders, *Hindutva* women in different organizations empowered women within their own spheres in unique ways. Rithambara, coming from a religious background, drew on established definitions of femininity and transformed the traditional role of mother from one of passivity into one of power. A 1998 *Times of India* article reported that the Sadhvi, speaking at a VHP function, "called upon womenfolk to awaken and put up a brave fight against atrocities on women and unite to face challenges," and "said no politician can solve the problems of society, and it is only a mother who can set right our ills."<sup>25</sup> Rithambara's adjuration to women that they fight to protect themselves and her endorsement, as Vahini leader, of programs to train *Hindutva* women, reflect her view of the feminine as active rather than passive. Although many of the social evils that she listed as threatening to women, including beauty contests (an insult to feminine dignity) and Muslim men (who, she felt, could convert Hindu girls and draw them away from their faith), were rooted in traditional values, the fact that she was encouraging women to use non-passive modes of resistance indicates a departure from Golwalkar's and the earlier *Hindutva* definition of femininity. Her establishment in May 2003 of Vatsalya Gram, which she describes as "a village of maternal

---

<sup>25</sup> "Women Can End Evil In Society, Feels Sadhvi," *Times of India*, October 27, 1998.

love,” in Uttar Pradesh, is another example of her empowering women through transforming traditional values. The village operates as both a widows’ home and an orphanage, and is based on the concept of creating families held together by maternal love through bringing destitute women and motherless children together. While rooted in traditional ideals of the importance of motherhood, the project empowers the women and children it takes in by offering them health care, education, and vocational and spiritual training.<sup>26</sup>

While Rithambara, in line with her allegiance to Vahini ideology, has sought to empower women within the framework of a relatively traditional socio-cultural schema, the BJP women who have attained a level of acceptance within their own organization, have focused their efforts on economic and political parity for women. In the space opened up for women in *Hindutva* in the aftermath of the *Ram Janmabhoomi* movement, another female leader, Sushma Swaraj, came into prominence. Swaraj for the most part exemplified the paradigm of the *Hindutva* woman who throughout her career took on whatever agency the party required of her, while continuing to systematically rise within its ranks. With few exceptions, she maintained a diplomatic stance and established herself within and outside the party as a political figure of repute. However, even Swaraj notably sounded a strident note on occasions when the party was on the offensive, one example being the uncharacteristically

---

<sup>26</sup> Param Shakti Peeth, “The Project,” Vatsalya Gram: A Village of Maternal Love, <http://www.vatsalyagram.org/project.htm>.

Saffron, Spice and Everything Nice? 151

extreme posture she adopted when Sonia Gandhi, the widow of slain Prime Minister Rajiv Gandhi, was projected as an opposition Prime Ministerial candidate by the Congress Party. At the time, as a recent *Express Buzz* article reports, Swaraj “threatened to shave her head and eat only peanuts in a gesture of mourning if Sonia Gandhi became prime minister after the Congress-led coalition won the 2004 parliamentary election.”<sup>27</sup>

By aligning themselves with party policy and making themselves indispensable, leaders such as Bharti and Swaraj rose through the ranks and assumed positions of power. From this standpoint they began increasingly to work for the empowerment of women outside the party. One instance of an almost monolithic consensus of women across party lines was the Women’s Reservation Bill, introduced in September 1996. Women of all major political parties came together to endorse a bill that if passed would ensure that 33 percent of seats in Parliament would be reserved for women. Bharti and Swaraj were vocal and unequivocal proponents of the bill. In November 1996, Swaraj declared, “We have to force the issue. The male mentality and male dominance cannot go on forever... Male-style politics, marked by corruption and inefficiency, must end.”<sup>28</sup> Bharti spoke repeatedly of the need to harness women’s capabilities. In a stunning departure from earlier representations of a woman’s role within *Hindutva*, she stated in 1998,

---

<sup>27</sup> “Sushma Swaraj Not Worried About Daughter Going to Pub,” *Express Buzz*, February 25, 2009.

<sup>28</sup> Abhik Kumar Chandra, “Indian Women Politicians Relaunch Battle of the Sexes,” *Agence France-Presse*, November 19, 1996.

It is claimed that empowering women would ruin the domestic environment; that they would neglect their homes and children. But if a woman's affection is a result of being in bondage, if her love emerges from compulsion, from the fact that she is something of a bonded labourer, then that is not love. That is the love of a bonded labourer. Genuine affection can spring only from economic independence. So give her economic independence.<sup>29</sup>

After the *Ram Janmabhoomi movement*, women were able to use their newfound prominence and power as leaders within the BJP to begin to shape the direction in which *Hindutva* ideology evolved. In becoming vocal proponents of women's political, social and economic equality, BJP women were beginning to transform gender relationships within and outside the movement.

### Conclusions

The trend of *Hindutva* women utilizing their own power to empower others continued and intensified after 2003. A spate of bills introduced by Sushma Swaraj in Parliament in 2006 and 2007 illustrate this. The bills addressed a wide range of issues, including preventing cruelty and sexual harassment against women within and outside the workplace, preventing child prostitution, enforcing basic education for girls, especially among the poor and lower caste, and protecting widows.<sup>30</sup> This continued commitment to

---

<sup>29</sup> Uma Bharati, "Not a Woman's World: Case For OBC Representation," *Times of India*, July 17, 1998.

<sup>30</sup> V.K. Agnihotri, "Rajya Sabha Parliamentary Bulletin Part II, June 12, 2008," Rajya Sabha Bill Office, <http://164.100.24.167/bul1/211/07092007.htm>.

Saffron, Spice and Everything Nice? 153

addressing women's issues demonstrates that for many *Hindutva* women, the empowerment of women, whatever that may mean in their particular (religious or political) spheres, is a priority.

Scholars such as Sikata Banerjee and Paola Bacchetta have argued that *Hindutva* women achieved minimal gains for the feminist cause because despite being empowering for them personally, the movement reinforces sexist stereotypes. Meghana Nayak paraphrases Bacchetta as having said, "These women find ways within Hindu nationalist discourse to become political agents, yet they necessarily 'ensure [sic] their own confinement within the Hindu nationalist order."<sup>31</sup> While it is admittedly true that fundamentalism and sexism continue to play a part in *Hindutva*, it is also significant that the contributions women such as Swaraj, Bharti and Rithambara have made to the cause of women's empowerment have increased exponentially over time. *Hindutva* women tend to come from extremely religious, traditional families, and the organizations themselves reflect the traditional values of their members and leaders.<sup>32</sup> Out of necessity or conviction, the women maintain an outward commitment to traditional Hindu values, but they have altered the ideologies inherent within the movement in subtle though powerful ways. Simply by bringing issues such as women's empowerment through physical training

---

<sup>31</sup> Meghana Nayak, "The Struggle Over Gendered Meanings in India; How Indian Women's Networks, the Hindu Nationalist Hegemonic Project, and Transnational Feminists Address Gender Violence," *Women and Politics* 25 (2003): 84.

<sup>32</sup> Paola Bacchetta, "Militant Hindu Women Reimagine Themselves: Notes on Mechanisms of Expansion/Adjustment," *Journal of Women's History* 10 (1999): 130.

and reservations for women into *Hindutva* discourse, the saffron women have introduced a new focus that was never part of the movement's original ideology. They have also begun to criticize the patriarchal power structures that were part of the very essence of the movement early on.

The argument that *Hindutva* organizations promote sexism in terms of gender binaries, furthermore, holds better for some organizations than others. While religious organizations under the saffron umbrella, motivated as they are by religious concerns, do emphasize traditional values, the BJP as a political party often does not. Even within religious organizations such as the Vahini and Samiti, however, the increased attention paid to women's issues reflects a great stride forward within the religious or traditional sphere.

Although many feminist scholars have offered perceptive critiques of the sexism within *Hindutva* organizations, it is also within the scope of a feminist analysis to recognize the subtle but significant gains women have made. While these organizations are far from being models of gender equality, one need only look at the stark contrast between the *Hindutva* definition of femininity before the *Ram Janmabhoomi* incident and the multiple and varied definitions women leaders have crafted in recent years to realize the extent of the impact women have had and continue to have on the movement. Sifting through these multiple discourses, there emerges the possibility that the very democracy within which both the *Hindutva* and feminist movements have grown and gained vigor will be the ultimate winner. This visible instance of *Hindutva* women discovering ways to empower themselves within an otherwise confining system could

Saffron, Spice and Everything Nice? 155

conceivably serve as a model for other underprivileged groups. In the process, it is reasonable to hope that the moderate and mainstream voices will provide the dominant discourse.

*Deepti Shenoy is a senior at Santa Clara University triple majoring in Religious Studies, Women's and Gender Studies, and History. She is also an Ethics Center Teaching Fellow at the Markkula Center for Applied Ethics. She is particularly interested in issues of gender and feminism within the context of South Asian history and plans to pursue graduate studies in History after graduating in December 2009.*

Department of History  
Santa Clara University  
500 El Camino Real  
Santa Clara, CA 95053-0285  
(408) 554-4527



